

# **Dances with Devils**

## How Apocalyptic and Millennialist Themes Influence Right Wing Scapegoating and Conspiracism

by Chip Berlet  
Senior Analyst  
Political Research Associates

This study originally appeared in the Fall 1998 issue of *The Public Eye* magazine.

Revised 4/16/99

Political Research Associates  
120 Beacon Street, Suite 202  
Somerville, MA 02143  
617.661.9313  
<http://www.publiceye.org>

## Part One:

# The Roots of the Apocalyptic Paradigm

## An Overview of the Dynamics

The approach of the year 2000 has already stimulated widespread discussion of apocalyptic fears and millennialist expectations. Often lost in the discussion is the important *ongoing* role that specific types of apocalyptic and millennialist thinking play in shaping the demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism used by various right-wing political and social movements.<sup>1</sup>

A remarkable number of myths, metaphors, images, symbols, phrases, and icons in Western culture flow from Christian Biblical prophecies about apocalyptic confrontations and millennial transformation.<sup>2</sup> The Bible's Book of Revelation contains warnings that the end of time is foreshadowed by a vast Satanic conspiracy involving high government officials who betray the decent and devout productive citizens, while sinful and subversive tools of the Devil gnaw away at society from below.

In *The Origins of Satan*, author Elaine Pagels points out that today:

"Many religious people who no longer believe in Satan, along with countless others who do not identify with any religious tradition, nevertheless are influenced by this cultural legacy whenever they perceive social and political conflict in terms of the forces of good contending against the forces of evil in the world."<sup>3</sup>

The anticipation of a righteous struggle against evil conspiracies has become a central apocalyptic narrative in our nation's religious, secular, political, and cultural discourse.<sup>4</sup> This is certainly evident in popular culture where films such as "Armageddon" and "Apocalypse

Now" and the TV series "Millennium" name the tradition while mainstreaming the ideas. Films including "Rambo," "Mad Max," "Red Dawn," "Die Hard," "Terminator" and their sequels reinterpret apocalyptic visions while obscuring their origins.<sup>5</sup> The "X-Files" film and its related TV series are quintessential apocalyptic narratives. "Buffy the Vampire Slayer" stomps incarnate evil in a weekly TV series. Prophetic scripture provides the paradigm for sensational scripts. What is entertainment for some, however, is spiritual and political reality for others.

The irrational fear of powerful conspiracies—conspiracism—has flourished episodically throughout US history. Usually it is right-wing groups that have fanned apocalyptic fears of evil conspiracies to create a powerful political weapon. The results can be devastating. There have been crusades against sin; waves of government repression justified by claims of subversive conspiracies; and campaigns to purge alien ideas and persons from our shores.<sup>6</sup> Starting in the 1620s, witch hunts swept New England for a century, and fears of plots by Freemasons or Catholics swept the nation in the 1800s. This century has produced allegations of a Jewish banking cabal behind the Federal Reserve, and the anticommunist witch hunts of the McCarthy Period in the 1950s.<sup>7</sup>

Could it happen again at the end of the 20th century? Holly Sklar, author of *Chaos or Community: Seeking Solutions, Not Scapegoats for Bad Economics*, argues that it might:

"The demonization of immigrants, welfare recipients, people of color, and single mothers is already tolerated to an alarming degree in mainstream political debate. Now as we head toward the millennium, we also face the rising fervor of those driven by visions of culture war and apocalypse."<sup>8</sup>

Contemporary interpretations of apocalyptic millennialism can be sorted into three related and overlapping tendencies that range from sacred to secular: First, in the view of some Christian fundamentalists, we are in the apocalyptic millennial “End Times” or “Last Days” prophesied in Revelation and other books of the Bible; Second, a more generic and often secularized apocalyptic world view of impending crisis is reflected in diverse movements across the political spectrum; Third, there is a generic sense of expectation and renewal, generated merely by the approach of the calendar year 2000, because it is a millennial milestone in human recorded history.<sup>9</sup>

These apocalyptic fears and millennial expectations in turn influence three broad contemporary right-wing movements in the US:

- Activists in various sectors of the Christian Right, ranging from electoral to insurgent, and with varying views regarding whether or not the year 2000 marks the End Times. This includes attempts by Christian hard-liners to purify the society as part of a religious revival, such as the homophobic statements by Trent Lott, and advertisements calling on homosexuals to “cure” themselves by turning to Jesus. The most aggressive activists engage in theologically-motivated acts of violence against abortion providers.
- Right wing populists, including survivalists, gun rights activists, anti-elite conspiracists, and participants in the Patriot & armed militia movements. Conspiracist scapegoating is rampant in this sector. A popular speaker in these circles is Robert K. Spear who believes the formation of armed Christian communities is necessary as we approach the End Times. Preparing to survive the coming apocalypse has led to a survivalist subculture that stores food and conducts self-defense training—a culture that now spans a continuum from religious to secular in right-wing populist groups.
- The far right, including neonazis and persons influenced by far right versions of the Christian Identity religion. Identity beliefs were behind the assassination of Denver talk show host Alan Berg, a spree of armed robberies and murders starting in the 1980s, the tragic shoot-out between federal agents and the Weaver family in Idaho, and—in some reports—the brutal dragging death of a Black man in Jasper, Texas.

In each of these sectors, scapegoating is widespread. Scapegoating always needs to be taken seriously when it becomes tolerated in political and social discourse.<sup>10</sup> But scapegoating that is generated or enhanced by apocalyptic fears has distinctive features and targets.<sup>11</sup> Any group can be framed as doing evil or

being evil, given enough creative energy on the part of the scapegoater, although the actual framing of the allegations will depend on the sector of the right—Christian nationalist, right wing populist, or far right.<sup>12</sup>

The approaching millennium creates an apocalyptic milieu in which demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism could again have serious consequences in our society, especially since rhetoric has already turned to violence. If we are to limit the potential short-term damage, and understand the significance of the long-term dynamic, we need to better understand the thinking of those who live in the shadow of the Apocalypse.

Most people delving into the topic for the first time find the layers of complexity, unfamiliar vocabulary, and competing timelines to be daunting. The effort is nevertheless worthwhile because it helps to explain what often appears to the uninitiated as inexplicable behavior among members of right-wing social and political movements.<sup>13</sup> What do Christian fundamentalists mean when they warn about the “signs of the times?” How did apocalyptic millennialism set the stage for the Oklahoma City bombing? Why do members of ultra-conservative groups such as the John Birch Society and Eagle Forum worry that the UN is trying to create a globalist “One World Government?” What is the “The Mark of the Beast?”

Behind much of the current resurgence of scapegoating and the spread of conspiracy theories about secret elites lies apocalyptic and millennialist themes as old as Satan.

## Apocalypse

The word “revelation” is a translation of the Greek word “*apokalypsis*.”<sup>14</sup> The original Greek term referred to unveiling hidden information or revealing secret knowledge concerning unfolding human events. Thus, the words “apocalypse,” “revelation,” and “prophecy” are closely related. Prophets, by definition, are apocalyptic.

In its more common usage, the word “apocalypse” has come to mean the belief in an approaching confrontation, cataclysmic event, or transformation of epochal proportion, about which a select few have forewarning so they can make appropriate preparations. Those who believe in a coming apocalypse might be optimistic about the outcome of the apocalyptic moment, anticipating a chance for positive transformational change; or they might be pessimistic, anticipating a doomsday; or they might anticipate a period of violence or chaos with an uncertain outcome.<sup>15</sup>

In Christianity, the Apocalypse refers to a gigantic global battle with Satanic forces that signals the end of time. The apocalyptic tradition also exists in Judaism,

Islam, and other religions, and pre-dated Christianity.<sup>16</sup> Apocalypticism can also be found among a few New Age devotees and environmental activists.<sup>17</sup>

## Revelation Interpreted as Apocalyptic Conspiracist Narrative

Christian apocalypticism is based on many sources in the Bible, including the Old Testament books of Daniel and Ezekiel, and the New Testament Gospel of Matthew. The primary Biblical source, however, is the Book of Revelation, the last book of the New Testament.<sup>18</sup> The central narrative of Revelation is that righteous Christians need to know they will be tricked and betrayed by trusted political and religious leaders who are secretly conspiring with Satan. Revelation, the chronicle of an apocalyptic vision, was written about 95 AD, but parts derive from prophetic elements of the book of Daniel and other Old Testament books.<sup>19</sup> The identity of John of Patmos, the author of Revelation, is disputed, but most experts suggest it was not the same John, the disciple of Jesus, who authored the fourth Gospel.<sup>20</sup>

Revelation describes in graphic terms what will happen when an angry God finally intervenes in human affairs at the end of time. The narrative describes the End Times as a period of widespread sinfulness, moral depravity, and crass materialism. The Four Horsemen of the Apocalypse ride in bringing God's wrath in the form of wars, disease, civil strife, and natural disasters. Satan's chief henchman appears in human form as the Antichrist, a popular world leader who secretly harbors sympathy for the Devil. He promises peace and unity of all nations under one world government—but it's a conspiracy. His agents are tracking down and punishing Christians who refuse to abandon their faith. Satan's allies receive a mark—the Mark of the Beast—represented by the number 666.

This period of hard times are called “the Tribulations” and culminate in a final cataclysmic doomsday confrontation of massed armies in the Middle East, at a place named Armageddon. Good triumphs over evil at the battle of Armageddon, ushering in a millennium of Christian rule.

The narrative of Revelation provides important clues for understanding the rhetoric and actions of devout Christians who are influenced by apocalypticism and millennialism. Among Christians, belief in an actual coming apocalypse is particularly strong among those Fundamentalists who not only read the Bible literally, but also consider prophetic Biblical text to be a coded timetable or script revealing the future.<sup>21</sup> Those that believe the apocalypse is at hand can act out those theological beliefs in social, cultural, and political arenas. An example might be when believers view current world events as “signs of the End Times” or see

those with whom they disagree as agents of the Antichrist. Today, apocalyptic themes influence many diverse Christian groups, including those who do not think the End Times are close at hand. Conspiracist appeals also reach a wide secular audience of alienated persons on a cultural and often unconscious level.

## Millennium

Considerable attention has been focused on the fact that the year 2000 marks the turn of a calendar millennium. The word *Millennium* specifically refers to a span of one thousand years. It has come to mean the point at which one period of one thousand years ends and the next begins. For most Christians, the millennial year 2000 will be a time of celebration, reflection, and renewal.

Contemporary Christian Fundamentalists interpret Revelation as a prophetic warning about tumultuous apocalyptic events marking End Times that herald the second coming of Christ. Most also believe that when Christ returns, he will reign for a period of one-thousand years—a millennium. So the turn of the calendar to the year 2000 doesn't *necessarily* have theological significance. Norman Cohn, in *The Pursuit of the Millennium*, chronicles how Christian apocalyptic fervor appears at seemingly random dates throughout Western history.<sup>22</sup> A major US episode of Christian millennialist fervor occurred among the Millerites in the 1840s.<sup>23</sup>

Any date in any calendar system (Judaic or Islamic for example) can be understood as significant given the creativity of those using numerological equations to find justification.<sup>24</sup> But the rotund numerological significance of the year 2000 has spawned millennialist expectations both inside and outside Christianity, with apocalyptic warnings now coming from contemporary Christian, Jewish, Hindu, Buddhist, Muslim, and New Age prophets.<sup>25</sup>

Visit a large bookstore and scan the titles in the religion, prophecy, new age, and occult sections and you will see a cornucopia of books anticipating the year 2000. Surfing the Web reveals a pulsating multimedia cacophony of millennial expectation. The topics range from secular to spiritual and from cataclysmic doom to transcendent rapture in what Michael Barkun has called an “improvisational style” of millennialism and apocalypticism.<sup>26</sup>

For instance, the Heaven's Gate mass suicide in 1997 merged millennial prophetic visions from the Bible, the prophecies of Nostradamus, and the literary *genre* of science fiction.<sup>27</sup> Conspiracist William Cooper weaves an apocalyptic vision out of historic anti-Semitism and modern UFO lore.<sup>28</sup>

## Two Apocalyptic Traditions in Christianity

In *Anti-Apocalypse*, academic Lee Quinby argues that “Apocalypticism in each of its modes fuels discord, breeds anxiety or apathy, and sometimes causes panic,” and that “this process can occur at the individual, community, national, or international level.” What makes apocalypse so compelling,” argues Quinby,” is its promise of future perfection, eternal happiness, and godlike understanding of life, but it is that very will to absolute power and knowledge that produces its compulsions of violence, hatred, and oppression.”<sup>29</sup>

Yet not all contemporary Christian interpretations of the book of Revelation promote apocalyptic demonization. Within Christianity, there are two competing views of how to interpret the apocalyptic themes in the Bible. One view identifies evil with specific persons and groups, seeking to identify those in league with the Devil. This view easily lends itself to demonization. A more positive form of interpreting apocalyptic prophecy is not based on demonization; it is promoted by those Christians who see evil in the will to dominate and oppress. Apocalyptic thinking, in this case, envisions a liberation for the oppressed. The two interpretations represent a deep division within Christianity.

Even some relatively conservative and orthodox Christians look to the prophetic tradition of siding with the poor and oppressed, and these themes can be found in both the New and Old Testaments.<sup>30</sup> This is the tradition of the Social Gospel in Protestantism, and Liberation Theology in Catholicism. It can be found in today’s Sojourners group and the tradition of “prophetic anger” coupled with “evangelical populism.”<sup>31</sup> Social justice activist Daniel Berrigan uses apocalyptic discourse in the Bible as a tool in challenging oppression, corruption, and tyranny.<sup>32</sup> Philosopher René Girard argues that the New Testament can be used to help unravel scapegoating.<sup>33</sup> Author and activist Cornel West identifies himself with a prophetic tradition rooted in African-American Christianity and the struggle for Black civil rights. The Rev. Martin Luther King, Jr. preached from this tradition when he spoke truth to power.

Within mainstream denominations, independent evangelical churches, progressive Christian communities, and followers of liberation theology are many Christians who are painfully aware of those historic periods when some Christian leaders sided with oppression, and used demonization as a tool to protect and extend power and privilege. This discussion seeks to honestly explore the heritage of apocalyptic demonization, or a doomsday version of millennialism, but not to stereotype all Christians as continuing that heritage.<sup>34</sup> In *The Good Book: Reading the Bible with Heart and Mind*, Peter J. Gomes, minister in The

Memorial Church at Harvard University, argues that the Bible must be read carefully to avoid using the text to legitimize “doctrinaire prejudices” in the dominant culture. Gomes suggests Biblical literacy as an antidote to Biblical literalism.<sup>35</sup>

Some of the most vocal critics of apocalyptic demonization and conspiracist scapegoating come from within Christianity. One such critique is Gregory S. Camp’s *Selling Fear: Conspiracy Theories and End-Times Paranoia*, which is impressive both as a historical and theological work. Camp warns of the “very real danger that Christians could pick up some extra spiritual baggage” by credulously embracing conspiracy theories.<sup>36</sup> As early as 1993, Bruce Barron wrote a stinging rebuke of apocalyptic Christian conspiracism in the *Christian Research Journal*, when reviewing Pat Robertson’s 1992 *The New World Order* and Gary H. Kah’s 1991 *En Route to Global Occupation*.<sup>37</sup> Paul T. Coughlin, cautions conservative Christians in *Secrets, Plots & Hidden Agendas: What You Don’t Know About Conspiracy Theories*.<sup>38</sup>

Even skeptics can attempt to be respectful of Christianity as is author Tim Callahan who debunks the idea that the Bible can be used as a crystal ball in the 1997 *Bible Prophecy: Failure or Fulfillment?*<sup>39</sup> The danger comes not from Christianity, but from Christians who combine Biblical literalism, apocalyptic timetables, demonization, and oppressive prejudices.

## From Demonization to Scapegoating to Conspiracism

The poisoned fruit of conspiracist scapegoating is baked into the American apple pie, and the ingredients include destructive versions of apocalyptic fears and millennialist expectations. This is true whether we are studying the sector of the Christian Right that is consciously influenced by Biblical prophecy, or more secularized right-wing movements for which Bible-based apocalypticism and millennialism have faded into unconscious—yet still influential—metaphors. To fully comprehend the subtext of many US right-wing movements, we need to review the interactive dynamics among demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism.

### Demonization

Demonization often begins with marginalization, the process in which targeted individuals or groups are placed outside the circle of wholesome mainstream society through political propaganda and age-old prejudice. The next step is objectification or dehumanization, the process of negatively labeling a person or group of people so they become perceived more as objects than as real people. Dehumanization often is associated with the belief that a particular group of people are inferior or threatening. The final step is

demonization; the person or group is seen as totally malevolent, sinful, and evil. Needless to say, it is easier to rationalize stereotyping, prejudice, discrimination, and even violence against those who are dehumanized or demonized.

Demonization fuels dualism—a form of binary thinking that divides the world into good versus evil with no middle ground tolerated. Dualism allows no acknowledgment of complexity, nuance, or ambiguity in debate, and promotes hostility toward those who suggest coexistence, toleration, pragmatism, compromise, or mediation. James Aho observes that our notions of the enemy “in our everyday life world,” is that the “enemy’s presence in our midst is a pathology of the social organism serious enough to require the most far-reaching remedies: quarantine, political excision, or, to use a particularly revealing expression, liquidation and expulsion.”<sup>40</sup>

## Scapegoating

The ritualized transference of evil onto a demonized “other” and the subsequent expulsion of that “evil” is a familiar theme across centuries and cultures.<sup>41</sup> In western culture the term “scapegoat” can be traced to an early Judaic ritual described in the Book of Leviticus in the Bible.<sup>42</sup> The term scapegoat, however, has evolved to mean “anyone who must bear the responsibility symbolically or concretely for the sins of others,” Richard Landes explains. “Psychologically, the tendency to find scapegoats is a result of the common defense mechanism of denial through projection.”<sup>43</sup>

One cannot, however, take a psychological model and directly apply it to society.<sup>44</sup> As psychiatrist Susan Fisher explains, the mechanism of scapegoating within a family—a well-studied phenomena—does not necessarily work the same way as the scapegoating of groups on a societal level where “the scapegoated group serves more as a metaphor,”<sup>45</sup> Scapegoating by large groups and social movements is not an indication of mass mental dysfunction, even though there may be psychological issues involved, and even though some of the individuals involved may suffer from a variety of psychological problems.<sup>46</sup> Recent research on the subject suggests the phenomena is more complicated than commonly pictured, involving several personality types and multiple psychological processes.<sup>47</sup>

Scapegoating on a societal level can be seen as a process whereby the hostility and aggression of an angry and frustrated group are directed away from a rational explanation of a conflict, and projected onto targets demonized by irrational claims of wrongdoing. As a result, the scapegoated group bears the blame for causing the conflict, while the scapegoaters feel a sense of innocence and increased unity. It is scapegoating whether the conflict is real or imaginary, the grievances

are legitimate or illegitimate, or the target is wholly innocent or partially culpable. Scapegoating can be used as a rationale to justify the retention or acquisition of unfair power and privilege.

Scapegoats are often pointed out by demagogues—leaders willing to use emotionally-manipulative appeals coupled with simplistic and subjective explanations.<sup>48</sup> The arguments that demagogues use to prove the culpability of the scapegoats may seem obviously artificial, but given the unresolved anger and frustration of the persons being mobilized, any attempt at explaining and perhaps resolving the conflict seems better than indifference and inaction. Demagogues often portray the scapegoat as not just culpable but actually evil; demonizing the scapegoat by claiming the scapegoat is involved in a sinister conspiracy that threatens to sabotage the entire society.

## Conspiracism

It is very effective to mobilize mass support against a scapegoated enemy by claiming that the enemy is part of a vast insidious conspiracy against the common good. In conspiracist discourse, the supposed conspirators serve as scapegoats for the actual conflict within the society.<sup>49</sup> The conspiracist worldview sees secret plots by tiny cabals of evildoers as the major motor powering important historical events; makes irrational leaps of logic in analyzing factual evidence in order to “prove” connections; blames social conflicts on demonized scapegoats; and constructs a closed metaphysical worldview that is highly resistant to criticism.<sup>50</sup> Historian David Brion Davis notes that movements to counter the “threat of conspiratorial subversion” have a special status and meaning in the US, “a nation born in revolution and based on the sovereignty of the people.”<sup>51</sup>

By blaming a small group of individuals for vast or horrific crimes, conspiracism serves to divert attention from the institutional locus of power that drives systemic oppression, injustice and exploitation. As explained by Frank P. Mintz:

“Conspiracism serves the needs of diverse political and social groups in America and elsewhere. It identifies elites, blames them for economic and social catastrophes, and assumes that things will be better once popular action can remove them from positions of power.”<sup>52</sup>

Right-wing conspiracist scapegoating not only identifies and blames elites, but also identifies and blames alleged “subversives” and “parasites” from groups that have relatively low social or economic status.

In Western culture, conspiracist narratives are significantly influenced by metaphors from Biblical apocalyptic prophecy. Stephen O’Leary in *Arguing the*

*Apocalypse* contends that the process of demonization is central to all forms of conspiracist thinking.<sup>53</sup> Leonard Zeskind argues it is impossible to analyze the contemporary political right, without understanding the “all-powerful cosmology of diabolical evil.”<sup>54</sup> To Zeskind, conspiracy theories are “essentially theologically constructed views of events. Conspiracy theories are renderings of a metaphysical devil which is trans-historical, omnipotent, and destructive of God’s will on earth. This is true even for conspiracy theories in which there is not an explicit religious target.”<sup>55</sup>

S. L. Gardiner points out that many current “conspiracy theories directed against the government are part of a *rhetorical strategy* genuinely intended to undermine state power and government authority,” but this occurs in a “metaphysical context” in which “those in control are implicated in a Manichean struggle of absolute good against absolute evil. That they are the agents of the devil is proved by the very fact that they control a corrupt system.”<sup>56</sup> The fear of a subversive conspiracy to create a collectivist one world government, however, spans a continuum of beliefs from religious to secular.

Philosopher Herman Sinaiko observes that “The most decent and modest communities have people in their midst who are prone to scapegoating and who see the world as run by conspiracies. A healthy community is organized in a way that controls them and suppresses their tendencies. When a community is in crisis, the standards and control mechanisms are weakened, and these people step forward and find their voice and an audience.”<sup>57</sup>

Mass outbreaks of conspiracism are a distinct narrative form of scapegoating in the political and social arena rather than a mass outbreak of paranoid psychological pathology. There are certainly mentally-unbalanced individuals who promote paranoid-sounding conspiracist theories, however it is simplistic to imagine that these suspicious and often anti-social individuals periodically join together to form large mass movements around shared goals. It is also naive to assume that power elites or government agencies are exclusively populated by clinically paranoid leaders who see subversion behind all social change and, therefore unilaterally activate the repressive agencies of the state. Conspiracist scapegoating certainly involves psychological processes, but it plays an objective role as a useful social and political mechanism in actual power struggles throughout US history. An understanding of that role is essential to explaining its power and effectiveness.

Conspiracism can occur as a characteristic of mass movements, between sectors in an intra-elite power struggle, or as a justification for state agencies to engage in repressive actions. Conspiracist scapegoating

is woven deeply into US culture and the process appears not just on the political right but in center and left constituencies as well.<sup>58</sup> An entrenched network of conspiracy-mongering information outlets spreads dubious stories about public and private figures and institutions, using a variety of corporate and alternative media.<sup>59</sup>

In highlighting conspiracist allegation as a form of scapegoating, it is important to remember the following:

- All conspiracist theories start with a grain of truth, which is then transmogrified through hyperbole and filtered through pre-existing myth and prejudice,
- People who believe conspiracist allegations sometimes act on those irrational beliefs, which has concrete consequences in the real world,
- Conspiracist thinking and scapegoating are symptoms, not causes, of underlying societal frictions, and as such should not be ignored,
- Scapegoating and conspiracist allegations are tools that can be used by cynical leaders to mobilize a mass following,
- Supremacist and fascist organizers use conspiracist theories as a relatively unthreatening entry point in making contact with potential recruits,
- Even when conspiracist theories do not center on Jews, people of color, or other scapegoated groups, they create an environment where racism, anti-Semitism, and other forms of prejudice and oppression can flourish.

## Key Narrative Roots

The Salem witch trials sought to expose witches and their allies as conspiring with the Devil.<sup>60</sup> Modern scholarship has shown that persons accused of being witches were disproportionately women who did not conform to societal expectations, and that there was frequently an economic dimension to the charge, such as a disputed inheritance.<sup>61</sup> This is evidence that demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism—elements of every witch hunt—arrived on our shores with the overwhelmingly Protestant early settlers and their view that Godly persons were in a struggle with a literal Satan. These ideas were influenced by the apocalyptic narrative of Revelation, but were not always linked to a specific widespread period of millennial expectation. They did set the stage, however, for the generalized paradigm of conspiracism in the US, which revolves around narratives of subversion by evil forces doing the work of the Devil.

## Satan, the Devil, and the Antichrist

What Christians conceive as the embodiment of evil has varied over time. According to Robert Fuller, in his book, *Naming the Antichrist*, “During the first three

centuries of Christian thought, the identities of Satan and the Antichrist were frequently intertwined,” but after that, “The Antichrist has generally been understood to be Satan’s chief disciple or agent for deceiving humanity in the final days...”<sup>62</sup>

The idea of the Devil, an incarnate powerful evil demon leading a battle against God, gains prominence in the eight and ninth centuries in Christianity.<sup>63</sup> By the thirteenth century, “the Devil reached the acme of his influence.”<sup>64</sup> Christianity, from the 1100s through the 1500s, experienced a period of militant millennialism, and paid special attention to identifying the Antichrist and his evil followers.<sup>65</sup> By taking a hard line in opposition to the practice of magic and witchcraft during this period, Christian authorities taught followers that some persons in league with the Devil possessed special powers and skills. Alliance with the Devil might be through demonic possession or soul-selling, it might manifest itself as spreading the false religion of the Antichrist, or recalcitrant sinfulness. The response ranged from exorcism, to torture, to execution. With this reading of the relationship between the Devil and certain demonized individuals, the seeds of future witch hunts were sown.

Devil worshipping is a charge that has been leveled against religious reformers, followers of non-Christian religious traditions, non-believers, and dissidents of all stripes. According to Paul Caras in his book *History of the Devil*, “[t]he saddest side of the Devil’s history appears in the persecution of those who were supposed to be adherents of the Devil; namely, sectarians, heretics, and witches.”<sup>66</sup> As Elaine Pagels dryly observes, “Satan has, after all, made a kind of profession out of being the ‘other’.”<sup>67</sup>

Jews were linked by the Christian church to the Antichrist as early as the second century.<sup>68</sup> By the twelfth century Jews are charged with the ritual murder of children, poisoning of wells, desecration of communion bread and wine, and other calumnies.<sup>69</sup> The original Papal inquisition in the thirteenth century was largely directed against dissenters linked to Satanic influence. The charge frequently served an opportunistic purpose. The Christian order of the Knights Templar was accused of “bestial idolatry” by “an avaricious king of France...anxious to deprive them of their wealth.”<sup>70</sup> The later Spanish Inquisition, in the fifteenth century, frequently sought to test the sincerity of converted Jews and Muslims, some of whom were suspected of concealing sinister motives.<sup>71</sup>

The demonization of Jews as magical agents of the powerful Devil gains strength during the sixteenth century Renaissance and the Reformation. During this period, the earlier false allegations about Jews secretly engaging in murder and desecration again became widely believed among Christians.<sup>72</sup> Jews are even

accused of being agents of the Antichrist in a coalition with the Amazons.<sup>73</sup> Martin Luther believed Jews were agents of the Antichrist in what he thought were the approaching End Times, although he also included orthodox Catholics loyal to the Papacy, the Turkish invaders of Europe, and, eventually, just about everyone who disagreed with him.<sup>74</sup>

Conspiracist movements in the US, from the 1800s on, have derived their specific narratives from two historic roots: false allegations about Freemasons and false allegations about Jews.<sup>75</sup> Implicit in both narratives, as they were modified for US consumption, is the theme that America is essentially a Christian nation threatened with subversion by anti-Christian secret elites with allies in high places. The secular version of US conspiracism omits the overtly religious references and simply looks for betrayal by political and religious leaders.

## Freemasons

Masonic lodges and individual Masons in the fraternal societies of Freemasonry were first accused of being the Devil’s disciples in the late 1700s, an idea that flourished in the US in the 1800s.<sup>76</sup> Those who embrace this theory often point to symbols associated with Freemasonry, such as the pyramid and eye on the back of the one dollar bill, as evidence of the conspiracy.<sup>77</sup> The original allegation of a conspiracy within Freemasonry to control the world traces back to British author John Robison who wrote a 1798 book with the lengthy title: *Proofs of a Conspiracy Against All the Religions and Governments of Europe, carried on in the secret meetings of Free Masons, Illuminati, and Reading Societies, collected from good authorities*.<sup>78</sup> Robison influenced French author Abbé Augustin de Barruel, whose first two volumes of his eventual four-volume study, *Memoirs Illustrating the History of Jacobinism*, beat Robison’s book to the printer.<sup>79</sup>

Both Robison and Barruel discuss the attempt by Bavarian intellectual Adam Weishaupt to spread the ideas of the Enlightenment through his secretive society, the Order of the Illuminati, founded in 1775. The rationalist Enlightenment ideas of the Illuminati were, in fact, brought into Masonic lodges, where they played a role in a factional fight against occultist philosophy.<sup>80</sup> Weishaupt, a professor of Canon Law at the University of Ingolstadt in Germany, was banished in 1786 by the government, and the Order of the Illuminati was suppressed.<sup>81</sup>

Weishaupt, his Illuminati society, the Freemasons, and other secret societies are portrayed by Robison and Barruel as bent on despotic world domination through a secret conspiracy using front groups to spread their influence.<sup>82</sup> Barruel claimed the conspirators “had sworn hatred to the altar and the throne, had sworn to

crush the God of the Christians, and utterly to extirpate the Kings of the Earth.”<sup>83</sup> For Barruel the grand plot hinges on how Illuminati “adepts of revolutionary Equality and Liberty had buried themselves in the Lodges of Masonry” where they supposedly caused the French revolution, and then ordered “all the adepts in their public prints to cry up the revolution and its principles.” Soon, every nation had its “apostle of Equality, Liberty, and Sovereignty of the People.”<sup>84</sup> Robison, a professor of Natural Philosophy at the University of Edinburgh in Scotland, argued that the Illuminati evolved out of Freemasonry, and called the Illuminati philosophy “Cosmo-politism.”<sup>85</sup>

These books both promote three conspiracist contentions that are still subscribed to today in some US rightist groups: First, that the Enlightenment themes of equality and liberty are designed to destroy respect for property and the natural social hierarchy; Second, that there is a plan to destroy orthodox Christianity and replace it with universalism, deism...or worse; Third, those with a cosmopolitan outlook, who encourage free-thinking and international cooperation, are disloyal subversive traitors, out to undermine national sovereignty and promote moral anarchy and political tyranny.

These conspiracist themes soon merged with the idea that individual Masons influenced by the Order of the Illuminati were in league with the Devil (as agents of the Antichrist); a claim that quickly became entwined with allegations that Jews were “behind everything.” This web of conspiracy allegations crossed the Atlantic, and during the 1800s produced outbreaks of Protestant suspicion about Freemasons.<sup>86</sup> This was followed by the idea that Catholics were satanic agents of the Antichrist, who allegedly had chosen to make his End Times appearance as the Pope.<sup>87</sup>

### **Jews and the Forged *Protocols***

Jews returned as prime candidates for Satanic collusion after circulation of the forged anti-Semitic propaganda tract, *The Protocols of the Learned Elders of Zion*, the root source in this century of anti-Semitic allegations of a vast Jewish conspiracy.<sup>88</sup>

The *Protocols* grew out of propaganda intrigues within the secret police of Czarist Russia in the late 1800s.<sup>89</sup> The main Russian print source of the *Protocols* first appeared as an appendix in *The Big in the Small, and Antichrist as a Near Political Possibility; Notes of an Orthodox Person* by Sergei A. Nilus, published in 1905 but republished to wider audiences in 1911 and 1917.<sup>90</sup> The *Protocols* itself is inspired by (and plagiarized from) earlier works that allege conspiracies, especially a satiric 1865 French work, *Dialogue in Hell between Machiavelli and Montesquieu*, by Maurice Joly; and a 1868 German novel, *Biarritz*, by Hermann Goedsche.<sup>91</sup> Equally dubious documents claiming proof

of similar secret conspiracies have circulated for centuries.<sup>92</sup>

The text of the *Protocols* purports to be minutes of the secret meetings of a Jewish ruling clique conspiring to take over the world. The *Protocols* incorporate many of the core conspiracist themes outlined in the Robison and Barruel attacks on the Freemasons, and overlay them with anti-Semitic allegations about anti-Czarist movements in Russia. The *Protocols* reflect themes similar to more general critiques of enlightenment liberalism by those supporting church/state oligarchies and other theocratic—and thus anti-democratic—forms of government. The interpretation intended by the publication of the *Protocols* is that if one peels away the layers of the Freemason conspiracy, past the Illuminati, one finds the rotten Jewish core.

According to the *Protocols*, Jews work through Masonic lodges and thus Jews are behind the plan for global conquest. The list of charges in the *Protocols* is long, and includes false claims that Jews: use liberalism to weaken church and state, control the press, work through radicals and revolutionaries, manipulate the economy, especially through banking monopolies and the power of gold, encourage issuing paper currency not tied to the gold standard, promote financial speculation and use of credit, seek to replace traditional educational curriculum to discourage independent thinking, encourage immorality among Christian youth, use intellectuals to confuse people, control “puppet” governments both through secret allies and by blackmailing elected officials, weaken laws through liberal judicial interpretations, and will suspend civil liberties during an emergency, then make the measures permanent.<sup>93</sup>

After the Russian revolution, Czarist loyalists emigrated to countries in Europe and to the US, and brought copies of the *Protocols* claiming they were the plans used by the Judeo-Bolsheviks to seize power.<sup>94</sup> The *Protocols* became a core source of allegations by Hitler and his allies in the German Nazi movement of a Judeo-Masonic-Bolshevik conspiracy. In early 1920 a private English translation was printed in Britain, and that summer London’s *Sunday Post* published a series described by Norman Cohn as “eighteen articles expounding the full myth of the Judeo-Masonic conspiracy, with of course due reference to the *Protocols*.”<sup>95</sup> The newspaper’s correspondent in Russia, Victor Marsden, produced a new English translation of the *Protocols* that is still in print and sold today.<sup>96</sup> The *Protocols* are circulated in the US by anti-Semitic conspiracists across the political spectrum, and are posted on the Internet. Walter Laqueur reports that the *Protocols* are still circulated by contemporary anti-Semitic Russian nationalists.<sup>97</sup>

Many of the anti-Semitic allegations made during this century come from the allegations found in the *Protocols of the Learned Elders of Zion*. These charges continue to circulate today in the anti-Semitic US far right, but if the scapegoated Jew is replaced with the more diffuse target of cosmopolitan globalist liberal secular humanism, many of the same allegations form the core critique of the contemporary US populist right and Christian Right. According to historian Richard Landes, the *Protocols* is “behind much current anti-modern discourse, especially the paranoid and conspiracist texts, which are widespread on the Web.”<sup>98</sup> Given the centuries-old Christian charge linking evil with magical or devious Jews, at least some form of anti-Semitism is intrinsic to most conspiracist thinking in Western cultures, even when it is unconscious.

### Variations on Conspiracist Themes

The charges against the Illuminati group and the Freemasons embodied a backlash against the Enlightenment. Subsequently, the same conspiracist allegations were adapted for use against progressives, Jews, communists, internationalists, and secular humanists. The overall paradigm is apocalyptic demonization, and the range of scapegoats that gets demonized is vast. At the same time, the dynamics are complex, involving distinct social, political, cultural, and religious movement that frequently overlap.

In the US, the Christian fundamentalist movement emerged in the early twentieth century as a backlash against the principles of the enlightenment, modernism, and liberalism.<sup>99</sup> During roughly the same period, the fear of a global subversive communist menace was influenced by Christian apocalyptic millennialism, so much so that Joel Kovel, titled his 1994 book on the subject, *Red Hunting in the Promised Land*.<sup>100</sup> In 1919 the US government launched the Palmer Raids, which rounded up thousands of Russian and Italian immigrants as a response to fears that anarchists and Bolsheviks in this population were subversives conspiring to bring down the US government.<sup>101</sup>

The threat of communism—represented as a Red Menace—became the main focus of apocalyptic conspiracism. According to Frank Donner:

The root anti-subversive impulse was fed by the Menace. Its power strengthened with the passage of time, by the late twenties its influence had become more pervasive and folkish. Bolshevism came to be identified over wide areas of the country by God-fearing Americans as the Antichrist come to do eschatological battle with the children of light. A slightly secularized version, widely-shared in rural and small-town America, postulated a doomsday conflict between decent upright folk and

radicalism—alien, satanic, immorality incarnate.<sup>102</sup>

While political anticommunism took center stage, subplots were woven into the script between the two World Wars. An important synthesis of Illuminati/Freemason and Protocols conspiracism is work of Nesta H. Webster. Her major works are the 1919 *The French Revolution*, the 1921 *World Revolution: The Plot Against Civilization*, and her 1924 *Secret Societies and Subversive Movements*.<sup>103</sup> While Webster stressed non-Jewish secret elites, there are anti-Semitic themes throughout her work. Webster helped write the original *London Morning Post* series which introduced the *Protocols of the Elders of Zion* to a wide British audience.<sup>104</sup>

In 1935 two authors amplified the themes of a conspiracy by international finance. Father Denis Fahey’s *The Mystical Body of Christ in the Modern World*, was an openly antisemitic work envisioning an organically populist (volkish) Catholic society. Gertrude Coogan’s *Money Creators*, contained implicit antisemitic conspiracist allegations linking the Illuminati and the Rothschilds to a secret cabal that created the Federal Reserve.<sup>105</sup> According to Frank P. Mintz, “The Coogan book...served as a classic of rightist populism, enjoying distribution by the Liberty Lobby, Gerald L. K. Smith’s Christian Nationalist Crusade, and the National States Rights Party in the early 1970s.”<sup>106</sup>

In the mid-1930s Elizabeth Dilling transmogrified many of Nesta Webster’s themes and applied them to Roosevelt and the New Deal, portraying communism as Jewish, and Roosevelt as an agent of the conspiracy.<sup>107</sup> Dilling engaged in racist and anti-Semitic red-baiting from the Patriotic Research Bureau in Chicago and penned *The Red Network* and *The Roosevelt Red Record and its Background*.<sup>108</sup> A more overtly anti-Semitic tract was the 1941 *New Dealers in Office*, with an appropriate subtitle “with their Red Front personnel.” The booklet consists of a list of Roosevelt appointees with supposedly Jewish-sounding names. The cover sported the slogan, “Keep America Christian.”<sup>109</sup>

Leo Ribuffo’s study, *The Old Christian Right*, demonstrates the influence of apocalyptic Biblical prophecy on Protestant far right conspiracist movements in the interwar period, especially on the major figures Ribuffo profiles: William Dudley Pelley, Gerald B. Winrod, and Gerald L. K. Smith.<sup>110</sup> It was not difficult for conspiracists and bigots within the conspiracist wing of the Christian fundamentalist anticommunist movement to weave in threads from the conspiracy theories about Freemason and Jewish elites, especially since anti-enlightenment impulses permeate all these conspiracist theories. Pelley is an example of how conspiracist allegations can “pull out all stops,” especially in using anti-Semitism. An example of this

full-blown variation on the demonic Judeo-Bolshevik theme appeared as a chart in Pelley's 1938 publication,

*Liberation:* <sup>111</sup>

### Anti-Christ

Judaism  
 materiality  
 modernism  
 leftist  
 Jewish socialism  
 Jewish communism  
 Protocols of Zion  
 Communist Manifesto  
 democracy  
 Communism  
 internationalism  
 Jewish subversion

### War

After WWII overt anti-Semitism and pro-fascist sentiments were deemed unacceptable by most Christian conservatives, who were quickly re-mobilizing against the Red Menace. The Cold War spawned a number of God-fearing anticommunist groups, some of which still exist, such as: the Freedoms Foundation at Valley Forge, with its combination of free market ideology and religious ecumenism, expressed by its logo of General George Washington kneeling in prayer; the Christian Anti-Communism Crusade, founded by Fred Schwarz, which primarily networked Protestants but includes a handful of Jews; and the Cardinal Mindszenty Foundation, run by Eleanor L. Schlafly, which primarily networks among Catholics.

Conspiracist countersubversion themes are imbedded in the rhetoric of many Christian Right anticommunist groups. They have consistently hinted that international communism was linked to betrayal by secret globalist elites manipulating the US. Frequent targets are the Rockefeller family and the Council on Foreign Relations. <sup>112</sup> A significant work in this genre was the 1952 book by McCarthy supporter, Emanuel M. Josephson, *Rockefeller, 'Internationalist': The Man Who Misrules the World*. Josephson saw the Council on Foreign Relations as a nest of conspirators carrying out Rockefeller orders on behalf of international finance capital. <sup>113</sup> Another typical example is Dan Smoot's 1962 *The Invisible Government*. <sup>114</sup> Similarly, Mary M. Davison's 1962 book, *The Secret Government of the United States*, describes the Council on Foreign Relations as "The King-Makers Club Which Has Become The Nation's Invisible Government." run by the "international bankers." <sup>115</sup>

### Christ

Christianity  
 spirituality  
 fundamentalism  
 rightist  
 individualism  
 constitutionalism  
 U.S. Constitution enforced  
 "Bill of Rights"  
 constitutional republic  
 Americanism  
 National patriotism  
 American vigilantism

### Peace

One of the most significant of the conspiracist books published in the 1960s was Phyllis Schlafly's 1964 book, *A Choice not an Echo*. The book was written to promote the Goldwater presidential bid and characterized the campaign as a revolt of "Grassroots Republicans" against the secret internationalist "kingmakers" alleged to control both the Democratic and Republican parties. <sup>116</sup> *A Choice not an Echo* mainstreamed the conspiracist idea that the shadowy elites behind Wall Street capitalism also propped up Moscow communism.

Carroll Quigley's 1966 *Tragedy and Hope*, saw US history after the Civil War as shaped by a power struggle between international finance capital and industrial capitalism. Quigley saw British influence, especially Rhodes scholarships, as crucial to understanding role of foundations and politicians in shaping US policy. <sup>117</sup> Two authors affiliated with the John Birch Society adapted and extended Quigley's work. Cleon Skousen's *The Naked Capitalist* was self-published in 1970. Gary Allen wrote several books, including *None Dare Call it Conspiracy*, published in 1971, which sold over 5 million copies. <sup>118</sup>

One of the most prolific conspiracists in this genre, from the mid-1960s to the mid-1970s, was Phoebe Courtney, who also co-authored several books with her husband Kent Courtney. The Courtneys' and the John Birch Society helped spread the anti-government concept called "constitutionalism," which embodies the claim that secret elites manipulate the economy and the political process, use the Federal Reserve and the IRS as political weapons, and have created a huge federal bureaucracy, all of which violates basic elements of the original, unamended, US Constitution. <sup>119</sup>

In the 1960s, a great deal of right-wing conspiracist attention focused on the United Nations as the vehicle for creating the One World Government. Mary M. Davison, in her 1966 booklet *The Profound Revolution*, traced the alleged “New World Order” conspiracy to the creation of the Federal Reserve by international bankers, who she claimed later formed the Council on Foreign Relations. At the time the booklet was published, “international bankers” would have been interpreted by many readers as a reference to a postulated “international Jewish banking conspiracy.” Davison included the standard call for the people to rise up against internationalism and rebuild a constitutional form of government—a call echoed later by various right wing populist groups including the contemporary armed militia movement.<sup>120</sup> Davison later wrote tracts that were overtly anti-Semitic and tied to Christian Biblical passages.<sup>121</sup>

The overt British-Jewish conspiracist theory continues to be pursued in many publications, based primarily on tracts “written by British fascists in the 1930’s,” according to Dennis King, who tracked Lyndon LaRouche’s worldview back to this genre.<sup>122</sup> The most energetic purveyor of this theme is Eustace Mullins, antisemitic author of the 1952 book *Mullins on the Federal Reserve* and in 1954 *The Federal Reserve Conspiracy*. Mullins writes in two styles, one ostensibly focusing on banking practices, the other expressing open and vicious anti-Semitism.<sup>123</sup>

Anticommunism became a broad umbrella under which those with a wide variety of views as to “who is really behind the conspiracy” could find common ground. Was the plot run by Moscow Reds, Wall Street Plutocrats, British Bankers, or the Jews? Issues could have multiple subtexts.<sup>124</sup> For instance there was concern over the erosion of national sovereignty by the United Nations because it was seen as favoring communist-style collectivism. Right-wing conspiracists expressed the conviction that the United Nations would erode nation-state sovereignty, and facilitate intrusive federal intervention on the local level. The concern over federal violations of states’ rights was promoted in some cases by libertarians, such as the publishers of the periodical *The Freeman*, but “states’ rights” often provided a veneer that masked underlying segregationist and white supremacist sentiments, even if they were unconscious.<sup>125</sup>

Anti-Jewish allegations could easily be added to anticommunism. In the mid-1950s William G. Carr promoted the anti-Semitic variant on conspiracism with books such as *Pawns in the Game* and *Red Fog over America*. According to Carr, an age-old Jewish Illuminati banking conspiracy used radio-transmitted mind control on behalf of Lucifer to construct a one world government. The secret nexus of the plot was

supposedly the international Bilderberger meetings on banking policy. The anti-Semitic Noontide Press distributed *Pawns in the Game* for many years.<sup>126</sup>

Linking Godless communism to the Antichrist was also an easy step for the more zealous right-wing Christian activists in the 1950s. Typical of this genre is *One World a Red World*, a pamphlet by Kenneth Goff that claims to link Stalin and the “new world-order” to the Antichrist and the Mark of the Beast. Goff warns that: “The dream of the ‘One-Worlders’ may look good on paper but it all adds up to the age-old plan of Satan to produce a Christless Millennial Reign—that man himself can be God.”<sup>127</sup> Goff, a former communist organizer, turned to Christianity and then to white supremacy, writing a 1958 pamphlet claiming biblical support for segregation, *Reds Promote Racial War*, that claimed communists promoted racial strife.<sup>128</sup>

Most Christian anticommunism, however, avoided and eschewed overt anti-Semitism. A view more typical of Christian fundamentalist concern with the Antichrist was expressed by Gordon Lindsay in his 1966 pamphlet, *Will the Antichrist Come Out of Russia?* His introductory blurb states that “All agree that Soviet Russia has the spirit of the antichrist. She is a godless, defiant power which seeks to get control over the whole world.” But he also equivocates: “We demonstrate by 12 separate identifications that Russia is truly related to the Beast system of Revelation 13, although this does not mean that the antichrist will come out of her.”<sup>129</sup> In a similar vein is *The Real Power Behind Communism*, a late 1960s pamphlet in which Dr. W. S. McBirnie warns “We must do all in our power to struggle against the greatest evil of the day, socialism and communism, because they are of the Antichrist.”<sup>130</sup> Claiming that something is “related” to the Antichrist without being more specific is common in this genre.

John A. Stormer, a Republican Party activist and Protestant fundamentalist, wrote *None Dare Call it Treason* in 1964, which sold over 7 million copies. The book alleged a vast communist conspiracy manipulating the government.<sup>131</sup> In 1965 Stormer had a Christian renewal experience and wrote a sequel, *The Death of a Nation*, in which he explicitly linked the collectivist conspiracy to destroy America to the work of the Antichrist and discussed signs of the End Times and possible millennial timetables.<sup>132</sup>

It is important to note that mainstream Protestant denominations and the Catholic Church reject these conspiracist notions. Nonetheless, subcultures among Protestants and Catholics keep conspiracist ideas alive within Christianity just as various non-religious subcultures spread apocalyptic conspiracism in secular society. Today, Christians with a conspiracist interpretation of the Book of Revelation are especially alert to betrayal by political leaders whom they suspect

of promoting collectivism and a tyrannical one-world government.<sup>133</sup>

## Conspiracist Scapegoating and Right-Wing Populism

An effective mechanism for inflaming conspiracist scapegoating throughout US history has been apocalyptic forms of right-wing populism, especially when coupled with millennial expectation.<sup>134</sup> This dynamic has been obscured because right-wing populism was branded by early academic studies as an “extremist” phenomena among a “lunatic fringe” of the “radical right” embracing a “paranoid style.” This idea is a legacy from the first foray into establishing a broad social science outline for studying right wing populism—the pluralist school of analysis which saw right-wing social movements as outbursts of irrational collective behavior fueled by status anxiety. This view is called by critics “centrist/extremist theory.”<sup>135</sup>

### Challenging Centrist/Extremist Theory

Centrist/extremist theory arrived with the 1955 publication of a collection of essays titled *The New American Right* edited by Daniel Bell. Eight years later the collection was expanded and republished under the title, *The Radical Right*. Contributors to the expanded volume included Bell, Alan F. Westin, Richard Hofstadter, Seymour Martin Lipset, Earl Raab, Peter Viereck, Herbert H. Hyman, Talcott Parsons, David Riesman, and Nathan Glazer. Not all of the authors shared all of the analytical views outlined in the volume, but since 1955 a number of books appeared that either elaborated on or paralleled the general themes of centrist/extremist theory first sketched in *The New American Right*.<sup>136</sup>

Centrist/extremist theory, especially as outlined by Lipset, Raab, Viereck, and Bell, sees dissident movements of the left and right as composed of outsiders—politically marginal people who have no connection to the mainstream electoral system or nodes of government or corporate power. Social and economic stress snaps these psychologically-fragile people into a mode of irrational political hysteria, and as they embrace an increasingly paranoid style they make militant and unreasonable demands to defend their social and economic status. Because they are unstable, they can become dangerous and violent. Their extremism places them far outside the legitimate political process, which is located in the center where pluralists conduct civil democratic debates. The solution prescribed by centrist/extremist theory is to marginalize the dissidents as radicals and dangerous religious political extremists. Their grievances and demands need not be taken seriously. Furthermore, law enforcement can then be relied upon to break up any

criminal conspiracies by subversive radicals who threaten the social order.

Centrist/extremist theory ignores real power struggles in the society. It is a *status-quo* oriented frame of reference that too often dismisses dissidents of all stripes. It stifles a healthy public debate over how to unravel systems of oppression, allows individuals to ignore their own complicity in oppressive behavior, and obscures the supremacist forces woven into our society’s central institutions.

An increasing number of progressive social scientists and analysts reject centrist/extremist theory and use a different set of theories to explain how social movements work.<sup>137</sup> As Christian Smith observes:

“The 1970s saw a major break in the social-movement literature with earlier theories—e.g., mass society, collective behavior, status discontent, and relative-deprivation theories—that emphasized the irrational and emotional nature of social movements....There was at the time a decisive pendulum-swing away from these “classical” theories toward the view of social movements as rational, strategically calculating, politically instrumental phenomena.”<sup>138</sup>

Using these new theories, a different paradigm emerges. According to this new paradigm, most people who join right-wing populist movements are not acting out of some personal pathology, but out of anger and desperation. They are demonstrating a willingness to grasp at straws in an attempt to defend hearth and home against the furious winds of economic and social change threatening their way of life. They may feel abandoned, or claim that no one in power seems to be listening. They come to believe that no one cares except others in the same predicament. Their anger and fear are frequently based on objective conditions and conflicts—power struggles involving race, gender, ethnicity, or religion; economic hardship; changes in social status; conflicts over cultural issues; and other societal transformations that cause anger, confusion, and anxiety. Whether or not their grievances are legitimate (or even rational) they join with others to confront what they believe is the cause of their problems. Often, instead of challenging structures and institutions of power, they attack demonized scapegoats, often in the form of conspiracist allegations. Sometimes they resort to violence.

If this characterization of right-wing populism is accurate, then activists developing strategies and tactics to challenge these movements need to rethink the ideas and rhetoric based on the centrist/extremist model that favors labels such as “radical right,” “wing nuts,” “lunatic fringe,” or “religious political extremists.”<sup>139</sup> Racism, sexism, homophobia, and anti-Semitism—along

with other forms of supremacist ideology—are not the exclusive domain of marginal and militant groups, but are domiciled in mainstream US culture and politics.

## Populist Conspiracism

When conspiracism is blended with populism, the result is frequently a worldview called “producerism.” Producerist movements consider the “real” patriotic Americans to be hard-working people in the middle- and working-class who create goods and wealth while fighting against “parasites” at the top and bottom of society who pick their pockets.<sup>140</sup>

Gary Allen provides an example of producerism in his 1971 *None Dare Call it Conspiracy*, which included a graphic chart showing the middle-class being squeezed between the ruling elite “insiders” above, pressured by the Rothschilds, Rockefellers, and Council on Foreign Relations, and the rabble below, pressured by “naive radicals” of the left, such as SDS, the Black Panthers, the Yippies, the Young Socialist Alliance, and Common Cause.<sup>141</sup> In 1974 Allen updated the scenario in *Rockefeller: Campaigning for the New World Order*, articulating the anti-globalist theme of much current conspiracism in the Patriot and armed militia movements.<sup>142</sup> Allen’s work is championed by the John Birch Society.

Producerism not only promotes scapegoating, but also has a history of assuming that a proper citizen is a White male. Historically, groups scapegoated by right-wing populist movements in the US have been immigrants and people of color, especially Blacks. Attention is diverted from inherent white supremacism by using coded language to reframe racism as a concern about specific issues, such as welfare, immigration, tax, or education policies.<sup>143</sup> Non-Christian religions, women, gay men and lesbians, youth, students, reproductive rights activists, and environmentalists also are scapegoated.<sup>144</sup> Sometimes producerism targets those persons who organize on behalf of impoverished and marginalized communities, especially progressive social change activists.<sup>145</sup>

The nativist and Americanist movements emerged as a way to promote a broad Christian nationalism, and a way to enforce implicitly white supremacist northern European cultural standards among increasingly diverse immigrant groups.<sup>146</sup> Producerism played a key role in a shift from the main early mode of right-wing populist conspiracism which defended the *status quo* against a mob of “outsiders,” originally framed as a conspiracy of Freemasons or Jews or aliens. Today, right-wing populist conspiracism targets the government and other “insiders.” According to Michael Billig:

“With the replacement of the old aristocratic orders in Europe and the increasing participation of the middle classes in political life, there came a change in the

themes of the conspiracy mythology. In the United States the change accompanied the threats to the hegemony of the old white Anglo-Saxon Protestant group, posed by waves of new immigrants in the middle of the nineteenth century. The conspiracy theory ceased to defend government against conspirators, but located the conspiracy within government, or more often behind government.”<sup>147</sup>

Two organizations representing the nativist tradition—the John Birch Society and the Liberty Lobby—played a significant role in promoting producerism and helping it transform into populist anti-government conspiracist themes during the 1960s and 1970s.<sup>148</sup>

The John Birch Society (JBS) maintains that internationalist “insiders” with a collectivist agenda, (claimed to be behind both communism and Wall Street capitalism), are engaged in a coordinated drive to destroy national sovereignty and individualism. JBS members are primarily elitist, ultraconservative, and reformist. Its conspiracist theories do not center on scapegoating Jews and Jewish institutions, nor do they center on biological racism. In a more subtle form of racism and anti-Semitism, JBS promotes a culturally-defined WASP ethnocentrism as the true expression of America. Echoing historic producerist themes, implicit racism and anti-Semitism are intrinsic to the group’s ideology, but they are not articulated as principles of unity. JBS conspiracist narrative traces back to Robison’s book alleging a Illuminati Freemason conspiracy. The Society’s roots are in business nationalism, economic libertarianism, anti-communism, Eurocentrism, and Christian fundamentalism.<sup>149</sup>

The Liberty Lobby’s conspiracist narrative is that the secret elites are Jews (descended from non-European bloodlines) who manipulate Blacks and other people of color to destroy national unity and popular will, which derives its strength from a racially-separate organic tribalism. The Lobby is primarily populist, fascist, and insurgent. It promotes conspiracist theories that center on scapegoating Jews and Jewish institutions, and on biological racism as the basis for white supremacist xenophobia. However, through the use of coded rhetoric, and appeals to racial separatism that extol Black nationalist groups, the group attempts, with some success, to mask its core racism and anti-Semitism. The Liberty Lobby relies on historic anti-Semitic conspiracist sources that trace back to the *Protocols* and its many progeny. Its roots are in isolationism, small business resentment of large corporate interests, and eugenicist White racial nationalism.

The JBS and Liberty Lobby both use populist rhetoric, but JBS members distrust the idea of the sovereignty of the people, and stress that the United

States is a republic not a democracy, which they dismiss as a “mobocracy.” This explains how the JBS can criticize the alleged secret elites, yet retain an elitist point of view; they want to replace the “bad” elites with the “good” elites—presumably their allies. Both groups use conspiracist scapegoating, a common feature of right-wing populism. Starting in the 1970s, other branches of right-wing populist conspiracism began to grow, in the Christian Right, the Christian Identity religion, the Lyndon LaRouche network, and in both secular and religious forms of survivalism.

Populism can come from the bottom up, but it also can be deployed from the top down—used to attack the *status quo* by outsider business factions seeking to displace entrenched power structures. These outsider factions use populist rhetoric and conspiracist, anti-elite scapegoating to attract constituencies in the middle class and working class. As right-wing populist movements grow, they can lure mainstream politicians to adopt scapegoating, in order to attract voters. Their theories can legitimize acts of discrimination, or even violence. And reformist populist movements can open the door for insurgent right-wing movements such as fascism to recruit from their own movements by arguing that more drastic action is needed.<sup>150</sup> Fascism itself is a distinctive form of conspiracist right-wing populism. Fascist groups are not likely to seize state power in the US (or in most countries), but can seriously damage attempts to extend democracy and equality as they encourage scapegoating and conspiracism in adaptive and creative ways while engaging in recruitment and ideological training.<sup>151</sup>

Because right-wing conspiracism so often rests on an anti-elite critique, it has been known to fool gullible leftists.<sup>152</sup> Various Green Party activists have had to struggle against conspiracism, including the anti-Semitic variant, among members and even a handful of leaders.<sup>153</sup> Populist conspiracism also has found a home in certain Black nationalist and Arab anti-imperialist groups.<sup>154</sup> Libyan President Muammar Qaddafi has actually tried to unite left and right groups that oppose the US government at meetings in Tripoli, Libya.<sup>155</sup>

We must be careful to draw a distinction between critiques that extend economic and social justice, and those that claim economic privilege for middle-class consumers at the expense of social justice. Anti-regime criticism is rampant in the conspiracist right.<sup>156</sup> There is a need to educate and thus inoculate large sectors of the white middle class and working class against the dead end of right-wing populism with its penchant for scapegoating. If we tolerate the paradigm of conspiracist scapegoating by right-wing economic populists simply because it appears to advance a short-term anti-corporate or anti-government agenda, we are creating a dangerous alliance with people whose long-term vision—wittingly or unwittingly—promotes racist, sexist, homophobic, and anti-Semitic outcomes.<sup>157</sup> We will be throwing our long-term allies overboard and helping sink the ship of state, when we should be plotting a new course on a sturdy vessel we all help to rebuild.

This is especially true given the current period of apocalyptic anxiety and millennial energy, which infuses the Christian right, populist right, and far right.

Part Two:

## Apocalyptic Millennialism and Contemporary US Right–Wing Movements

### Examining the Different Sectors

As the millennium approaches, targets of apocalyptic demonization already include Jews, Catholics, Mormons, Moslems, Freemasons, New Age devotees, peace activists, environmentalists, feminists, abortion providers, and gay men and lesbians. Members of groups ranging from the Trilateral Commission to the National Education Association are suspect—not to mention federal officials and UN troops. The person targeted as the devil’s disciple could be you, or a neighbor, or a friend.

Apocalyptic fears and millennial expectation play an important role in three sectors of right–wing populism in which demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism flourish: the Christian Right; the populist right, including survivalist, Patriot, and armed militia movements; and the far right, especially the neonazi version of Christian Identity theology.

### The Christian Right

The New Right coalition of the late 1970s “represented a reassertion of the ‘fusionist’ triad of moral traditionalism, economic libertarianism, and militarist anticommunism,” explained sociologist Sara Diamond.<sup>158</sup> It was a coalition between secular conservatives and traditionalist Christians. Much of the New Right’s mobilization of supporters was based on promoting a narrow, exclusionary, and northern European version of traditional Biblical values.<sup>159</sup> As Laura Saponara puts it:

“The ‘deep structure’ of New Right rhetoric is rooted in historic and contemporary constructs of Biblical literalism articulated through recurring, polarizing themes of

good and evil, personal salvation, evangelism, and the inevitability of apocalypse, among others.”<sup>160</sup>

Clearly, some of the Christians mobilized by the New Right felt, and still feel, they are engaged in “Spiritual Warfare” with Satanic forces.<sup>161</sup> The role of Biblical apocalyptic thinking within mainstream Christian groups is well–documented by academics such as Sara Diamond, Paul Boyer, Robert Fuller, and Charles B. Strozier.

Open discussion of evil and Satanic forces is unremarkable within the Christian Right, even among savvy policy analysts and lobbyists. A 1983 booklet from the Free Congress Research and Education Foundation titled *The Morality of Political Action: Biblical Foundations* includes a Bible–based defense of the practice of Christian political activists misleading or tricking opponents as justified by the higher purpose of the Christian struggle against evil. The author advises that while opponents may be doing the work of the Devil, it would be wrong to publicly accuse them of being “a card–carrying member of Satan’s band,” not because it might be untrue, but because it falls under “the scope of the Lord’s command: ‘Judge not lest ye be judged.’”<sup>162</sup>

Still, it must be remembered that some politically–conservative fundamentalist groups oppose this paradigm, and warn against demonization that conflates church and state. For example, the Institute for the Study of Religion in Politics argues that:

“...if the price of re–establishing a ‘public Christian culture’ in this country means that the church must ostracize its opponents, ghettoize the adherents of other religions and cultures, make enemies of women

who choose abortion, demonize homosexuals, etc. as it seeks to gather political power into its hands—maybe, just maybe, the price isn't worth paying.”<sup>163</sup>

## Dueling Eschatologies

Within Christianity there are many competing views regarding the millennial apocalypse; the theological study of these views is known as *eschatology*. At the center of eschatological study is a debate over theological theories of the “end time,” when the forces of evil will be vanquished and the forces of good rewarded.<sup>164</sup>

Post-millennialists believe that Christ returns only after a thousand years of reign and rule by Godly Christian men, and they urge militant Christian intervention in secular society. Smaller sectors, including preterists and a-millennialists, while still anticipating the eventual return of Christ, believe the prophesied millennium is not a major theological issue for Christianity, or believe it already has happened, thus de-emphasizing the Tribulations, the Rapture, and Armageddon as practical considerations affecting daily life.

Most Christian fundamentalists are pre-millennialists, believing the return of Christ starts the millennial, thousand-year period of Christian rule. For them, the year 2000 doesn't necessarily have theological meaning or signify the End Times. More important to them is the belief in an inevitable and final apocalyptic battle between good and evil. Pre-millennialists believe the second coming of Jesus will occur before his thousand years of reign and rule.

For pre-millennialists, faithful Christians may experience no tribulations, some tribulations, or all of the tribulations. This difference is expressed in eschatological timelines called pre-tribulationist, mid-tribulationist, and post-tribulationist. Furthermore, not all pre-millennialist Christians believe in “the Rapture”—the temporary protective gathering of Christians up into Heaven while the battle against evil rages on Earth during the Tribulations. If they do believe in the Rapture, there is no agreement on whether or not raptured Christians then return to an earth purged of evil. The exact sequence of the Rapture, the Tribulations, and the battle of Armageddon is also disputed.

For many decades, the primary Protestant eschatology was a form of pre-millennialism called Dispensationalism, an interpretation developed by theologian John Nelson Darby that outlined specific historical epochs or dispensations that are pre-ordained by God.<sup>165</sup> In this timeline, Christians are raptured up to heaven before the Tribulations, the sinful are punished, and then Christ returns for a millennium of rule over his loyal flock. This combination of pre-tribulationist and

pre-millennialist views has sometimes encouraged a large sector of the Christian faithful to passively await salvation while remaining aloof from sinful secular society, while at other times an activist mode seeks to intervene in public affairs.

For example, aloof pre-millennialist Dispensationalism gained renewed support after the Pyrrhic victory for Christian fundamentalists in the 1925 Scopes “Monkey” Trial. This famous Tennessee case ruled that teaching evolution (instead of creation) was not proper in the public schools, but the case proved a substantial public embarrassment to fundamentalists who were widely portrayed as ignorant, backward, and irrational.<sup>166</sup> As a result, many fundamentalists retreated from active participation in the electoral and legislative arena. This lasted until an activist Cold War message that Christians should re-engage in civic participation, encouraged by evangelical groups such as Moral Re-armament and evangelists such as Billy Graham, brought many Christians back into the voting booths in the 1950s. It wasn't until the mid-1970s that evangelicals began to mobilize around partisan political issues in a way that directly linked their theology to the electoral sphere.<sup>167</sup>

While many previously passive sectors of Christianity were being mobilized by conservative political organizers, a complementary theological movement influenced by popular Christian philosopher Francis A. Schaeffer and theologian Cornelius van Till, called for a more “muscular” and interventionist form of Christianity. The most zealous version of this renewal movement was called Reconstructionism, a post-millennial theology which argues that the US Constitution is merely a codicil to Christian Biblical law.<sup>168</sup> Rooted in militant early Calvinism and the idea of America as a Christian redeemer nation, Reconstructionism sees religion, culture, and nation as an integral unit in a way that echoes some European clerical fascist movements of the 1930s.

Among the leading Reconstructionist ideologues are R. J. Rushdoony, Gary North, and Greg Bahnsen. There are few Reconstructionists, but they have facilitated the emergence of a more widespread and softer form of dominionism, the theocratic idea that regardless of religious views or eschatological timetable, Christian men are called by God to exercise dominion over secular society by taking control of political and cultural institutions.<sup>169</sup> The result is a broad dominionist movement of Christian nationalism that has spread from independent evangelical churches into mainstream Protestant denominations and even small sectors of Catholicism.

## From Red Menace to New World Order

Apocalyptic millennialism provides a basic narrative within the US political right, claiming that the idealized society is thwarted by subversive conspiracies.<sup>170</sup> During the 1980s and 1990s, the main demonized scapegoat of the US hard right shifted seamlessly from the communist Red Menace to international terrorists, sinful abortion providers, anti-family feminists, homosexual “special rights” activists, “pagan” environmentalists, liberal secular humanists and their “big government” allies, and globalists who plot on behalf of the New World Order. The relatively painless nature of the shift was due in part to the basic underlying apocalyptic paradigm, which fed the Cold War and the witch-hunts of the McCarthy period.<sup>171</sup> To understand this dynamic requires stepping back a few paces to the roots of fundamentalist belief.

One of the core ideas of the fundamentalist Christian Right during this century has been that modern liberalism is a handmaiden for collectivist, Godless communism. Many conservative Christian anticommunists believe that collectivism is Godless, while capitalism is Godly. They often link liberalism to Godless collectivism; then to the notion of a liberal secular humanist conspiracy; and finally conclude that globalism is the ultimate collectivist plot. Prior to the collapse of communism, many leaders of the new Christian Right had already embraced a variation on their long-standing fear of secret elites in league with Satan: the secular humanist conspiracist theory.<sup>172</sup> According to George Marsden, the shift in focus to the secular humanist demon:

“...revitalized fundamentalist conspiracy theory. Fundamentalists always had been alarmed at moral decline within America but often had been vague as to whom, other than the Devil, to blame. The “secular humanist” thesis gave this central concern a clearer focus that was more plausible and of wider appeal than the old mono-causal communist-conspiracy accounts. Communism and socialism could, of course, be fit right into the humanist picture; but so could all the moral and legal changes at home without implausible scenarios of Russian agents infiltrating American schools, government, reform movements, and mainline churches.”<sup>173</sup>

A number of contemporary Christian Right ideologues promote the secular humanist conspiracist theory, including: Pat Robertson, founder of the Christian Coalition; Beverly LaHaye, leader of Concerned Women for America; her husband, the Rev. Timothy LaHaye, a well-known Christian author; and Dr. James Dobson, founding President of Focus on the

Family, whose syndicated radio program is on thousands of stations.

The shift in focus from anti-communism to the claim that secular humanism now plays the key subversive role in undermining America is reflected in right-wing author John Stormer’s two books, the second an update for the 1990s of his influential 1964 book *None Dare Call it Treason*.<sup>174</sup> Similarly, some militant Protestant fundamentalists within the antiabortion movement, influenced by hard right theological activist Francis A. Schaeffer, claim a conspiracy of secular humanists as the source of Godless disregard for what they argued is sinful murder of the unborn.<sup>175</sup> In 1991 David A. Noebel of Summit Ministries, an ultra-conservative Christian training center located outside Colorado Springs, Colorado wrote the 900 page *Understanding the Times* textbook used in 850 Christian schools enrolling a total of over 15,000 students.<sup>176</sup> The book argues that secular humanism has replaced communism as the major anti-Christian philosophy.<sup>177</sup>

Secular humanists—pictured as the torchbearers of liberal Godlessness and New Deal statism—are scapegoated from a variety of perspectives: economic, anti-elitist, and moral, as well as religious. The idea of the secular humanist conspiracy also parallels and buttresses the resurgent libertarian theme that collectivism destroys individual initiative and saps the vigor of the free market system. It also echoes the concerns of conservatives, neoconservatives, and paleoconservatives over creeping moral decay and the failure of New Deal liberalism. This congruence of various sectors of the right, each opposing liberal secular humanism for its own reasons, has resulted in some remarkable tactical coalitions following the rise of the New Right in the late 1970s, especially around issues of public school curricula and government funding for education.

For many conspiracy-minded Christians, communism was but one manifestation of Satan’s age-old, one-world conspiracy. They argue that if the ultimate villainous agent of control is Satan, the ideologies promoted by demonic agents can easily shift from Godless communism to secular humanism, and from global communism to a new world order. The collapse of communism in Europe allowed a shift in focus to other aspects of the alleged conspiracy—the collectivism and statism promoted by liberalism and secular humanism. As mentioned earlier, more secular hard right groups had long contended that behind Moscow Bolshevism and Wall Street capitalism were the same shadowy secret elites with their traitorous allies in Washington. Removing Soviet communists from the alleged secret team still leaves other dangerous players in the field.

Conspiracism in the Christian Right often is overlooked by the mainstream media, despite the prominence of those who promote it. Prior to the 1998 elections, Dr. James Dobson led a well-publicized campaign to pull the Republican Party into alignment with Christian Right moral principles. Dobson and his colleague Gary Bauer co-authored *Children at Risk: The Battle for the Hearts and Minds of Our Kids*, which sees an escalating civil war with the forces of Godless secular humanism. Dobson praises Noebel's Summit Ministries, especially its youth training seminars and its high school curriculum that immerse students in apocalyptic conspiracist theories about the secular humanist menace.<sup>178</sup>

Dobson's endorsement of Summit is significant because it illustrates how some of the more doctrinaire leaders of the Christian Right are comfortable with Old Right conspiracism. Among Noebel's previous works are *Communism, Hypnotism and the Beatles*, and *The Homosexual Revolution: End Time Abomination*. Summit Ministries has a longstanding relationship with the conspiracist John Birch Society, placing large ads in the John Birch Society's publications over many years. In at least one instance, in 1983, Summit Ministries appears to have served as a conduit for tax-exempt donations for the JBS.<sup>179</sup> Noebel recently absorbed the newsletter of Fred Schwarz' hard right Christian Anti-Communism Crusade.

Even when not directly tied to diabolical schemes, conspiracism is widespread in the Protestant Christian Right. Pat Robertson's *The New World Order* is littered with conspiracist allegations and references, including his invocation of the Freemason conspiracy "revealed in the great seal adopted at the founding of the United States." Robertson links Freemasonry to End Times predictions of a "mystery religion designed to replace the old Christian world order of Europe and America"<sup>180</sup> Later in the book he says:

In earlier chapters, we have traced the infiltration of Continental Freemasonry by the new world philosophy of the order of the Illuminati, and its subsequent role in the French revolution. We then were able to find clear documentation that the occultic-oriented secret societies claiming descent from Illuminism and the French Revolution played a seminal role in the thinking of Marx and Lenin.<sup>181</sup>

As Michael Lind and Jacob Heilbrunn have pointed out in a critique of the book published in *The New York Review of Books*, Robertson moves beyond the Illuminati/Freemason conspiracy and incorporates allegations that originate in anti-Semitic sources.<sup>182</sup>

## Anticipating the End Times

While most mainstream Christian religious leaders are reluctant to suggest the year 2000 marks the End Times, some are hinting that the date has theological significance, and a few have announced that the End Times have already started.<sup>183</sup> There is even a glossy full-color monthly magazine titled *Midnight Call: The Prophetic Voice for the Endtimes*. One Christian publishing house offers a catalog, "Armageddon Books." Its 1998 Internet version describes itself as the "World's largest Bible prophecy bookstore featuring books, videos, and charts on armageddon, antichrist, 666, tribulation, rapture, revelation." There are over 400 items. Credit cards are accepted. There are links to 160 other prophecy websites.<sup>184</sup>

Many Christian fundamentalists are scanning for the "Signs of the Times," a phrase used to highlight the possibility that a specific worldly event may fulfill a Biblical prophecy and thus be a signal of the End Times, when faithful Christians are expected to engage in appropriate (though highly contested) preparations. Earthquakes, floods, comets, wars, disease, and social unrest are commonly interpreted as such signs.

The demonic interpretation of apocalyptic Biblical prophecy, such as found in the Book of Revelation, has long encouraged conscious and unconscious fears about evil subversive conspiracies. Apocalyptic fundamentalists are thus especially concerned with false prophets and political or business leaders who are subverting God's will and betraying the faithful by urging them to abandon their righteous conduct, especially in terms of sinful sexuality or crass materialism. Many faithful Christians believe they must take on special duties during the End Times. These duties carry the weight of Biblical prophecy, and in some cases, actions may even be felt to be mandated by God. Revelation's prophecies can thus motivate action, especially on the part of those fundamentalists who combine Biblical literalism with a textual timetable.<sup>185</sup> When this worldview intersects with oppressive prejudices, it is easy to prophesy the appearance of demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism.

Author Hal Lindsey re-ignited Protestant apocalyptic speculation in 1970 with his book, *The Late Great Planet Earth*, which sold 10 million copies.<sup>186</sup> Lindsey argued that the End Times had arrived and that Christians should watch for the signs of the times.<sup>187</sup> Billy Graham again raised expectations in his 1983 book, *Approaching Hoofbeats: The Four Horsemen of the Apocalypse*, where he observed that Jesus Christ, "The Man on the white horse... will come when man has sunk to his lowest most perilous point in history." Graham then discussed how bad things were in the world.<sup>188</sup>

Paul Boyer argues that Christian apocalypticism must be factored into both Cold War and post Cold War political equations. He notes that the 1974 prophecy book, *Armageddon, Oil, and the Middle East Crisis* sold three-quarters of a million copies.<sup>189</sup> The mainstreaming of apocalypticism received a major boost when, in 1983, Ronald Reagan cited scriptural authority to demonize the Soviet Union as an “evil empire.”<sup>190</sup> Grace Halsell wrote in her book, *Prophecy and Politics: Militant Evangelists on the Road to Nuclear War*, of how some evangelists, including Pat Robertson, Jerry Falwell, and Hal Lindsey, hinted that use of atomic weapons was inevitable as part of the final battle of Armageddon.<sup>191</sup>

Halsell’s book, and a monograph by Ruth W. Mouly, *The Religious Right and Israel: The Politics of Armageddon*, argued that one reason certain sectors of the Christian Right mobilized tremendous support for the State of Israel during the Reagan Administration, was in part because they believed Jews had to return to Israel before the millennialist prophecies of Revelation could be fulfilled.<sup>192</sup>

Prophecy belief is widespread in the US. Philip Lamy reports that during the Gulf War, 14 percent of one CNN national poll thought it was the beginning of Armageddon, and “American bookstores were experiencing a run on books about prophecy and the end of the world.”<sup>193</sup> In 1993 a *Times/CNN* national poll found that 20 percent of those polled thought the second coming of Christ would occur near the year 2000.<sup>194</sup>

The process of prophecy belief triggering apocalyptic demonization and then leading to searches for the Devil’s partners is continuously updated. Paul Boyer points out that those seen as the prophesied agents of Satan girding for End Times battle can be foreign or domestic or both. He notes how in prophetic literature the identity of Satan’s allies in the Battle of Armageddon has shifted seamlessly over time, circumstance, and political interest from the Soviet Union to Chinese communists, to Islamic militants; and warns of an increasing level of anti-Muslim bigotry in some contemporary apocalyptic subcultures.<sup>195</sup>

Robert Fuller has looked at the range of current targets:

“Today, fundamentalist Christian writers see the Antichrist in such enemies as the Muslim world, feminism, rock music, and secular humanism. The threat of the Antichrist’s imminent takeover of the world’s economy has been traced to the formation of the European Economic Community, the Susan B. Anthony dollar...and the introduction of universal product codes.”<sup>196</sup>

Visions of the Satanic Antichrist are common in relatively mainstream sectors of the new Christian

Right. Typical of the current apocalyptic genre is a recent mailing from Prophetic Vision, a small international Christian evangelical outreach ministry, reporting that “prophecy is moving so fast” and “the Return of Christ is imminent.” The mailing goes on to declare that the Antichrist, “Must be alive today waiting to take control!” and then solicits funds for the “end time harvest.”

Rev. Pat Robertson frequently ties his conspiracist vision to apocalyptic hints that we are in the millennial “End Times,” and End Times themes have repeatedly appeared on his “700 Club” television program. On one July 1998 program Robertson hinted that a tsunami in New Guinea coupled with the appearance of asteroids might be linked to Bible prophecy. Just after Christmas, 1994, the program carried a feature on new dollar bill designs being discussed to combat counterfeiting. The newscaster then cited Revelations 13 and suggested that if the Treasury Department put new codes on paper money, it might be the Antichrist’s Mark of the Beast, predicted as a sign of the coming End Times.<sup>197</sup>

Christians are also debating the importance of the “Y2K” bug, the technical programming problem that crashes some computer software when it tries to interpret the year 2000 using earlier computer code written to recognize only the numbers 0–99 for calendar-based calculations. As in secular circles, responses range from cautious preparations to doomsday scenarios that have led some to establish rural survivalist retreats.<sup>198</sup> At the 1998 Christian Coalition’s annual Road to Victory conference, a workshop was devoted to announcing a plan to mobilize churches to provide food, water, shelter, and medical supplies in case the Y2K bug caused widespread societal problems.<sup>199</sup> This mobilization was justified by arguing the anticipation of resulting disruptions was appropriate no matter what the eschatological viewpoint; and that if there was no serious disruption, the supplies could aid the poor. This equation neatly sidestepped the issue of the End Times, while allowing those who believe we are in the End Times to work cooperatively with those who do not.

Christian Reconstructionist author Gary North is now a much-quoted expert on the Y2K bug. He sees much chaos created by Y2K, but dismisses the link to Christ’s imminent return.<sup>200</sup> Some post-millennialists are more in line with the suspicious view expressed in the John Birch Society magazine, *New American*: “Much like the Reichstag fire, could the Millennium Bug provide an ambitious President with an opportunity to seize dictatorial powers?”<sup>201</sup>

Most Christians, even those who think the End Times are imminent, do not automatically succumb to demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracist thinking. Yet in the escalating surge of millennial titles, a scary

number name the agents of the Antichrist or claim to expose the evil End Times conspiracy: Examples include: *Global Peace and the Rise of Antichrist*; *One World Under Antichrist: Globalism, Seducing Spirits and Secrets of the New World Order*; *Foreshocks of Antichrist*; *How Democracy Will Elect the Antichrist*; *The Ultimate Denial of Freedom, Liberty and Justice According to the Bible*.<sup>202</sup>

Gender issues play an important role in apocalyptic millennialism. In describing the symbolism in Revelation, one contemporary Catholic commentary cautions against negative stereotyping of women.<sup>203</sup> This is a needed caution, because anti-feminist, misogynist and homophobic interpretations of Revelation are widespread. A 1978 brochure with an apocalyptic subtext from Texas Eagle Forum was titled: *Christian Be Watchful: Hidden Dangers in the New Coalition of Feminism, Humanism, Socialism, Lesbianism*.<sup>204</sup> As Lee Quinby has noted, while it is difficult to predict the outcomes of millennial moments, the current manifestation is unlikely to be good for women.<sup>205</sup>

A good example is the Christian evangelical men's movement, Promise Keepers, which has scheduled "Vision 2000" rallies at "key population centers and state capitols around the United States," for January 1, 2000.<sup>206</sup> At the massive Promise Keepers rally of Christian men on the Washington Mall in October 1997, questions about the approaching End Times elicited eager responses.<sup>207</sup>

While the Promise Keepers is driven in part by millennial expectation, it is also a response to the need for men to find a coherent identity in modern culture that responds in some creative way to the issues raised by the civil rights and feminist movements.<sup>208</sup> Nonetheless, when push comes to shove, men in the Promise Keepers are still considered the spiritual leaders in their families. As PK president Randy Phillips said, "we have to listen and honor and respect our wives," but admitted, "[w]e talk about ultimately the decision lying with the man."<sup>209</sup>

Acknowledging the sincere religious devotion and quest for growth of many Promise Keepers men, academic Lee Quinby, who has extensively researched the subject area, nonetheless sees political content in the group's vision of "apocalyptic masculinity," which rejects gender equality and scapegoats homosexuals and feminists "as a threat to the pure community." Quinby calls this tendency "coercive purity."<sup>210</sup>

Sociologist Sara Diamond reports that even some Christians who are dubious of "hard" End Times claims have nevertheless been re-energized by a "softer" millennial view of the year 2000 as a time for aggressive evangelism or even "spiritual warfare" against demonic forces.<sup>211</sup> The broad quest for purity

associated with the "softer" millennial thinking among apocalyptic Christians can breed violence, such as seen in the escalating attacks on abortion providers. It has already sparked legislative efforts to enforce divisive and narrowly-defined Biblical standards of morality. The wave of newspaper advertisements calling on gay men and lesbians to "cure" themselves by turning to Jesus is another example of a Christian coercive purity campaign influenced by millennial expectation. Richard K. Fenn, a professor of Theology and Society at Princeton Theological Seminary, argues that popular "rituals of purification" in a society are closely associated with apocalyptic and millennial beliefs.<sup>212</sup>

### Jeremiah the Profitable Prophet

An example of a group profiting from a campaign of millennial ritual purification is Jeremiah Films, named after the Biblical prophet. Jeremiah Films and Jeremiah Books are run by the husband and wife team of Pat and Caryl Matrisciana.

Sen. Trent Lott, who in 1998 denounced homosexuals as not just sinful but sick, had already appeared in Jeremiah's 1993 anti-gay video "Gay Rights, Special Rights." The video, used in several statewide legislative campaigns to erode basic rights for gay men and lesbians, also features former attorney general Edwin Meese III and former education secretary William J. Bennett, along with notable conspiracists such as David Noebel of Summit Ministries. Lott also stars in Jeremiah's 1993 video "The Crash—The Coming Financial Collapse of America," which comes in two versions, one with a secular doomsday scenario and another with a special Christian cut featuring discussions of End Times Biblical prophecy.

Jeremiah has a large collection of conspiracist videos. Caryl Matrisciana, a leading author of Christian Right books with conspiracist themes, co-hosted a thirteen-part video series from Jeremiah titled "Pagan Invasion." The series includes videos that claim evolution is a hoax, Freemasonry is a pagan religion, Halloween is a tool for Satanic abduction, and Mormonism is a cult heresy. The Jeremiah video on Mormonism has earned rebukes from mainstream religious commentators for its bigoted intolerance toward the Mormon faith.<sup>213</sup>

One segment of the Jeremiah Films series "Pagan Invasion," is titled "Preview of the Antichrist." It is described in an online Christian Right catalog with the following blurb:

"According to Ancient Hebrew scriptures, in the last days mankind will urgently seek the security of a one – world government. This global desire for a super leader, who will bring peace and safety to a world in chaos, will ultimately leave the human race vulnerable to the beguiling charm and the

most intelligent, powerful, and charismatic person of all history. The Bible calls this man the “anti-christ.” Ironically, he will dominate the globe and orchestrate society’s ultimate destruction. Chuck Smith and Caryl Matrisciana host this blueprint of apocalyptic events. Interviews with prophecy experts Chuck Missler, Hal Lindsey, and Peter Lalonde explain “why” the world will follow this man into perdition. Must viewing for all who desire a glimpse of the future.”<sup>214</sup>

Jeremiah is best known for *The Clinton Chronicles*, a video distributed widely by Jerry Falwell, which alleges that the President is at the head of a vast murderous conspiracy. *The Clinton Chronicles* video and the subsequent *The Clinton Chronicles* book are the work of Jeremiah’s Patrick Matrisciana, who is also founder and president of Citizens for Honest Government, a group dedicated to the impeachment of President Clinton.<sup>215</sup>

Many of the conspiracist attacks on President Bill Clinton originate in the apocalyptic sector of the Christian Right. One example is a book penned by Texe Marrs, titled *Big Sister Is Watching You: Hillary Clinton And The White House Feminists Who Now Control America—And Tell The President What To Do*. The book claims a plot by “FemiNazis” and their allies in “subversive organizations whose goal is to end American sovereignty and bring about a global Marxist paradise.”<sup>216</sup>

### Catholic Marianist Apocalypics

Catholics who pay special devotion to the Virgin Mary constitute a diverse Marianist subculture within the Church. Some Marianist groups have clashed with Church hierarchy over what constitutes an appropriate amount of adoration expressed for the Virgin Mary in relation to that reserved for Jesus Christ. Some Marianists report sightings or apparitions of the Virgin Mary; and these are sometimes considered End Times warnings.<sup>217</sup>

The basic message of the Marianist magazine *Fatima Crusader*, for example, is that we are in the apocalyptic End Times and are facing a direct struggle with Satan. Furthermore, the magazine urges that the actions and religious devotions of true Catholics must be based on End Times warnings and predictions made in appearances by the Virgin Mary and Jesus Christ before the Catholic faithful.<sup>218</sup>

Visions of the Virgin Mary have inspired devout Catholics to pay more attention to their religious duties since 1531 when an apparition of Mary appeared at Guadeloupe, Mexico. A shrine to the Virgin of Guadeloupe was built at the site, and the appearance was venerated in Europe.

The Virgin Mary also appeared several times before three children in Fatima, Portugal in 1917, and a shrine to Our Lady of Fatima was built there as well. A major message delivered at Fatima was the need to carry out the consecration and conversion of Russia to Christianity.<sup>219</sup> This mandate had serendipitous benefit to the anticommunist movement within Catholicism, which in turn had socio-political consequences in Europe and the US.

Now, given the collapse of Godless communism in Russia, this task might seem less pressing. Not so; in the worldview of *The Fatima Crusader*, Russian tyranny can come in many forms. *The Fatima Crusader*’s editorial position is that the predictions at Fatima refer to the threat of a Russian-style collectivist One World Government ushered in by socialists, liberals, secular humanists, homosexuals, abortionists, and followers of the New-Age spirituality movement. Articles in *The Fatima Crusader* also weave in millennialist references to Biblical prophecies about the End Times struggles against Satan and the Antichrist.

Numerous apparitions of Mary have been reported at a number of locations, with disputes arising among competing factions within the Marianist subculture as to which appearances are true and to be venerated, and which are hoaxes to be denounced. Medjugorje is a Herzegovinian village in what was Yugoslavia, where visions, first reported in the 1970s, draw Marianists from all over the world.<sup>220</sup> In Bayside, New York, starting in 1968, the late Veronica Lueken reported visions that became increasingly apocalyptic, including news from the Virgin that the Antichrist was alive and on earth.<sup>221</sup> Starting in 1993 the faithful gathered at Conyers, Georgia to hear divine messages from Mary revealed through former nurse Nancy Fowler.<sup>222</sup>

In the Summer, 1994 issue of the Marianist *Fatima Family Messenger*, Charles Martel writes, in an article on “The Antichrist,” that “The Church is in a shambles” characterized by:

- “Open rebellion against authority,
- “Enthusiasm for abortion, contraception, divorce, etc.,
- “Addition of many clerics to Marxism,
- “Presence of un-Catholic teachings in seminaries and universities,
- “Widespread and well organized homosexual network,
- “Acceptance of New Age belief as the latest of ecumenism.”<sup>223</sup>

Martel argues that “There is much more indisputable evidence available which indicates that the Antichrist is here and is in command.”<sup>224</sup>

Another right-wing Catholic publication with apocalyptic themes is the *Michael Journal*, which

includes conspiracist articles about the parasitic nature of financial elites that reflect historic anti-Semitic themes. *Michael Journal* celebrates the memory of Father Coughlin, the Catholic priest whose national radio programs in the 1930s moved from labor populism to anti-Semitism and eventually to fascist-style demagoguery. Coughlin is described as a man “Who courageously denounced the bankers’ debt-money system.” According to the *Michael Journal*, “The Illuminati are elite men, those on the top, who control the International Bankers to control, for evil purposes, the entire world.” Followers of the *Michael Journal* lobbied against the Massachusetts seat belt law, believing it was a collectivist step toward Satanic One World Government. The newspaper featured an article titled “The Beast of the Apocalypse: 666” which proclaimed that “Satan’s redoubtable ally” was a “gigantic auto-programming computer” in Brussels at the headquarters of the European Common Market.<sup>225</sup>

Right-wing Catholic Marianists and apocalyptics are a significant force in the militant wing of the anti-abortion movement. Human Life International, a right-wing Catholic group, is a major source of anti-abortion materials for such activists. HLI publishes and distributes books that feature conspiracist thinking and misogyny, with titles such as *Sex Education: The Final Plague*, *The Feminist Takeover*, and *Ungodly Rage: The Hidden Face of Catholic Feminism*. HLI also distributes the book *New World Order: The Ancient Plan of Secret Societies*, by William T. Still, which attacks the Freemasons as part of conspiracy to control the country through the issuing of paper money.<sup>226</sup> The book is also sold by right-wing groups other than HLI. According to Still, his book:

“...[s]hows how an ancient plan has been hidden for centuries deep within secret societies. This scheme is designed to bring all of mankind under a single world government—a New World Order. This plan is of such antiquity that its result is even mentioned in ...Revelation...”<sup>227</sup>

As this comment citing Revelations suggests, the battle against the conspiracy is the battle between good and evil. The back cover blurb of Still’s book confirms this by stating that the plan “to bring all nations under one-world government” is actually “the biblical rule of the Antichrist.”<sup>228</sup>

Asserting that the Federal Reserve is part of the conspiracy, Still incorporates references to the Rothschild banking interests in a way that reflects historic anti-Semitic theories alleging Jewish control over the economy.<sup>229</sup> Still’s book is endorsed in a back-cover blurb by D. James Kennedy, Ph.D., influential senior minister of the Coral Ridge Presbyterian Church. According to Kennedy’s blurb:

“Regardless of your views about the coming of a world government, Bill Still’s new book will make you reassess the odds. He traces the historic role of secret societies and their influence on the “Great Plan” to erase nationalism in preparation for a global dictatorship. He allows the facts to speak for themselves, as he sounds an ominous warning for the 21st Century.”<sup>230</sup>

Here we see apocalyptic conspiracism bridging the divide between politically-active right-wing Catholics and Protestants.

## The Patriot & Armed Militia Movements

In the 1970s and 1980s far right Christian Identity and Constitutionalist groups interacted with apocalyptic survivalists to spawn a number of militant quasi-underground formations, including some that called themselves patriots or militias.<sup>231</sup> During the height of the rural farm crisis in the early 1980s, one of these groups, the *Posse Comitatus*—a loosely-knit armed network that spread conspiracism, white supremacy, and anti-Semitism throughout the farm belt—captured a small but significant number of sympathizers among farmers and ranchers.<sup>232</sup> Other groups, such as Aryan Nations and the Lyndon LaRouche group were also active, and soon a loose network was constructed linking tax protesters to groups as far to the right as various Ku Klux Klan splinter groups and neonazi organizations.

The Patriot movement and its armed wing, the citizen militias, are revivals of these and earlier right-wing populist movements, emerging in the 1990s after the collapse of European communism and the launching of the Gulf War. When President Bush announced his new foreign policy would help build a New World Order, his phrasing surged through the Christian and secular hard right like an electric shock, since the phrase had been used to represent the dreaded collectivist One World Government for decades. Some Christians saw Bush as signaling the End Times betrayal by a world leader. Secular anticommunists saw a bold attempt to smash US sovereignty and impose a tyrannical collectivist system run by the United Nations. This galvanized into activism pre-existing anti-globalist sentiments within the right.<sup>233</sup>

A self-conscious Patriot movement coalesced involving some 5 million persons who suspected—to varying degrees—that the government was manipulated by secret elites and planned the imminent imposition of some form of tyranny. The Patriot movement is bracketed on the reformist side by the John Birch Society and the conspiratorial segment of the Christian right, and on the insurgent side by the Liberty Lobby and groups promoting themes historically associated with white supremacy and anti-Semitism. A variety of pre-

existing far right vigilante groups (including Christian Identity adherents and outright neonazi groups) were influential in helping organize the broader Patriot and armed militias movement.<sup>234</sup> The Patriot movement has drawn recruits from several other pre-existing movements and networks, including gun rights, anti-abortion, survivalist, anticommunist, libertarian, anti-tax, and anti-environmentalist.

Patriot movement adherents who formed armed units became known as the armed militia movement. During the mid-1990s, armed militias were sporadically active in all fifty states, with numbers estimated at between 20,000 and 60,000.<sup>235</sup> Both the Patriot and armed militia movements grew rapidly, relying on computer networks, FAX trees, short-wave radio, AM talk radio, and videotape and audiotape distribution. These movements are arguably the first major US social movements to be organized primarily through overlapping non-traditional electronic media. The core narrative carried by these media outlets was apocalyptic: featuring claims that the US government was controlled by a vast conspiracy of secret elites plotting a New World Order, and was planning to impose a globalist UN police state in the near future.

A key early figure in organizing the militia movement using the short-wave radio and the Internet was Linda Thompson, whose elaborate apocalyptic warnings and conspiratorial assertions of government plots were widely believed within the militia movement until she called for an armed march on Washington, DC to punish traitorous elected officials.<sup>236</sup> Her plan was widely criticized as dangerous, probably illegal, and possibly part of a government conspiracy to entrap militia members. Mark Koernke, *aka* Mark of Michigan, quickly replaced her as the most-favored militia intelligence analyst.

In anticipation of attack by government agents, a significant segment of the Patriot and armed militia movement embraces survivalism. Survivalism is an apocalyptic view (with both Christian and secular proponents), that advocates gathering and storing large supplies of food, water, and medicine, in anticipation of economic collapse, social unrest, or the Tribulations. Some adherents also purchase gold and other precious metals as a hedge against currency devaluation; and some acquire weapons. Philip Lamy titled his book on the subject *Millennium Rage: Survivalists, White Supremacists, and the Doomsday Prophecy*.<sup>237</sup>

As a protective maneuver, a number of survivalists have withdrawn to remote, usually rural, locations, or formed small communities for mutual self-defense. This is what led the Weaver family to a remote region of Idaho. Randy Weaver and his wife were survivalists as well as Christian Identity adherents. Had the federal marshals who surrounded their house in 1992 factored

these beliefs into their plan for arresting Randy Weaver, the subsequent deadly shoot-out might have been avoided. Federal Marshal William Degan, and Weaver's wife Vicki and son Samuel died. Randy Weaver and his friend Kevin Harris were wounded.<sup>238</sup>

Some Christian fundamentalist survivalists believe that to avoid the Mark of the Beast, they must live apart from secular society for a period of up to 42 months. Robert K. Spear, a key figure on the patriot and militia training circuit, is the author of *Surviving Global Slavery: Living Under the New World Order*.<sup>239</sup> According to Spear, we are approaching the Tribulations of the End Times. Spear cites Revelation, Chapter 13, and warns that Christians will soon be asked to accept the Satanic Mark of the Beast and thus reject Christ. True Christians, according to Spear, must defend their faith and prepare the way for the return of Christ through the formation of armed Christian communities. His book is dedicated to "those who will have to face the Tribulations."

In 1993, the Branch Davidian compound in Waco, Texas functioned as this type of fundamentalist survivalist retreat. Davidian leader David Koresh was decoding Revelation as an End Times script and preparing for the Tribulations. The government's failure to comprehend the Davidian's millennialist worldview set the stage for the deadly miscalculations by government agents, which cost the lives of 80 Branch Davidians (including 21 children), and four federal agents.<sup>240</sup> TV coverage of this incident sent images of fiery apocalypse cascading throughout the society, further inflaming the apocalyptic paradigm within right-wing anti-government groups.<sup>241</sup>

Throughout the late 1990s, the Patriot and armed militia movements overlapped with a resurgent states' rights movement, and a new "county supremacy" movement. There was a rapid growth of illegal so-called "constitutionalist" "common law courts," set up by persons claiming non-existent "sovereign" citizenship. These courts claimed jurisdiction over legal matters on the county or state level, and dismissed the US judicial system as corrupt and unconstitutional.<sup>242</sup> Constitutionalist legal theory creates a two-tiered concept of citizenship in which white people have a superior "natural law" or "sovereign" citizenship. Amazingly, many supporters of constitutionalism seem oblivious to the racism in this construct.

The most publicized incident involving common law ideology was the 1996 standoff involving the Montana Freeman, who combined Christian Identity, bogus common law legal theories, "debt-money" theories that reject the legality of the Federal Reserve system, and apocalyptic expectation.<sup>243</sup> On a global level, many of the fears over declining sovereignty are linked to the idea that "the UN is a critical cornerstone

of the New World Order,” as one Birch Society publication put it.<sup>244</sup>

Three men suspected of shooting a law enforcement officer while attempting to steal a water truck in Colorado in 1998 had talked to friends about the coming collapse of society, using Patriot-style rhetoric. Two reportedly attended meetings of a local Patriot group.<sup>245</sup> Incidents like this are likely to increase as we near the year 2000. However, the conspiracist scapegoating of right-wing populism, like that in the Patriot and armed militia movements, creates not only individual acts of violence, but also what Mary Rupert has dubbed “a seedbed for fascism.”<sup>246</sup> Right-wing populism is a recruitment pool for the far right.

## The Far Right

The far right in the US is composed of groups such as the Ku Klux Klan, Aryan Nations, the Christian Patriots, ideological fascists, and neonazis. The term “far right” in this context refers to groups with an aggressively-insurgent or extra-legal agenda, including calls for denying basic human rights to a target group. Christian Patriots combine Christian nationalism with constitutionalism.<sup>247</sup> Non-Christian neonazis are able to work in coalitions with the Christian Patriot groups due to shared anti-government sentiments and conspiracism rooted in historic anti-Jewish bigotry.

The most significant worldview in the Christian Patriot movement is Christian Identity, which believes the US is the Biblical “Promised Land” and considers white Christians to be God’s “Chosen People.”<sup>248</sup> Michael Barkun in *Religion and the Racist Right* has tracked the influence of apocalyptic millennialism on major racist and anti-Semitic ideologues within Christian Identity, including Wesley Swift, William Potter Gale, Richard Butler, Sheldon Emry, and Pete Peters.<sup>249</sup> The neonazi version of Identity ideology claims Jews are Satanic agents who manipulate subhuman people of color.<sup>250</sup>

Christian Identity was a common core belief in the *Posse Comitatus* in the 1980s. Some Ku Klux Klan and racist skinhead groups now espouse Identity, as does Aryan Nations. Identity is a millennialist ideology that plans for an imminent apocalyptic race war, and history has proved that they act on their beliefs—making the threat of violence especially real.<sup>251</sup> Many proponents of Christian Identity seek to overthrow the “Zionist Occupational Government” in Washington, DC and establish an exclusively white, Christian nation. In this ideology Jews are pictured as agents of the Antichrist who must be eliminated to prepare the way for the return of Christ.<sup>252</sup>

The Gulf War encouraged Christian Patriot groups to peddle anti-Semitic conspiracist theories about Jewish power behind US military involvement. An

example was the 40-page newsprint tabloid booklet by Nord Davis, Jr., *Desert Shield and the New World Order*, published in 1990 by his Northpoint Tactical Teams.<sup>253</sup> Other pre-existing Christian Patriot groups quickly reached out to the emerging militia movement with similar propaganda materials. For instance the Tennessee-based Christian Civil Liberties Association published *The Militia News*, ostensibly a newspaper but actually a catalog of books and other educational resources including guides on how to evade government tracking and surveillance. The opening article, “U.S. Government Initiates Open Warfare Against American People,” is a good example of anti-Semitic Christian Patriot dogma:

“...following the turn of the 20th century, Communism (the Judeo-Bolsheviks of Russia) and other diabolical movements and philosophies—Fabian socialism, materialism, atheism, and secular humanism—would, like malignant parasites, establish themselves in America. Even our presidents, beginning with Franklin Roosevelt, would begin using the resources of this nation to finance and support our foreign enemies, particularly the Communist and Zionist movements.”<sup>254</sup>

The article rails against what the author sees as the unconstitutional attack on states’ rights by “Court mandated integration and forced busing” in the 1960s, and the “systematic de-Christianization of the nation.”<sup>255</sup> Warning this is part of a “satanic conspiracy,” the author advises that for the government to succeed, “the globalists must outlaw and confiscate” firearms.

“Every gun owner who is the least bit informed knows that those who are behind this conspiracy—who now have their people well placed in political office, in the courts, in the media, and in the schools, are working for the total disarming of the American people and the surrender of our nation and its sovereignty....The time is at hand when men and women must decide whether they are on the side of freedom and justice, the American republic, and Almighty God; or if they are on the side of tyranny and oppression, the New World Order, and Satan.”<sup>256</sup>

Mobilizing gun owners was the first step in building the militia movement out of the Patriot movement. The Weaver and Waco incidents focused the attention of the Patriot movement as examples of government tyranny, and served as trigger events to galvanize a mobilization in 1993 and 1994 around stopping the Brady Bill and gun control provisions of the Crime Control Act.<sup>257</sup> But more militant and

suspicious elements within the Patriot movement grafted apocalyptic conspiracist fears onto the gun rights campaign, arguing that if gun rights were restricted, a brutal and repressive government crack-down on gun owners would quickly follow. The Weaver and Waco incidents were seen as field tests of the planned repression, with the ultimate goal being UN control of the US to benefit the conspiracy of secret globalist elites. While for many this was a secular narrative, an apocalyptic and millennialist End Times overlay was easily added by Christian fundamentalist elements in the movement. Another overlay was overt anti-Jewish conspiracism. The solution, given this narrative, was to create independent armed defensive units to resist the expected wave of government violence—thus the armed citizens militias.

Timothy McVeigh, who had moved from conspiracist anti-government beliefs into militant neonazi ideology, blew up the Oklahoma City federal building on the anniversary of the Waco conflagration to protest government abuse of power which he, and others, believed was prelude to a tyrannical New World Order.<sup>258</sup> It is likely that McVeigh wanted his act of terrorism to push the more defensive and less ideological militias into a more racialized and militant insurgency. His act of terrorism mimicked a scenario in the novel *The Turner Diaries*, which he distributed to friends. Written by neonazi William Pierce, *The Turner Diaries* has apocalyptic themes invoking the cleansing nature of ritual violence typical of Nazi ideology, which also sought a millenarian Thousand Year Reich.<sup>259</sup> McVeigh's apparently secular concern that during the Gulf War the government had implanted a micro-chip into his body echoes historic concerns among fundamentalist Christians that the Mark of the Beast might be hidden in electronic devices.

## The Politics of Apocalyptic Millennialism

The period immediately prior to a millennial date can be marked by people turning inward in preparation, removing themselves from society, and in extreme cases, committing suicide. Conversely, some who believe the end of time means there will be literally no time for punishment, may act out on their anger by killing their enemies. Other people swept up in millennial expectation target demonized groups for discrimination or violence to cleanse the society, or push it toward the final showdown. During the post-millennial period, people can turn outward, and express anger over failed expectations by blaming scapegoated groups for having prevented the transformation.<sup>260</sup>

In Robert Fuller's view, apocalyptic fervor is complex, and part of a "literary and theological tradition," that is "transmitted through a variety of

cultural institutions that are relatively immune" to certain "social or economic forces."<sup>261</sup> Philip Lamy agrees that millennialism has many sources, but contends it generally can be tied to societal conflict and resistance to change.<sup>262</sup> An early study of millenarian "Cargo Cults" in the Pacific Islands showed how they grew as a resistance movement against colonialism.<sup>263</sup>

Millennialist movements in the US often have reflected a manichaeian framework of absolute good versus absolute evil. As Jeffrey Kaplan notes:

"A manichaeian framework requires the adherent to see the world as the devil's domain, in which the tiny, helpless "righteous remnant" perseveres through the protection of God in the hope that, soon, God will see fit to intervene once and for all in the life of this world."<sup>264</sup>

This perspective can promote a passive, fatalist response, or can lead some to be pro-active and interventionist, seeking to prepare the way for the anticipated confrontation. Believers can be optimistic or pessimistic about the outcome.

Fuller ties the millennialist viewpoint to the larger issues of demonization and scapegoating when he argues that:

"Many efforts to name the Antichrist appear to be rooted in the psychological need to project one's "unacceptable" tendencies onto a demonic enemy. It is the Antichrist, not oneself, who must be held responsible for wayward desires. And with so many aspects of modern American life potentially luring individuals into nonbiblical thoughts or desire, it is no wonder that many people believe that the Antichrist has camouflaged himself to better work his conspiracies against the faithful."<sup>265</sup>

In many cases the worldview of the reader or listener determines who gets scapegoated by the conspiracist narrative. Some people exposed to the same conspiracist article or radio program might decide the villains are generic new world order secret elites who are manipulating the government, while others will be convinced it is demonic forces of the Antichrist signaling the apocalyptic End Times. Some, inevitably, will blame it all on the Jews. A skillful wordsmith can address all three audiences at the same time by using coded rhetoric.

The book *Trilaterals Over Washington* appears to be a secular critique, but it takes on a new dimension when the illustration on the cover is identified as the three-headed beast mentioned in Revelation, which in turn gives added meaning to the inside graphic with the headline: "The Trilateral Commission: the Devil's Triangle of your future."<sup>266</sup>

In some cases the audience provides its own overlay that extrapolates beyond the intended message. C. Wright Mills, G. William Domhoff, and Holly Sklar have written structural and institutional critiques of power that eschew conspiracism.<sup>267</sup> Yet right-wing populists cite these works, then claim that more informed research has exposed the nest of secret elites at the source of the conspiracy. Antony C. Sutton's *Wall Street and the Rise of Hitler* even features a chart showing Sutton names more "conspirators" than Domhoff, meant to prove that Sutton has the superior analysis.<sup>268</sup> Both Domhoff and Sklar have expressed exasperation at having their work touted by right-wing conspiracists.<sup>269</sup>

In November, 1997 the Center for Millennial Studies at Boston University held an international symposium to discuss the historical dynamics of apocalypticism. Most of those at the symposium agreed that the track record is bleak. Center director Richard Landes expressed his concern that "most people don't understand how quickly demonization and scapegoating can gain an audience in millennial times, particularly when believers become disappointed and frustrated."

Landes hopes the current millennial moment can have a positive outcome, and that apocalyptic fervor can be directed away from scapegoating and toward constructive and self-reflective renewal projects.<sup>270</sup> Stephen O'Leary points out that this will be tricky, "the study of apocalyptic argument leads to the conclusion that its stratagems are endless, and not susceptible to negation through rational criticism."<sup>271</sup> He suggests patience, a sense of tragedy in history, and a sense of humor in interaction as the best strategies for mending communities that have experienced the trauma of apocalyptic confrontation.

As we approach the millennium, there is an increase in, and a convergence of: apocalyptic thinking, demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism. At the same time we are in the midst of the longest right-wing backlash movement since the end of Reconstruction. Ritual purification campaigns by the Christian Right continue to spread divisiveness. For some apocalyptic Christians, the End Times have arrived, and the witch hunt for satanic agents has begun in earnest. A right-wing populist revolt against globalization blames secret elites and sinister conspiracies. Clinic attacks, terrorist bombings, and racist murders can be linked to increasing apocalyptic preparation or retribution. Yet there has been reluctance to recognize the pattern and face the dilemma, despite numerous books on the subject by serious scholars.

Apocalyptic conspiracy theories played a role in the criminal cases of John C. Salvi, 3d, convicted in the murder of two reproductive health center workers and the wounding of five others, and the case of Francisco

Martin Duran, who sprayed the White House with bullets. Duran was known to listen to a conspiracy-mongering right-wing Colorado-based radio talk show hosted by Chuck Baker that broadcast conspiratorial claims by adherents to the Patriot and armed militia movements.<sup>272</sup> Both Duran and Salvi showed signs of psychological disturbance.

Salvi was arguably mentally ill, and later committed suicide in jail. Prior to his deadly rampage, Salvi distributed lurid photographs of fetuses from Human Life International. He began quoting from Revelation and warning about the need for increased vigilance and action among devout Catholics.<sup>273</sup> He had expressed interest in the armed militia movement.<sup>274</sup> Much of John Salvi's rhetoric about the corrupt money system echoed themes in the *Michael Journal*. Magazines found in Salvi's residence included *The New American* and *The Fatima Crusader*, both published by right-wing groups promoting conspiracist theories and vociferously opposing abortion and homosexuality.<sup>275</sup> One issue of *The New American* found in John Salvi's possession contained an article exploring the idea that killing an abortion provider might be morally justified, an idea promoted in some militant anti-abortion circles.<sup>276</sup>

Some people with a mental illness who carry out acts of violence cannot successfully control their fears and anger and act them out against real targets. Salvi's psychological condition was not demonstrated by his claims about a banking conspiracy, which are commonplace in the Catholic apocalyptic right, nor was his choice of targets random.<sup>277</sup> Certainly a person like Salvi does not represent the mainstream of Catholicism, the anti-abortion movement, or the US political right, but he expresses the views of a durable subculture with conspiracist views that target scapegoats.

This dynamic of rhetoric triggering violence functions more easily among the mentally ill. But scapegoats can be injured or killed by those people—no matter what their mental state—who act out their conspiratorial beliefs in a zealous manner. The failure of political and religious leaders to take strong public stands against groups and individuals that demagogically spread scapegoating conspiracist theories encourages this dangerous dynamic. Yet when President Clinton spoke out against the rhetoric of demonization following the Oklahoma City bombing, he was criticized by pundits across the political spectrum.<sup>278</sup>

Many questions need more study. When does demonizing rhetoric by demagogues motivate action among followers who are not mentally ill? Why and when do seemingly sane followers of ideological leaders begin to act out their beliefs through violence? When and how does apocalyptic violence become a

mass movement? How and when can it become state policy?

Right-wing populist movements can cause serious damage to a society because they often popularize xenophobia, authoritarianism, scapegoating, and conspiracism. This can lure mainstream politicians to adopt these themes to attract voters, legitimize acts of discrimination (or even violence), and open the door for revolutionary right-wing populist movements, such as fascism, to recruit from the reformist populist movements.

According to Richard K. Fenn:

Fascist tendencies are most likely to flourish wherever vestiges of a traditional community, bound together by ties of race and kinship, persist in a society largely dominated by large-scale organizations, by an industrial class system, and by a

complex division of labor. Under these conditions the traditional community itself becomes threatened; its members all the more readily dread and demonize the larger society.<sup>279</sup>

Fenn argues that apocalyptic themes that lead to this tendency can be found in all three of the political tendencies examined in this study: the Christian Right, Patriot and armed militia movements, and the fascist right.<sup>280</sup>

By understanding the apocalyptic and millennialist roots of the conspiracist narratives peddled by right-wing populist forces, we can better understand why their claims—that seem on the surface to be outlandish—nonetheless resonate in certain alienated sectors of our society.<sup>281</sup>

## Conclusions

The history of apocalyptic fervor and millennial expectation is written by those secure in their knowledge that all previous predictions of terminal cataclysm have turned out to be false. After all, if the end of time ever arrives, it will leave behind no historians or sociologists, thus making skepticism an appealing and safe alternative. While believers prepare for the spiritual tsunami that will wash away both sins and sinners, skeptics make the assumption that it is just another wave that will eventually collapse, seeping away through the infinite sands of time. Yet no matter what we believe, we are all destined to experience the effects of the apocalypse, because it invents itself in the maelstrom of the human mind, and no logical arguments can stop the storm.

Mere observation is morally insufficient. We need to do damage control in anticipation of the apocalypse. The challenge is to respect devout religious belief while

focusing societal energy on a millennial period of introspection and renewal rather than a period of fear and mistrust. We ignore apocalyptic fears and millennial expectation at our own peril, and by ignoring the trends, we put others in peril as well. Given the already evident tendency toward apocalyptic scapegoating as we approach the year 2000, it is entirely predictable that more people will be targeted as evil agents of the Satanic Antichrist, traitorous minions of the globalist new world order, or simply sinners to be disciplined and kept in line in religious campaigns of coercive purity.

In times such as these, history passes a harsh judgment on silence. Instead of waiting to see who is next on the list, we must speak out against all forms of apocalyptic demonization, scapegoating, and conspiracism, because they are toxic to democratic discourse.

## Author's Note

Many of the themes and ideas expressed in this paper are the result of joint work with Matthew N. Lyons on the forthcoming *Too Close for Comfort*. Seminars hosted by historian Richard Landes, director of the Center for Millennial Studies at Boston University, helped me frame this discussion, as did conversations with Sara Diamond, Fred Clarkson, Philip Lamy, Aaron Katz, and Erin Miller.

## Selected Bibliography

- Richard Abanes, *American Militias: Rebellion, Racism & Religion*, (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1996).
- Richard Abanes, *End-Time Visions: The Road to Armageddon?*, (New York: Four Walls Eight Windows, 1998).
- James A. Aho, *This Thing of Darkness: A Sociology of the Enemy*, (Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press, 1994).
- James A. Aho, *The Politics of Righteousness: Idaho Christian Patriotism*, (Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press, 1990).
- Gordon W. Allport, *Nature of Prejudice*, (Cambridge, MA: Addison-Wesley, 1954).
- Amy Elizabeth Ansell, ed., *Unraveling the Right: The New Conservatism in American Thought and Politics*, (New York: Westview, 1998).
- Michael Barkun, *Religion and the Racist Right: The Origins of the Christian Identity Movement*, (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1994).
- Bruce Barron, *Heaven on Earth? The Social and Political Agendas of Dominion Theology*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervon, 1992).
- Chip Berlet, ed., *Eyes Right! Challenging the Right Wing Backlash*, (Boston: South End Press, 1995).
- Dallas A. Blanchard, *The Anti-Abortion Movement and the Rise of the Religious Right*, (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1994).
- Carl Boggs, *Social Movements and Political Power: Emerging Forms of Radicalism in the West*, (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1986).
- Brenda E. Brasher, *Fundamentalism and Female Power*, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1998).
- Devin Burghart and Robert Crawford, *Guns and Gavels: Common Law Courts, Militias & White Supremacy*, (Portland, OR: Coalition for Human Dignity, 1996).
- David H. Bennett, *The Party of Fear: The American Far Right from Nativism to the Militia Movement*, (New York: Vintage Books, revised 1995, {1988}).
- Paul Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More: Prophecy Belief in Modern American Culture*, (Cambridge, MA: Belknap/Harvard University Press, 1992).
- Gregory S. Camp, *Selling Fear: Conspiracy Theories and End-Times Paranoia*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1997).
- Margaret Canovan, *Populism* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1981).
- Fred Clarkson, *Eternal Hostility: The Struggle Between Theocracy and Democracy*, (Monroe, ME: Common Courage, 1997).
- Robert G. Clouse, Robert N. Hosack, and Richard V. Pierard, *The New Millennium Manual : A Once and Future Guide*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, forthcoming, 1999).
- Norman Cohn, *Cosmos, Chaos and the World to Come: The Ancient Roots of Apocalyptic Faith*, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Warrant for Genocide: The Myth of the Jewish World Conspiracy and the Protocols of the Elders of Zion*, (London: Serif, 1996 {1967}).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *The Pursuit of the Millennium*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1970 {1957}).
- James Corcoran, *Bitter Harvest: The Birth of Paramilitary Terrorism in the Heartland*, (New York: Viking Penguin, 1995 (1990)).
- Sally Covington, *Moving a Public Policy Agenda: The Strategic Philanthropy of Conservative Foundations*,

- (Washington, DC: National Committee for Responsive Philanthropy, 1997).
- Robert Crawford, S. L. Gardiner, Jonathan Mozzochi, and R. L. Taylor, *The Northwest Imperative: Documenting a Decade Of Hate*, (Portland, OR: Coalition for Human Dignity, and, Seattle, WA: Northwest Coalition Against Malicious Harassment, 1994).
- Sally Covington, *Moving a Public Policy Agenda: The Strategic Philanthropy of Conservative Foundations*, (Washington, DC: National Committee for Responsive Philanthropy, 1997).
- Richard O. Curry and Thomas M. Brown, eds., *Conspiracy: The Fear of Subversion in American History*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1972).
- David Brion Davis, ed., *The Fear of Conspiracy: Images of Un-American Subversion from the Revolution to the Present*, (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1971).
- Morris Dees (with James Corcoran), *Gathering Storm: America's Militia Threat*, (New York: HarperCollins, 1996).
- Sara Diamond, *Not by Politics Alone: The Enduring Influence of the Christian Right*, (New York: Guilford, 1998).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Roads to Dominion: Right-Wing Movements and Political Power in the United States*, (New York: Guilford, 1995).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *Spiritual Warfare: The Politics of the Christian Right*, (Boston: South End Press, 1989).
- Betty A. Dobratz and Stephanie L. Shanks-Meile, "White Power, White Pride!" *The White Separatist Movement in the United States*, (New York, Twayne Publishers, 1997).
- Joel Dyer, *Harvest of Rage: Why Oklahoma City is Only the Beginning*, (New York: Westview, 1997).
- Raphael S. Ezekiel, *The Racist Mind: Portraits of American Neo-Nazis and Klansmen*, (New York: Viking, 1995).
- Susan Faludi, *Backlash: The Undeclared War Against American Women* (New York: Anchor Books, Doubleday, Bantam Doubleday Dell Publishing Group, Inc., 1992).
- Michael P. Federici, *The Challenge of Populism: The Rise of Right-Wing Democratism in Postwar America*, (New York: Praeger, 1991).
- Abby L. Ferber, *White Man Falling: Race, Gender, and White Supremacy*, (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 1998).
- Richard K. Fenn, *The End of Time: Religion, Ritual, and the Forging of the Soul*, (Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1997).
- Peter Fritzsche, *Rehearsals for Fascism: Populism and Political Mobilization in Weimar Germany*. (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990).
- Robert Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist: The History of an American Obsession*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995).
- James William Gibson, *Warrior Dreams: Paramilitary Culture in Post Viet Nam America*, (New York: Hill & Wang, 1994).
- John C. Green, James L. Guth and Kevin Hill, *Faith and Election: The Christian Right in Congressional Campaigns 1978–1988*.
- Stephen Jay Gould, *Questioning the Millennium: A Rationalist's Guide to a Precisely Arbitrary Countdown*, (New York: Harmony Books, 1997).
- James L. Guth, ed., *The Bully Pulpit : The Politics of Protestant Clergy*, Studies in Government and Public Policy Series, (Kansas: University Press of Kansas, 1998).
- Thomas Halpern and Brian Levin, *The Limits of Dissent: The Constitutional Status of Armed Civilian Militias*, (Amherst, MA: Aletheia Press, 1996).
- Mark S. Hamm, *Apocalypse in Oklahoma: Waco and Ruby Ridge Revenged*, (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1997).
- Didi Herman, *The Antigay Agenda: Orthodox Vision and the Christian Right*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997),
- Jerome L. Himmelstein, *To The Right: The Transformation of American Conservatism*, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1990).
- Richard Hofstadter, "The Paranoid Style in American Politics," in *The Paranoid Style in American Politics and Other Essays* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1965).
- George Johnson, *Architects of Fear: Conspiracy Theories and Paranoia in American Politics* (Los Angeles: Tarcher/Houghton Mifflin, 1983).
- Jeffrey Kaplan, *Radical Religion in America: Millenarian Movements from the Far Right to the Children of Noah*, (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1997).
- Michael Kazin, *The Populist Persuasion: An American History*. (New York: Basic Books, 1995).
- Linda Kintz, *Between Jesus and the Market: The Emotions that Matter in Right-Wing America*, (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1997).
- \_\_\_\_\_, & Julia Lesage, eds., *Culture, Media, and the Religious Right*, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1998).
- Bert Klandermans, *The Social Psychology of Protest*, (Oxford: Blackwell, 1997).

- Joel Kovel, *Red Hunting in the Promised Land: Anticommunism and the Making of America*, (New York: Basic Books, 1994).
- Philip Lamy, *Millennium Rage: Survivalists, White Supremacists, and the Doomsday Prophecy*, (New York: Plenum, 1996).
- Clarence Y. H. Lo and Michael Schwartz, eds., *Social Policy and the Conservative Agenda*, (Malden, MA: Blackwell Publishers, 1998).
- Charles Mackay, *Extraordinary Popular Delusions and the Madness of Crowds*, (London: Richard Bentley, 1841) Republished, New York: Crown, 1980.
- George Marsden, *Understanding Fundamentalism and Evangelicalism*, (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 1991).
- William Martin, *With God on Our Side: The Rise of the Religious Right in America*, (New York: Broadway Books, 1996).
- Albert J. Menendez, *Visions of Reality: What Fundamentalist Schools Teach*, (Buffalo, NY: Prometheus Books, 1993).
- Frank P. Mintz, *The Liberty Lobby and the American Right: Race, Conspiracy, and Culture* (Westport, CT: Greenwood, 1985).
- Lise Noël, *Intolerance, A General Survey*, (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1994).
- Stephen O'Leary, *Arguing the Apocalypse: A Theory of Millennial Rhetoric*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994).
- Elaine Pagels, *The Origin of Satan*, (New York: Vintage, 1996).
- Daniel Pipes, *Conspiracy: How the Paranoid Style Flourishes and Where it Comes From*, (New York: The Free Press, 1997).
- \_\_\_\_\_, *The Hidden Hand: Middle East Fears of Conspiracy*, (New York: St. Martins, 1998).
- Lee Quinby, *Anti-Apocalypse: Exercise in Genealogical Criticism*, (Minneapolis: Univ. of MN Press, 1994).
- Dick J. Reavis, *The Ashes of Waco: An Investigation*, (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1995).
- Leo P. Ribuffo, *The Old Christian Right: The Protestant Hard Right from the Great Depression to the Cold War*, (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1983).
- James Ridgeway, *Blood in the Face*, (New York: Thunder's Mouth Press, 1990).
- Thomas Robbins and Susan J. Palmer, eds., *Millennium, Messiahs, and Mayhem: Contemporary Apocalyptic Movements*, (New York: Routledge, 1997).
- Robert S. Robins and Jerrold M. Post, M.D., *Political Paranoia: The Psychopolitics of Hatred*, (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1997).
- Mary Rupert, "The Patriot Movement and the Roots of Fascism," in Susan Allen Nan, et. al. eds., *Windows to Conflict Analysis and Resolution: Framing our Field*, (Fairfax, VA: Institute for Conflict Analysis and Resolution, 1997).
- Carl Sagan, *The Demon-Haunted World: Science as a Candle in the Dark*, (New York: Random House, 1996).
- Eli Sagan, *The Honey and the Hemlock: Democracy and Paranoia in Ancient Athens and Modern America*, (New York: Basic Books, 1991).
- Kenneth Samples, Erwin de Castro, Richard Abanes, & Robert Lyle, *Prophets of the Apocalypse: David Koresh & Other American Messiahs*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1994).
- Tom Sine, *Cease Fire: Searching for Sanity in America's Culture Wars*, (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 1995).
- Christian Smith, ed., *Disruptive Religion: The Force of Faith in Social Movement Activism*, (New York: Routledge, 1997).
- Peter Stanford, *The Devil: A Biography*, (New York: Henry Holt, 1996).
- Kenneth S. Stern, *A Force Upon the Plain: The American Militia Movement and the Politics of Hate*, (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1996).
- Catherine McNicol Stock, *Rural Radicals: Righteous Rage in the American Grain*, (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1996).
- Charles B. Strozier, *Apocalypse: On the Psychology of Fundamentalism in America* (Boston: Beacon Press, 1994).
- Charles B. Strozier, and Michael Flynn, *The Year 2000: Essays on the End*, (New York: NYU Press, 1997).
- James D. Tabor and Eugene V. Gallagher, *Why Waco? Cults and the Battle for Religious Freedom in America*, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995).
- Damian. Thompson, *The End Of Time. Faith And Fear In The Shadow Of The Millennium*. (Great Britain: Sinclair-Stevenson, 1996).
- Patricia A. Turner, *I Heard it Through the Grapevine, Rumor in African-American Culture*, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993).
- Jess Walter, *Every Knee Shall Bow: The Truth and Tragedy of Ruby Ridge and the Randy Weaver Family*, (New York: Regan Books, 1995).
- Eric Ward, ed., *Conspiracies: Real Grievances, Paranoia, and Mass Movements*, (Seattle: Northwest Coalition Against Malicious Harassment [Peanut Butter Publishing], 1996).
- Eric Ward, ed., *The Second Revolution: States Rights', Sovereignty, and Power of the County*, (Seattle, Northwest Coalition Against Malicious Harassment [Peanut Butter Publishing], 1997).

Donald I. Warren, *The Radical Center: Middle Americans and the Politics of Alienation*, (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1976).

Elisabeth Young-Bruhl, *The Anatomy of Prejudices*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996).

Leonard Zeskind, *The "Christian Identity" Movement*, (Atlanta, GA: Center for Democratic Renewal/Division of Church and Society, National Council of Churches, 1987).

## Endnotes to Dances With Devils

{ Original publication dates appear within brackets like these }

<sup>1</sup> This article is adapted from working papers and the draft manuscript for *Too Close for Comfort*, by Chip Berlet & Matthew N. Lyons, forthcoming, Guilford Press. Many of the themes and ideas expressed in this paper are the result of our joint work. Seminars hosted by historian Richard Landes, director of the Center for Millennial Studies (CMS), at Boston University, helped me frame this discussion, as did discussions with Sara Diamond, Fred Clarkson, Philip Lamy, Aaron Katz, and Erin Miller. A number of people, too numerous to list here, graciously made useful comments based on earlier drafts and conference papers, and I thank them for their assistance.

Portions of this article first appeared in:

Chip Berlet, "Apocalypse Soon: Are You Targeted as an Agent of the Antichrist? As the Year 2000 Approaches, the List Grows..." *The Boston Globe*, 7/19/98, Focus Section, p. 1.

\_\_\_\_\_, "Mad as Hell: Right-wing Populism, Fascism, and Apocalyptic Millennialism," paper presented at the 14th World Congress of Sociology (XIVe Congrès Mondial de Sociologie), International Sociological Association, in Montreal, Quebec, Canada, 1998.

\_\_\_\_\_, "The Ideological Weaponry of the American Right: Dangerous Classes and Welfare Queens," (*L'arsenal idéologique de la droite américaine: «classes dangereuses» et «welfare queens»*), paper presented at the international symposium, *The American Model: an Hegemonic Perspective for the End of the Millennium?*, (*Le «modèle américain»: une perspective hégémonique pour la fin du millénaire?*) sponsored by Group Regards Critiques, University of Lausanne, Switzerland, May 12, 1998.

\_\_\_\_\_, "Three Models for Analyzing Conspiracist Mass Movements of the Right," in Eric Ward, ed., *Conspiracies: Real Grievances, Paranoia, and Mass Movements*, (Seattle, Northwest Coalition Against Malicious Harassment [Peanut Butter Publishing], 1996).

<sup>2</sup> The analysis of apocalyptic demonization and millennialism in this paper is drawn primarily from the following sources:

For apocalypticism: Paul Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More: Prophecy Belief in Modern American Culture*, (Cambridge, MA: Belknap/Harvard University Press,

1992); Charles B. Strozier, *Apocalypse: On the Psychology of Fundamentalism in America*, (Boston: Beacon Press, 1994); Stephen O'Leary, *Arguing the Apocalypse: A Theory of Millennial Rhetoric*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994); Robert Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist: The History of an American Obsession*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1995); Philip Lamy, *Millennium Rage: Survivalists, White Supremacists, and the Domsday Prophecy*, (New York: Plenum, 1996); Damian Thompson, *The End of Time: Faith and Fear in the Shadow of the Millennium*. (Great Britain: Sinclair-Stevenson, 1996); Richard K. Fenn, *The End of Time: Religion, Ritual, and the Forging of the Soul*, (Cleveland: Pilgrim Press, 1997).

For Christian critiques of conspiracist apocalypics:

Gregory S. Camp, *Selling Fear: Conspiracy Theories and End-Times Paranoia*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1997); Richard Abanes, *End-Time Visions: The Road to Armageddon?*, (New York: Four Walls Eight Windows, 1998); Tom Sine, *Cease Fire: Searching for Sanity in America's Culture Wars*, (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans, 1995); and Paul T. Coughlin, *Secrets, Plots & Hidden Agendas: What You Don't Know About Conspiracy Theories*, (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1999).

For progressive challenges to apocalyptic thinking: Lee Quinby, *Anti-Apocalypse: Exercise in Geneological Criticism*, (Minneapolis: Univ. of MN Press, 1994); Catherine Keller, *Apocalypse Now and Then: A Feminist Guide to the End of the World*, (Boston: Beacon, 1996).

For apocalyptic demonization: Elaine Pagels, *The Origin of Satan*, (New York: Vintage, 1996); and Norman Cohn, *Cosmos, Chaos and the World to Come: The Ancient Roots of Apocalyptic Faith*, (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993); James A. Aho, *This Thing of Darkness: A Sociology of the Enemy*, (Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press, 1994).

<sup>3</sup> Pagels, *The Origin of Satan*, p. 182.

<sup>4</sup> This can be found in a wide range of sources; see: Gerry O'Sullivan, "The Satanism Scare," *Postmodern Culture* v.1 n.2 (January, 1991); Frances FitzGerald, "The American

Millennium," *The New Yorker*, 11/11/85, pp. 105-196; Grace Halsell, *Prophecy and Politics: Militant Evangelists on the Road to Nuclear War*, (Westport, CT: Lawrence Hill, 1986); Susan Harding, "Imagining the Last Days: The Politics of Apocalyptic Language," in Marty, Martin E. & R. Scott Appleby (eds.); *Accounting for Fundamentalisms*, (The Fundamentalism Project, Volume 4), Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1994; Jeffrey Victor, "The Search for Scapegoat Deviants," *The Humanist*, Sep. /Oct. 1992, pp. 10-13; Leonard Zeskind, "Some Ideas on Conspiracy Theories for a New Historical Period," in Ward, ed., *Conspiracies*; Kathleen M. Blee, "Engendering Conspiracy: Women in Rightist Theories and Movements," in Ward, *Conspiracies*; Evan Harrington, "Conspiracy Theories and Paranoia: Notes from a Mind-Control Conference," *Skeptical Inquirer*, Sept./Oct. 1996, pp. 35-42; Kenneth S. Stern, "Militias and the Religious Right," *Freedom Writer*, IFAS, October 1996; Robert M. Price, "Antichrist Superstar and the Paperback Apocalypse: Rapturous Fiction and Fictitious Rapture," and Nicholas Stix "Apocalypse, Shmapocalypse: You Say You Want a Revolution," in "On the Millennium," *Deolog*, Feb. 1997, online, <<http://www.stealth.net/~deolog/297.html>>.

<sup>5</sup> Lamy, *Millennium Rage*, pp. 86-88.

<sup>6</sup> Chip Berlet, "Three Models for Analyzing Conspiracist Mass Movements of the Right," in Ward, ed., *Conspiracies*.

<sup>7</sup> Richard Hofstadter, "The Paranoid Style in American Politics," in *The Paranoid Style in American Politics and Other Essays* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1965); David Brion Davis, ed., *The Fear of Conspiracy: Images of Un-American Subversion from the Revolution to the Present*, (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1971); Richard O. Curry and Thomas M. Brown, eds., "Introduction," *Conspiracy: The Fear of Subversion in American History*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1972); George Johnson, *Architects of Fear: Conspiracy Theories and Paranoia in American Politics* (Los Angeles: Tarcher/Houghton Mifflin, 1983); and Frank P. Mintz, *The Liberty Lobby and the American Right: Race, Conspiracy, and Culture* (Westport, CT: Greenwood, 1985); David H. Bennett, *The Party of Fear: The American Far Right from Nativism to the Militia Movement*, (New York: Vintage Books, revised 1995, {1988}); Joel Kovel, *Red Hunting in the Promised Land: Anticomunism and the Making of America*, (New York, Basic Books, 1994).

<sup>8</sup> Interview with Holly Sklar, 1998; Holly Sklar, *Chaos or Community: Seeking Solutions, Not Scapegoats for Bad Economics*, (Boston: South End Press, 1995); A similar point is made in Mary E. Kelsey and Mary Thierry Texeira, "Scapegoating at the End of the Millennium: Symbolic Legislation and the Crisis of Capitalism," paper, American Sociological Association, (ASA), San Francisco, 1998.

<sup>9</sup> For ongoing detailed coverage of these diverse forms see the quarterly *Millennial Prophecy Report*, Millennium Watch Institute, POB 34021, Philadelphia, PA 19101-4021.

There are also eclectic apocalyptic sects. Such groups can turn inward such as the Heaven's Gate group suicides which flowed from a mixture of Biblical prophesy, the ancient predictions of Nostradamus,

and science fiction. The Order of the Solar Temple imploded with group suicides in Canada, France and Switzerland. Sometimes groups turn outward, such as the Aum Shinrikyo sect which exploded with a gas attack on the Tokyo subway; see: Thompson, *The End Of Time*; Jeffrey Kaplan, *Radical Religion in America: Millenarian Movements from the Far Right to the Children of Noah*, (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 1997).

Useful introductory anthologies are: Thomas Robbins and Susan J. Palmer, eds., *Millennium, Messiahs, and Mayhem: Contemporary Apocalyptic Movements*, (New York: Routledge, 1997); and, Charles B. Strozier and Michael Flynn, *The Year 2000: Essays on the End*, (New York: NYU Press, 1997).

For handy guides, see Robert G. Clouse, Robert N. Hosack, and Richard V. Pierard, *The New Millennium Manual: A Once and Future Guide*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1999); and Stephen Jay Gould, *Questioning the Millennium: A Rationalist's Guide to a Precisely Arbitrary Countdown*, (New York: Harmony Books, 1997). See also "On the Millennium," a collection of articles in *Deolog*, Feb. 1997, online, <<http://www.stealth.net/~deolog/297.html>>.

Discussions at the Center for Millennial Studies in 1998 have focused on the following topics: Authorities in Israel are making plans for dealing with devout Christians expected to flock to Jerusalem and other sites to await (or perhaps encourage) the second coming of Christ. Apocalyptic Christians, Muslims, and Jews covet the Temple Mount. Messianic Jews are looking for the flawless "red heifer" of ancient prophecy.

<sup>10</sup> See: Mike A. Males *The Scapegoat Generation: America's War on Adolescents*; (Monroe, ME, Common Courage Press, 1996) *To Reclaim a Legacy of Diversity: Analyzing the 'Political Correctness' Debates in Higher Education*, (Washington, DC: National Council for Research on Women, 1993); and Ellen Messer-Davidow "Manufacturing the Attack on Liberalized Higher Education," *Social Text*, Fall 1993, pp. 40-80; Mary E. Kelsey and Mary Thierry Texeira, "Scapegoating at the End of the Millennium: Symbolic Legislation and the Crisis of Capitalism," paper, ASA, San Francisco, 1998.

<sup>11</sup> Conversations with Landes, 1997-98, based on his working papers for the Center for Millennial Studies.

<sup>12</sup> Chip Berlet, "Who's Mediating the Storm? Right-wing Alternative Information Networks," in Linda Kintz & Julia Lesage, eds., *Culture, Media, and the Religious Right* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1998).

<sup>13</sup> Sara Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare: The Politics of the Christian Right*, (Boston: South End Press, 1989), pp. 23-25, 130-141; 231-232; Diamond, *Roads to Dominion: Right-Wing Movements and Political Power in the United States*, (New York: Guilford, 1995), pp. 161-177, 228-256; David Cantor, *The Religious Right*, (New York: Anti-Defamation League, 1994), pp. 22-24, 71-73, 119-129, 151-153; Fred Clarkson, *Eternal Hostility: The Struggle Between Theocracy and*

- Democracy*, (Monroe, ME: Common Courage, 1997), pp. 125–138; Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 40–190; Lamy, *Millennium Rage*, pp. 26–30, 63–157, 193–252.
- <sup>14</sup> Tim LaHaye, *Revelation: Illustrated and Made Plain*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervon, 1975). p. 9.
- <sup>15</sup> David G. Bromley, “Constructing Apocalypticism,” pp. 31–45; and, Catherine Wessinger, “Millennialism With and Without the Mayhem,” pp. 47–59; both in Robbins & Palmer, eds., *Millennium, Messiahs, and Mayhem*.
- <sup>16</sup> See generally, Cohn, *Cosmos, Chaos and the World to Come*.
- <sup>17</sup> Strozier, *Apocalypse*, pp. 223–248; John M. Bozeman, “Technological Millenarianism in the United States,” in Robbins & Palmer, eds., *Millennium, Messiahs, and Mayhem*; See also, *Millennial Prophecy Report*, April 1996, pp. 4–20.
- <sup>18</sup> In Protestantism the text has been called the book of “Revelation,” *New International Version of the Holy Bible* [Protestant “NIV” version] (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Bible Publishers, 1984 [1973]); and “The Revelation of St. John the Divine,” *The Holy Bible: King James Version* (Iowa Falls, Iowa: World Bible Publishers, 1986). In Catholicism, it has been called “The Apocalypse of St. John the Apostle,” *New Catholic Edition of the Holy Bible*, Confraternity of Christian Doctrine Edition, (New York: Catholic Book Publishing Company, 1957); and “The Revelation to John,” *The Catholic Study Bible: New American Bible*, Confraternity of Christian Doctrine Edition, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990). The changes in the more recent versions reflect newer scholarship that disputes that John of Patmos was the apostle John.
- <sup>19</sup> Lamy, *Millennium Rage*, p.36.
- <sup>20</sup> *Ibid.*, p.37.
- <sup>21</sup> George Johnson, *Fire in the Mind: Science, Faith, and the Search for Order*, (New York: Knopf, 1995), pp. 308–313.
- <sup>22</sup> Norman Cohn, *The Pursuit of the Millennium*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1970 {1957}).
- <sup>23</sup> Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More*, pp. 80–85.
- <sup>24</sup> Gould, *Questioning the Millennium*. Gould also examines the difference between “millenarian” groups and “millennial” expectation.
- <sup>25</sup> John Yemma, “Countdown to Catastrophe: Doomsday Visions Abound as Millennium Approaches,” *Boston Sunday Globe*, December 29, 1996, p. 1, 20–21. Citing Research by Richard Landes of Boston University and Charles B. Strozier, professor of history at John Jay College in New York.
- <sup>26</sup> Michael Barkun, “Politics and Apocalypticism,” in Stephen J. Stein (ed.), *The Encyclopedia of Apocalypticism*, volume 3, (New York: Continuum, 1998), pp. 442–60.
- <sup>27</sup> Stephen D. O’Leary, “Heaven’s Gate and the Culture of Popular Millennialism,” *Millennial Stew* (newsletter of the Center for Millennial Studies) Winter 1998, p. 1, 3–5. Nostradamus was a sixteenth century prophet who utilized astrological charts and visions to write a pre–history of the world making predictions about events centuries in advance. The text, written in quatrains, is obscure and ambiguous. There are many published commentaries claiming to unravel their meaning. One major prediction was the arrival of a great comet. His predictions do not go beyond the year 2000. On renewed popularity of Nostradamus, see, for example: Henry C. Roberts, translated, edited, and interpreted, (updated by Robert Lawrence), *The Complete Prophecies of Nostradamus*, (New York: Crown, 1994 {1947}); Stefan Paulus, *Nostradamus 1999: Who Will Survive [A Comet is Hurling Toward Earth...]*, (St. Paul, MN: Llewellyn Publications, 1997); and Jean–Charles de Fontbrune, *Nostradamus: Countdown to Apocalypse*, (New York: Henry Holt, 1985 {1980}). A contemporary version of the comet prophecy is Tom Kay, *When the Comet Runs: Prophecies for the New Millennium*, (Charlottesville, VA: Hampton Roads, 1997).
- <sup>28</sup> Milton William Cooper, *Behold a Pale Horse*, (Sedona, AZ: Light Technology Publishing, 1991).
- <sup>29</sup> Quinby, *Anti–Apocalypse*, p. 162.
- <sup>30</sup> See: in the Old Testament, Isaiah 10: 1–4. That religion can oppose the *status quo* or seek liberation from oppression is often overlooked or disputed. For a discussion of this, see Christian Smith, ed., *Disruptive Religion: The Force of Faith in Social Movement Activism*, (New York: Routledge, 1997), especially pp. 29–46, 67–144.
- <sup>31</sup> Perry Bush, “Prophetic Anger: the lingering power of evangelical populism,” *Sojourners* magazine, Jan./Feb. 1997, pp. 34–37.
- <sup>32</sup> Daniel Berrigan, *Ezekiel: Vision in the Dust*, (Maryknoll, New York: Orbis Books, 1997).
- <sup>33</sup> René Girard, *The Scapegoat*, (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1986).
- <sup>34</sup> Frequently people of faith are described in patronizing caricature or dismissed as ignorant, irrational, or even mentally ill. The almost careless bigotry and stereotyping of many liberal and left commentators is objectionable on both moral and practical grounds. There has been a tendency among social scientists to overlook the influence of sincere and devout religious belief on political action. In recent years, a number of researchers have attempted to seriously analyze religiously–motivated social movements, and I have tended to emphasize their work in this section. See: Harvey Cox, “The Warring Visions of the Religious Right,” *Atlantic Monthly*, Nov. 1995, pp. 59–69.
- <sup>35</sup> Peter J. Gomes, *The Good Book: Reading the Bible with Heart and Mind*, (New York: William Morrow, 1996), pp. 4–52, 129–135, 161–162, 246–250, 348–353.
- <sup>36</sup> Gregory S. Camp, *Selling Fear: Conspiracy Theories and End–Times Paranoia*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1997), p. 190.
- <sup>37</sup> Bruce Barron, “A Summary Critique,” *Christian Research Journal*, Winter 1993, pp. 44–45. There are many other examples. Gerry Rough’s website, *In Pursuit of Reason*, is a Christian critique of conspiracism, especially, “Introduction: The Rise of the Modern Conspiracy Theory Movement,” online, <<http://www.skyenet.net/~gerryr/index.html>>; Rough suggests four reasons for the growth of the current “conspiracy theory movement:” the “socio–political movements of the 1960’s and 1970’s, the development of the conspiracy theory movement itself, the modern prophecy movement within the Christian church, the technological development of the Internet.” Another Christian critique of

- conspiracism is the article “Christians & Conspiracy Theories: A Call to Repentance,” online, <<http://www.best.com/~vandruuff/conspire.html>>. See also: Tom Shine, “Suspicious of Conspiracy: How a Spirit of Fear can Distort Scripture and History,” *Sojourners*, July–Aug, 1995.
- <sup>38</sup> Paul T. Coughlin, *Secrets, Plots & Hidden Agendas: What You Don't Know About Conspiracy Theories*, (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1999).
- <sup>39</sup> Tim Callahan, *Bible Prophecy: Failure or Fulfillment?*, (Altadena, CA: Millennium Press, 1997).
- <sup>40</sup> James A. Aho, *This Thing of Darkness: A Sociology of the Enemy*, (Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press, 1994). “A Phenomenology of the Enemy,” pp. 107–121.
- <sup>41</sup> Sir James George Frazier, *The Golden Bough: A Study in Magic and Religion*, Abridged, (New York: MacMillan, 1922), pp. 624–686. for a comprehensive treatment of the process and social function of scapegoating in historic persecution texts of myth and religion, see: René Girard, *The Scapegoat*, (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1986).
- <sup>42</sup> Gordon W. Allport, *Nature of Prejudice*, (Cambridge, MA: Addison–Wesley, 1954), p. 244.
- <sup>43</sup> Landes, “Scapegoating,” *Encyclopedia of Social History*, Peter N. Stearn, ed., (New York: Garland Pub. Inc., 1994), p. 659. Neumann has argued against using the term scapegoating when discussing conspiracist movements, but I support the Landes’ definition; Franz Neumann, “Anxiety in Politics,” in Richard O. Curry and Thomas M. Brown, eds., *Conspiracy: The Fear of Subversion in American History*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1972), p. 255.
- <sup>44</sup> For an interesting approach linking Jungian psychology to interventions against scapegoating in dysfunctional small organizations and groups, see Arthur D. Colman, *Up From Scapegoating: Awakening Consciousness in Groups*, (Wilmette, IL: Chiron, 1995).
- <sup>45</sup> Conversation with Susan M. Fisher, M. D. clinical professor of psychiatry of Univ. of Chicago Medical School and Faculty, Chicago Institute for Psychoanalysis, (1997).
- <sup>46</sup> Michael Billig, *Fascists: A Social Psychological View of the National Front*, (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1978), pp. 313–316.
- <sup>47</sup> See discussions in Jaroslav Krejčí, “Neo–Fascism—West and East,” in Luciano Cheles, Ronnie Ferguson, and Michalina Vaughan, eds. *The Far Right in Western and Eastern Europe*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edition, (New York: Longman Publishing, 1995), pp. 2–3; David Norman Smith; “The Social Construction of Enemies: Jews and the Representation of Evil,” *Sociological Theory*, 14:3, Nov. 1996, pp. 203–240; Billig, *Fascists*, pp. 296–350; Elisabeth Young–Bruehl, *The Anatomy of Prejudices*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1996), pp. 163–339. An excellent review of the psycho–social aspects of authoritarianism and the Frankfurt school theories is in *Social Thought & Research*, 1998, 21:1&2.
- <sup>48</sup> Gordon W. Allport, “Demagogy,” in Richard O. Curry and Thomas M. Brown, eds., *Conspiracy: The Fear of Subversion in American History*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1972), pp. 263–276.
- <sup>49</sup> Davis, *The Fear of Conspiracy*, pp. xiv–xv, 1.
- <sup>50</sup> Although they often disagree with my conclusions, my thinking on conspiracism has been shaped by comments and critiques from S. L. Gardiner, Loretta Ross, Leonard Zeskind, Devin Burghart, and Robert Crawford.
- <sup>51</sup> Davis, *The Fear of Conspiracy*, pp. xv–xvi.
- <sup>52</sup> Mintz, *Liberty Lobby*, p. 199.
- <sup>53</sup> O’Leary, *Arguing the Apocalypse*, pp. 20–60.
- <sup>54</sup> Zeskind, “Some Ideas on Conspiracy Theories,” p. 16. See also: pp. 11, 13–15, 16–17.
- <sup>55</sup> *Ibid.*, 13–14.
- <sup>56</sup> S. L. Gardiner, “Social Movements, Conspiracy Theories and Economic Determinism: A Response to Chip Berlet,” in Ward, *Conspiracies*, p. 83.
- <sup>57</sup> Conversation with Herman Sinaiko, Professor of Humanities, University of Chicago, (1997).
- <sup>58</sup> On growing right/left conspiracism, see Michael Kelly, “The Road to Paranoia,” *The New Yorker*, June 19, 1995, pp. 60–70; Janet Biehl, “Militia Fever: The Fallacy of ‘Neither Left nor Right,’” *Green Perspectives, A Social Ecology Publication*, Number 37, April 1996; Michael Albert, “Conspiracy?...Not!,” *Venting Spleen* column, *Z Magazine*, Jan., 1992, pp. 17–19; Michael Albert, “Conspiracy?...Not, Again,” *Venting Spleen* column, *Z Magazine*, May, 1992, pp. 86–88; See also: the special issue on “Conspiracy,” *Skeptic*, Vol. 4, No. 3, 1996; and Jodi Dean, *Aliens in America: Conspiracy Cultures from Outerspace to Cyberspace*, (Ithaca NY: Cornell University Press, 1998).
- <sup>59</sup> Kintz & Lesage, *Culture, Media, and the Religious Right*. Detailed articles on the general theme of right–wing media can be found in *Afterimage* (Visual Studies Workshop, Rochester, NY), special issue on “Fundamentalist Media,” 22:7&8, Feb./March 1995; and *Extra!* (Fairness and Accuracy in Reporting), special issue on “The Right–Wing Media Machine,” March/April 1995. Jim Danky and John Cherney, “Beyond Limbaugh: The Hard Right’s Publishing Spectrum,” *Reference Services Review*, Spring 1996, pp. 43–56.
- For radio conspiracism, see Leslie Jorgensen, “AM Armies,” pp. 20–22 and Larry Smith, “Hate Talk,” p. 23, *Extra!* March/April 1995; Marc Cooper, “The Paranoid Style,” *The Nation*, April 10, 1995, pp. 486–492; William H. Freivogel, “Talking Tough On 300 Radio Stations, Chuck Harder’s Show Airs Conspiracy Theories,” *St. Louis Post Dispatch*, May 10, 1995, p. 5B; Brian E. Albrecht, “Hate Speech,” *The Plain Dealer* (Cleveland), June 11, 1995, pp. 1, 16–17; David McHugh and Nancy Costello, “Radio host off the air; militia chief may be out,” *Detroit Free Press*, 4/29/95, p. 6A; James Latham, “The Rise of Far Right/Hate Programming on the Shortwave Bands,” *Vista*, the Newsletter of Radio for Peace International, October 1994, pp. 2–4, find Far Right Radio Review online at <<http://www.clark.net/pub/cwilkins/rfpi/frwr.html>>.
- For Internet, see: Devin Burghart, “Cyber@te: A Reappraisal,” *The Dignity Report* (Coalition for Human Dignity), Fall, 1996, pp. 12–16; David Futrelle, “CyberHate,” *In These Times*, May 15, 1995, p. 17;

- Wayne Madsen, "The Battle for Cyberspace: Spooks v. Civil Liberties and Social Unrest," *CovertAction Quarterly*, Winter 1996–97; Todd J. Schroer, "White Racialists, Computers, and the Internet," paper, ASA, Toronto, 1997. A regularly updated list of links to web pages of various groups on the right is posted by Political Research Associates. at <[http://www.publiceye.org/lmk\\_dem.html](http://www.publiceye.org/lmk_dem.html)> and by Hatewatch at <<http://hatewatch.org>>.
- <sup>60</sup> Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 56–61, 63.
- <sup>61</sup> Carol F. Karlsen, *The Devil in the Shape of a Woman: Witchcraft in Colonial New England*, (New York: W. W. Norton, 1998), pp. 46–116.
- <sup>62</sup> Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 5, 31.
- <sup>63</sup> Paul Caras, *The History of the Devil and the Idea of Evil*, (New York: Gramercy/Random House, 1996 [1900]), p. 280.
- <sup>64</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 282.
- <sup>65</sup> Cohn, *The Pursuit of the Millennium*, especially pp. 144–147, 163–169.
- <sup>66</sup> Caras, *The History of the Devil*, p. 306; See also Peter Stanford, *The Devil: A Biography*, (New York: Henry Holt, 1996).
- <sup>67</sup> Pagels, *The Origin of Satan*, p. xviii.
- <sup>68</sup> Cohn, *The Pursuit of the Millennium*, pp. 77–78.
- <sup>69</sup> Norman Cohn, *Warrant for Genocide: The Myth of the Jewish World Conspiracy and the Protocols of the Elders of Zion*, (London: Serif, 1996 [1967]), pp. 2–3.
- <sup>70</sup> Caras, *The History of the Devil*, pp. 306–307. When some Freemasons constructed a history linking their order to the Knights Templar, they inherited the charges of satanic conspiracy.
- <sup>71</sup> Henry Charles Lea, *The Inquisition of the Middle Ages*, abridged, (New York: Macmillan, 1961), pp. 687–767.
- <sup>72</sup> R. Po-chia Hsia, *The Myth of Ritual Murder: Jews and Magic in Reformation Germany*, (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1988); Heiko A. Oberman, *The Roots of Anti-Semitism: In the Age of Renaissance and Reformation*, translated by James I. Porter, (Philadelphia: Fortress Press, 1984, {German edition 1981}).
- <sup>73</sup> Andrew Gow, lecture, "Jewish Shock—Troops of the Apocalypse," Center for Millennial Studies symposium, "The Apocalyptic Other," November, 1997.
- <sup>74</sup> Oberman, *The Roots of Anti-Semitism*, pp. 118–122. Pagels, *Origins of Satan*, p. 180; for additional background on Christian anti-Semitism, see Frederic Cople Jaher, *A Scapegoat in the New Wilderness: The Origins and Rise of Anti-Semitism in America*, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1994), pp. 13–82; Leonard Dinnerstein, *Anti-Semitism in America*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1994), p. 3–34; Pagels, *The Origins of Satan*, p. xx; Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 40–73; Jerome A. Chanes, *Antisemitism in America Today: Outspoken Experts Explode the Myths*, (New York: Birch Lane Press/Carol Publishing, 1995).
- <sup>75</sup> A good short summary of the Illuminati/Freemason and Protocols conspiracies and their role in the contemporary racist right can be found in James Ridgeway, *Blood in the Face* (New York: Thunder's Mouth Press, 1990). On the Illuminati Freemasons, see Davis, *The Fear of Conspiracy*, pp. 9–22; Hofstadter, *The Paranoid Style*, pp. 10–18; Bennett, *The Party of Fear*, pp. 22–26, 48–51; George Johnson, *Architects of Fear: Conspiracy Theories and Paranoia in American Politics* (Los Angeles: Tarcher/Houghton Mifflin, 1983), pp. 31–84. On the Protocols, see Cohn, *Warrant for Genocide*.
- <sup>76</sup> Davis, *The Fear of Conspiracy*, pp. 9–22; Hofstadter, *The Paranoid Style*, pp. 10–18; Bennett, *The Party of Fear*, pp. 22–26, 48–51.
- <sup>77</sup> Johnson, *Architects of Fear*, pp. 31–84.
- <sup>78</sup> John Robison, *Proofs of a Conspiracy—against All the Religions and Governments of Europe, carried on in the secret meetings of Freemasons, Illuminati and Reading Societies*, fourth edition with postscript, (Boston: Western Islands, 1967 [1798]).
- <sup>79</sup> Abbé Augustin Barruel, *Memoirs Illustrating the History of Jacobinism*, second edition revised and corrected, English translation by Robert Clifford, reprinted in one volume, (Fraser, MI: Real-View-Books, 1995 [1797–98]).
- <sup>80</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 396; Robison, *Proofs*, pp. 11–56; Johnson, *Architects of Fear*, pp. 43–50.
- <sup>81</sup> Robison, *Proofs*, p. 9.
- <sup>82</sup> Robison's first edition appeared as Barruel's third volume, first edition, was going to press; but Robison had not yet seen Barruel's work. In their second editions, both author's acknowledge the other, and Barruel engages in some criticisms of Robison informal treatment of quotes. See Barruel, *Memoirs Illustrating the History of Jacobinism*, pp.396–398.
- <sup>83</sup> Barruel, *Memoirs*, p. 185.
- <sup>84</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 780.
- <sup>85</sup> Robison, *Proofs*, pp. 57, 272–273.
- <sup>86</sup> Bennett, *The Party of Fear*, pp. 22–26.
- <sup>87</sup> Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 96–100. Bennett, *The Party of Fear*, pp. 35–53. For an example of mid-1850s anti-Catholic Propaganda, see E. Hutchinson, *Startling Facts for the Know Nothings*, (New York, self-published, 1855).
- <sup>88</sup> Cohn, *Warrant for Genocide*, pp. 25–45.
- <sup>89</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 84–117; Konrad Heiden, *Der Fuehrer: Hitler's Rise to Power*, (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1944), pp. 1–10.
- <sup>90</sup> Cohn, *Warrant for Genocide*, pp. 302–306.
- <sup>91</sup> Curtiss, *Appraisal*, pp. 32–60; Cohn, *Warrant*, pp. 66–83; Walter Laqueur, *Black Hundred: The Rise of the Extreme Right in Russia*, (New York: HarperPerennial, 1993), pp. 29–44. Curtiss provides an appendix with many sample paragraphs illustrating "parallels between passages from Joly's *Dialogue* and the *Protocols* as given in Nilus...." Comparisons that demonstrated the plagiarism first appeared in a London newspaper. Cohn appends a similar but more complete analysis. Laqueur's translation of the title as "The Big in the Small" is more intuitively useful than the typical "The Great in the Little."
- <sup>92</sup> Johnson, *Architects of Fear*, pp. 32–43. One of the most comprehensive discussions of conspiracist theories throughout history, albeit in fictional form, is contained in the novel by Umberto Eco, *Foucault's Pendulum*, (New York: Ballantine Books, 1990).

- <sup>93</sup> Based on several different translations of the *Protocols of the Learned Elders of Zion* under a variety of names, on file at PRA, primarily, Victor E. Mardsen, *The Protocols of Zion*, “Translated from the Russian Text,” (Britain: 1934). Republished by Ford’s *Dearborn Independent*, with full inside title: *The Protocols of the Meetings of the Learned Elders of Zion with Preface and Explanatory Notes*.
- <sup>94</sup> Walter Laquer, *Russia and Germany*, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1990 [1965]), chapter 4–6. On how the *Protocols* went from Russia to Germany, see: Heiden, *Der Fuehrer*, pp. 18–22.
- <sup>95</sup> Cohn, *Warrant*, pp. 167–168.
- <sup>96</sup> *Ibid.* p. 169.
- <sup>97</sup> Laqueur, *Black Hundred*, pp. 34, 205, 208–209.
- <sup>98</sup> Interview with Landes, 1998.
- <sup>99</sup> George Marsden, *Understanding Fundamentalism and Evangelicalism*. (Grand Rapids, MI: William B. Eerdmans Pub. Co., 1991.), pp. 9–61. Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 108–133.
- <sup>100</sup> Joel Kovel, *Red Hunting in the Promised Land: Anticommunism and the Making of America*, (New York, Basic Books, 1994).
- <sup>101</sup> William Preston, Jr., *Aliens and Dissenters: Federal Suppression of Radicals, 1903–1933*, (New York: Harper Torchbooks, 1963).
- <sup>102</sup> Frank Donner, *Age*, pp. 47–48.
- <sup>103</sup> Nesta H. Webster, *World Revolution: The Plot Against Civilization*, (London: Constable, 1921); \_\_\_\_\_, *Secret Societies and Subversive Movements* (London: Boswell Printing, 1924); \_\_\_\_\_, *The French Revolution*, (Orig. pub., 1919). Republished by Noon Tide Press, 1988. For this and other such works, see Singerman, *Antisemitic Propaganda*.
- <sup>104</sup> Singerman, *Antisemitic Propaganda*, entry 0101, p. 29, citing Colin Holmes, *Anti-Semitism in British Society, 1876–1939*, (New York: Holmes and Meier, 1979), pp. 147–150; Cohn, *Warrant for Genocide*, pp. 168–170.
- <sup>105</sup> Mintz, *Liberty Lobby*, pp. 17–22; Father Denis Fahey’s *The Mystical Body of Christ in the Modern World*, (Dublin: Browne and Nolan, 1935); Gertrude Coogan’s *Money Creators: Who Creates Money? Who Should Create It?*, (Chicago: Sound Money Press, 1935).
- <sup>106</sup> Mintz, *Liberty Lobby*, p. 17.
- <sup>107</sup> Ribuffo, *Old Christian Right*, pp. 16–17, 167, 196–197, 211; Bennett, *Party of Fear*, p. 269.
- <sup>108</sup> Elizabeth Dilling, *The Red Network: A “Who’s Who” and Handbook of Radicalism for Patriots*, (Chicago: self-published, 1934); Elizabeth Dilling, *The Roosevelt Red Record and its Background*, (Chicago: self-published, 1936). See also: excerpt from Dilling’s *The Roosevelt Red Record and its Background*, in Davis, *Fear of Conspiracy*, pp. 273–276; human rights activist Susan DeCamp traced some current conspiracist theories circulating in Montana and other Rocky Mountain states back to Dilling’s books at a workshop presentation, “Conspiracy, Identity & the Religious Right,” Northwest Coalition Against Malicious Harassment symposium, October 1998.
- <sup>109</sup> *New Dealers in Office*, (Indianapolis: The Fellowship Press, circa 1941); for background on popular anti-Semitism during this period, see Dinnerstein, pp. 105–149.
- <sup>110</sup> Ribuffo, *The Old Christian Right*, pp. 2–24, 58–72, 83–116, 175–177.
- <sup>111</sup> Chart from William Dudley Pelley’s *Liberation*, 8/21/38; as cited in Singerman, *Antisemitic Propaganda*, p. xxx.
- <sup>112</sup> Mintz, *The Liberty Lobby*, pp. 47–64; Johnson, *Architects of Fear*, pp. 78–80, 135–136.
- <sup>113</sup> Emanuel M. Josephson, *Rockefeller: ‘Internationalist’: The Man Who Misrules the World*. (New York: Chedney Press, 1952). See Mintz, *Liberty Lobby*, pp. 61–64, 82–83. See also Ed Merta, “Birth of a Conspiracy Theory,” unpublished paper following the trail of the conspiracist view of the Council on Foreign Relations. On file at PRA.
- <sup>114</sup> Dan Smoot, *The Invisible Government*. (Boston and Los Angeles: Western Islands, 1962).
- <sup>115</sup> Mary M. Davison, *The Secret Government of the United States*, (Omaha, Nebraska: The Greater Nebraskan, 1962), pp. 1–5. For a study of the role of women in battling globalism, see Abby Scher, *Cold War on the Home Front: Middle Class Women’s Politics in the 1950s*, doctoral thesis, sociology, New School for Social Research, 1995.
- <sup>116</sup> Phyllis Schlafly, *A Choice Not An Echo* (Alton, IL: Pere Marquette Press, 1964), pp. 111–121.
- <sup>117</sup> Carroll Quigley, *Tragedy and Hope: A History of the World in Our Time*, republished by GSG Associates, (New York: MacMillan, 1966); Mintz, *Liberty Lobby*, pp. 145–146.
- <sup>118</sup> Cleon Skousen *The Naked Capitalist*, (Salt Lake City, UT: self published/Reviewer, 1970). Skousen’s subtitle is, *A Review and Commentary on Dr. Carroll Quigley’s Book: Tragedy and Hope—A History of the World in Our Time*. Gary Allen with Larry Abraham, *None Dare Call It Conspiracy*, paperback edition, (Rossmor, CA & Seal Beach, CA: Concord Press, 1972); reissued revised in hardcover: Gary Allen and Larry Abraham, *None Dare Call It Conspiracy*, (Seattle, WA: Double A Publications, 1983); revised and expanded as sequel: Larry Abraham, *Call it Conspiracy*, (Seattle, WA: Double A Publications, 1985). The latter book featured a prologue by Christian Reconstructionist Gary North.
- <sup>119</sup> See, for example, Phoebe Courtney, *Beware Metro and Regional Government!* (Littleton, CO: The Independent American Newspaper, 1973).
- <sup>120</sup> Mary M. Davison, *The Profound Revolution*, (Omaha, Nebraska: The Greater Nebraskan, 1966), pp 1–18, 26–28, 84, 86–87. Davidson went on to form the Council for Statehood, similar in ideology to the Committee of the States.
- <sup>121</sup> Mary M. Davison, *Twentieth Century Snow Job*, (Lighthouse Point, FL: Council for Statehood, circa 1970).
- <sup>122</sup> Dennis King, *Lyndon LaRouche and the New American Fascism* (New York: Doubleday, 1989), p. 282.
- <sup>123</sup> One book mixes the themes: Eustace Mullins, *The Federal Reserve Conspiracy*, second edition, (Union, NJ: Christian Educational Association, 1954). See also: Eustace Mullins, *Mullins on the Federal Reserve*, (New York: Kaspar and Horton, 1952); Eustace Mullins, *The World Order: Our Secret Rulers*, second edition, (Staunton, VA: Ezra Pound Institute of

- Civilization, 1992); Eustace Mullins, *The Secret Holocaust* (Word of Christ Mission, no date). See also: listings on Mullins in Robert Singerman, *Antisemitic Propaganda: An Annotated Bibliography and Research Guide*, (New York: Garland Publishing, 1982), including, Eustace Mullins, *The Biological Jew*, (Staunton, VA: Faith and Service Books, ca. 1968); Eustace Mullins, "Jews Mass Poison American Children," *Women's Voice* (Chicago), June 1955, p. 11; Eustace Mullins, *Impeach Eisenhower!* (Chicago, Women's Voice, ca. 1955).
- <sup>124</sup> Chip Berlet, "Cardinal Mindszenty: heroic anti-communist or anti-Semite or both?," *The St. Louis Journalism Review*, April, 1988.
- <sup>125</sup> See for example the implicit anti-Black prejudice in, Alan Stang, *It's Very Simple: The True Story of Civil Rights*, (Boston: Western Islands, 1965), especially pp.209–214.
- <sup>126</sup> Mintz, *Liberty Lobby*, pp. 59–61; *The Noontide Press*, book catalogs, 1989 and 1995. Phyllis Schlafly's *A Choice, Not an Echo*, echoes Carr's conspiracist view of the Bilderberger symposiums, but without the overt anti-Semitism.
- <sup>127</sup> Kenneth Goff, *One World a Red World*, pamphlet, (Colorado: self-published, 1952), pp. 56–57, 62.
- <sup>128</sup> Kenneth Goff, *Reds Promote Racial War*, pamphlet, (Colorado: self-published [Soldiers of the Cross], 1958), pp. 13–16, 25–33.
- <sup>129</sup> Gordon Lindsay, *Will the Antichrist Come Out of Russia?*, (Dallas: Voice of Healing Publications, 1966), inside cover.
- <sup>130</sup> Dr. W. S. McBirnie, *The Real Power Behind Communism*, pamphlet, (Glendale, CA: Center for American Research and Education, n.d., circa 1968), p. 15.
- <sup>131</sup> John Stormer, *The Death of a Nation*, (Florissant, MO: Liberty Bell Press, 1968), pp. 152–174.
- <sup>132</sup> John Stormer, *None Dare Call It Treason*, (Florissant, Missouri: Liberty Bell Press, 1964); on religious renewal experience, see "About the Author," page preceding the table of contents.
- <sup>133</sup> Gary H. Kah, *En Route to Global Occupation* (Lafayette, LA: Huntington House Publishers, 1991); Pat Robertson, *The New World Order: It Will Change the Way You Live*, (Dallas: Word Publishing, 1991); Donald S. McAlvany, *Toward a New World Order, The Countdown to Armageddon*, Oklahoma City, OK: Hearthstone Publishing/Southwest Radio Church of the Air, 1990); Dee Zahner, *The Secret Side of History: Mystery Babylon and the New World Order*, (Hesperia, CA: LTAA Communications, 1994); Dave Hunt, *Global Peace and the Rise of the Antichrist*, videotape, (Dave Hunt, 1990); "What's Behind the New World Order," booklet, (Jemison, AL: Inspiration Books Est, 1991).
- <sup>134</sup> Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More*, p. 312.
- <sup>135</sup> Portions of this section first appeared in "Three Models for Analyzing Conspiracist Mass Movements of the Right," in Ward, *Conspiracies*.
- <sup>136</sup> Richard Hofstadter, *The Age of Reform: From Bryan to F. D. R.* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, Inc., Random House, Inc., 1955); Richard Hofstadter, *Anti-Intellectualism in American Life*. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1963); Arnold Forster and Benjamin R. Epstein, *Danger on the Right*. (New York: Random House, 1964); Daniel Bell, ed., *The Radical Right: The New American Right Expanded And Updated*, (Garden City, NY: Anchor Books, Doubleday & Company, Inc., 1964); Richard Hofstadter, "The Paranoid Style in American Politics," in *The Paranoid Style in American Politics and Other Essays* (New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 1965); Seymour Martin Lipset and Earl Raab, *The Politics of Unreason: Right-Wing Extremism in America, 1790–1970* (New York: Harper & Row, Publishers, 1970).
- Transitional works would include: Donald I. Warren, *The Radical Center: Middle Americans and the Politics of Alienation*, (Notre Dame, IN: University of Notre Dame Press, 1976); and William H. Riker, *Liberalism Against Populism: A Confrontation Between the Theory of Democracy and the Theory of Social Choice*, (Prospect Heights, IL: Waveland Press, 1988 {1982}).
- <sup>137</sup> For criticism of the original academic idea that a conspiracist "radical right" is somehow far outside the electoral system (called centrist/extremist theory or the pluralist school), see Michael Rogin, *The Intellectuals and McCarthy: The Radical Specter*, (Cambridge, MA: MIT Press, 1967), pp. 261–282; Curry and Brown, eds., "Introduction," *Conspiracy*, pp. vii–xi; Ribuffo, *The Old Christian Right*, pp. 237–257; Margaret Canovan, *Populism* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1981), pp. 46–51 179–190; Jerome L. Himmelstein, *To The Right: The Transformation of American Conservatism*, (Berkeley: Univ. of California Press, 1990), pp. 1–5, 72–76, 152–164. Diamond, *Roads to Dominion*, pp. 5–6, 40–41; Michael Kazin, *The Populist Persuasion: An American History*, (New York: Basic Books, 1995), pp. 190–193; William B. Hixson, Jr., *Search for the American Right Wing: An Analysis of the Social Science Record, 1955–1987*, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992), pp. 10–48, 77–123, 273–292; }).
- See also: Michael P. Federici, *The Challenge of Populism: The Rise of Right-Wing Democratism in Postwar America*, (New York: Praeger, 1991); and, Allen D. Hertzke, *Echoes of Discontent: Jesse Jackson, Pat Robertson, and the Resurgence of Populism*, (Washington, DC: Congressional Quarterly Press, 1993).
- For statistical data that refutes claims made by centrist/extremist theory about the social base of the "radical right," see Rogin, *The Intellectuals and McCarthy*; Fred W. Grupp, Jr., "The Political Perspectives of Birch Society Members;" and James McEvoy, III, "Conservatism or Extremism: Goldwater Supporters in the 1964 Presidential Election;" both in Robert A. Schoenberger, ed., *The American Right Wing: Readings in Political Behavior*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart & Winston, 1969); and Charles Jeffrey Kraft, *A Preliminary Socio-Economic & State Demographic Profile of the John Birch Society*, (Cambridge, MA: Political Research Associates, 1992). See also: Diamond: "How 'Radical' Is the Christian Right?" *The Humanist*, (Watch on the Right column), March/April 1994.

- <sup>138</sup> For an introduction to various contemporary academic views, see: Aldon D. Morris and Carol McClung Mueller, eds., *Frontiers in Social Movement Theory*, (New Haven, CT: Yale University Press, 1992); and Sidney Tarrow, *Power in Movement: Social Movements, Collective Action and Politics*, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994); John Lofland, *Social Movement Organizations: Guide to Research on Insurgent Realities*, (New York: Aldine de Gruyter, 1996).  
See also: Carl Boggs, *Social Movements and Political Power: Emerging Forms of Radicalism in the West*, (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1986); and Bert Klandermans, *The Social Psychology of Protest*, (Oxford: Blackwell, 1997).
- <sup>138</sup> Christian Smith, "Correcting a Curious Neglect, or Bringing Religion Back In," in Christian Smith, ed., *Disruptive Religion: The Force of Faith in Social-Movement Activism*, (New York: Routledge, 1996), p.3.
- <sup>139</sup> Sara Diamond: "How 'Radical' Is the Christian Right?" *The Humanist*, (Watch on the Right column), March/April 1994; Diamond, Opposition Research Column, "Shifting Alliances on the Right," *Z Magazine* November 1993; Diamond, "The Christian Right Seeks Dominion: On the Road to Political Power and Theocracy," in Chip Berlet, ed., *Eyes Right! Challenging the Right Wing Backlash*, (Boston: South End Press, 1995), pp. 44–49.
- <sup>140</sup> Catherine McNicol Stock, *Rural Radicals: Righteous Rage in the American Grain*, (Ithaca, NY: Cornell University Press, 1996), pp. 15–86.
- <sup>141</sup> Gary Allen, *None Dare Call it Conspiracy*, p. 125.
- <sup>142</sup> Gary Allen, *Rockefeller: Campaigning for the New World Order*, pamphlet from an article in the JBS magazine, *American Opinion*, February 1974; a similar theme was promoted by the Lyndon LaRouche network, see: King, *Lyndon LaRouche*, pp. 38–40, 125.
- <sup>143</sup> Amy Elizabeth Ansell, *New Right, New Racism: Race and Reaction in the United States and Britain*, (New York: NYU Press, 1997), pp. 49–73; Anna Marie Smith, *New Right Discourse on Race & Sexuality*, (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1994), pp. 18–70.
- <sup>144</sup> People can be straight, gay, lesbian, transgender, or bisexual—this is descriptive rather than an ethnic reference; but when referring to an ethnic identity, movement, or specific organization, I will refer to the Gay and Lesbian Rights movement, the Lesbian Avengers group, and the Digital Queers group.
- <sup>145</sup> See for example Allen, *None Dare Call it Conspiracy*, p. 125.
- <sup>146</sup> Bennett, *The Party of Fear*, pp. 48–182; John Higham, *Strangers in the Land: Patterns of American Nativism 1860–1925* (New York: Atheneum, 1972); Diamond, *Roads to Dominion*, pp. 140–160.
- <sup>147</sup> Billig, *Fascists*, p. 296.
- <sup>148</sup> Frank P. Mintz, *The Liberty Lobby and the American Right: Race, Conspiracy and Culture*, (Westport, CT: Greenwood Press, 1985); note that there is much on the John Birch Society in this book.
- <sup>149</sup> For more on the JBS, see: William V. Moore, *The John Birch Society: A Southern Profile*, paper, Southern Political Science Association, 1981; J. Allen Broyles, *The John Birch Society: Anatomy of a Protest*, (Boston: Beacon Press, 1964); Diamond, *Roads*, pp. 52–59, 140–141, 147–148; Gene Grove, *Inside the John Birch Society*, (Greenwich, CT: Fawcett, 1961).
- <sup>150</sup> Mary Rupert, "The Patriot Movement and the Roots of Fascism," in Susan Allen Nan, et. Al. eds., *Windows to Conflict Analysis and Resolution: Framing our Field*, (Fairfax, VA: Institute for Conflict Analysis and Resolution, 1997); Peter Fritzsche, *Rehearsals for Fascism: Populism and Political Mobilization in Weimar Germany*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1990), pp. 149–150.
- <sup>151</sup> This paragraph reflects the ideas of Matthew N. Lyons in working papers for *Too Close for Comfort*. For a related argument regarding Britain, see Michael Billig, "Rhetoric of the Conspiracy Theory: Arguments in National Front Propaganda," *Patterns of Prejudice*, 22:2, 1988.
- <sup>152</sup> Tarso Luís Ramos, "Feint to the Left: The Growing Popularity of Populism," *Portland Alliance*, (Oregon), Dec. 1991, pp. 13, 18. See also Chip Berlet, *Right Woos Left: Populist Party, LaRouchian, and Other Neo-fascist Overtures to Progressives and Why They Must Be Rejected*, report, revised, (Cambridge, MA: Political Research Associates, revised, 1994 {1991}); \_\_\_\_\_, "Friendly Fascists," *The Progressive*, June 1992; and, \_\_\_\_\_, "Big Stories, Spooky Sources," *Columbia Journalism Review*, May/June 1993.
- <sup>153</sup> Biehl, "Militia Fever;" Matthew Kalman and John Murray, "The Icke Man Cometh," *New Moon*, November 1995.
- <sup>154</sup> See, generally, Daniel Pipes, *The Hidden Hand: Middle East Fears of Conspiracy*, (New York: St. Martins, 1998); Patricia A. Turner, *I Heard it Through the Grapevine, Rumor in African-American Culture*, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1993); Berlet, *Right Woos Left*.
- <sup>155</sup> Howard Goldenthal, "Khadafy Connections," *Now* (Toronto), 7/4/91, p. 14.
- <sup>156</sup> Jonathan Mozzochi and L. Events Rhinegard, *Rambo, Gnomes and the New World Order: The Emerging Politics of Populism*, (Portland, OR: Coalition for Human Dignity, 1991).
- <sup>157</sup> For a critique of conspiracist anti-globalism, see Mark Rupert, "Globalization and the Reconstruction of Common Sense in the US," in S. Gill and J. Mittelman, eds., *Innovation and Transformation in International Studies*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997).
- <sup>158</sup> Diamond, *Roads*, pp. 127–131, 179–180. On fusionism, see Himmelstein, *To The Right*, pp. 43–60. His discussion of the practical problems of uniting the three strands into a conservative movement is especially useful and perceptive.
- <sup>159</sup> Chip Berlet and Margaret Quigley, "Theocracy & White Supremacy: Behind the Culture War to Restore Traditional Values," in Berlet, *Eyes Right*, pp.15–43.
- <sup>160</sup> Laura Elizabeth Saponara, *Ideology at Work: Deciphering the Appeal of New Right Discourse*, Master of Arts Thesis, University of Texas at Austin, 1997, p. 27.
- <sup>161</sup> See generally, Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare*.
- <sup>162</sup> William H. Marshner and Enrique T. Rueda, *The Morality of Political Action: Biblical Foundations*, (Washington, DC: the Free Congress Research and Education Foundation, 1983), pp. 35–48.

- <sup>163</sup> ISRP web page, URL: <<http://www.isrp.org/welcome.html>>, 10/6/98.
- <sup>164</sup> Revelation, 20–22. Whether Christ returns at the beginning or the end of this thousand year period is disputed among pre-millennialists and post-millennialists. Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 6–7; Marsden, *Understanding Fundamentalism and Evangelicalism*, pp. 40, 112–114; Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare*, pp. 130–138, 240; Michael Barkun, *Religion and the Racist Right: The Origins of the Christian Identity Movement*, (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 1994), p. 75–79, 104–105, 213.
- <sup>165</sup> Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More*, pp. 80–112.
- <sup>166</sup> Marsden, *Understanding Fundamentalism and Evangelicalism*, pp. 60, 147, 163; Martin, *With God on Our Side*, pp. 14–15.
- <sup>167</sup> For general background, see Himmelstein, *To The Right*, Diamond, *Roads to Dominion*; Martin, *With God on Our Side*.
- <sup>168</sup> Fred Clarkson, *Eternal Hostility*, pp. 77–123.
- <sup>169</sup> Some analysts use the term “dominionism” solely to refer to forms of Reconstructionism, but others use it as I do here, in the broader sense of exclusionary Christian nationalism.
- <sup>170</sup> Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More*, 254–290.
- <sup>171</sup> Joel Kovel, *Red Hunting in the Promised Land: Anticommunism and the Making of America*, (New York, Basic Books, 1994); Didi Herman, *The Antigay Agenda: Orthodox Vision and the Christian Right*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1997), pp. 19–24, 35–44, 125–128, 170–172.
- <sup>172</sup> Johnson, *Architects of Fear*, pp. 169–173; Diamond, *Spiritual Warfare*, pp. 84–87, 233; Berlet and Quigley, “Theocracy & White Supremacy,” in Berlet, *Eyes Right!*, pp. 32–33.
- <sup>173</sup> George M. Marsden, *Understanding Fundamentalism and Evangelicalism*, pp. 109. See also: Diamond, *Roads*, pp. 246–248; William Martin, *With God on Our Side: The Rise of the Religious Right in America*, (New York: Broadway Books, 1996), pp. 194–198, 331–333, 344–347, ); Thompson, *The End Of Time*, pp. 310–312.
- <sup>174</sup> Stormer, *None Dare Call It Treason*; Stormer, *None Dare Call It Treason...25 Years Later*, paperback, (Flourissant, MO: Liberty Bell Press, 1992 {hardcover, 1990}).
- <sup>175</sup> Martin, *With God on Our Side*, pp. 194–197; Dallas A. Blanchard, *The Anti-Abortion Movement and the Rise of the Religious Right*, (New York: Twayne Publishers, 1994), p. 97; Susan Harding, “Imagining the Last Days: The Politics of Apocalyptic Language;” For examples of Christian antagonism toward secular humanism, see Francis A. Schaeffer, *A Christian Manifesto*, revised, (Westchester, IL: Crossway Books, 1982 [1981]), pp. 117–130; Franky Schaeffer, *A Time for Anger: The Myth of Neutrality*, (Westchester, IL: Crossway Books, 1982), pp. 15–25, 76–78; John W. Whitehead, *The Stealing of America*, (Westchester, IL: Crossway Books, 1987), pp. 31–59; Tim LaHaye, *The Battle for the Mind*, (Old Tappan, NJ: Fleming H. Revell, 1980), pp. 141–179.
- <sup>176</sup> *Christian Anti-Communism Crusade*, newsletter, April 1, 1998, p. 2.
- <sup>177</sup> David A. Noebel, *Understanding the Times: The Story of the Biblical Christian, Marxist/Leninist and Secular Humanist Worldviews*, (Manitou Springs, CO: Summit Ministries Press, 1992).
- <sup>178</sup> The author purchased curricular materials during a tour of Summit Ministries in 1997. On file at PRA.
- <sup>179</sup> Documentation, including correspondence between Welch, his aide, and a donor outlining the procedure, at PRA in file: “John Birch Society, Nonprofit Funding Conduits.”
- <sup>180</sup> Pat Robertson, *The New World Order*, 1992, p. 36.
- <sup>181</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 261–62.
- <sup>182</sup> Michael Lind, “On Pat Robertson: His Defenders”, *The New York Review of Books*, April 20, 1995, pp. 67–68; and accompanying article: Jacob Heilbrunn, “On Pat Robertson: His Anti-Semitic Sources”, pp. 68–71.
- <sup>183</sup> See generally Camp, *Selling Fear*.
- <sup>184</sup> “Armageddon Books,” Cliffside Publishing House, General Catalog, Fall/Winter 1996; <<http://www.armageddonbooks.com>>, 11/13/98.
- <sup>185</sup> For an interesting discussion of this trend, see: Joel Schalit and Charlie Bertsch “Millennial Revelations: Religious Extremism and the Preparations For a Secular Apocalypse,” *Deolog*, Feb. 1997, online, <<http://www.stealth.net/~deolog/SchalitBertsch297.html>>. A fascinating development is the post-rapture ministry, which creates evangelical outreach materials to be “left behind” after the authors are raptured up into heaven; see: Peter and Paul Lalonde’s work including the popular video, “Apocalypse: Caught in the Eye of the Storm;” <<http://www.jvim.com/catalog/apocal.html>>; and the website articles, “Oops, I Guess I Wasn’t Ready;” <<http://www.novia.net/~todd/rap49.html>>; and Kurt Seland, “The Post Rapture Survival Guide,” <<http://www.novia.net/~todd/rap34.html>>.
- <sup>186</sup> Hal Lindsey, with C. C. Carlson, *The Late Great Planet Earth*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Publishing House, 1970).
- <sup>187</sup> See the analysis of Lindsey in O’Leary, *Arguing the Apocalypse*, pp. 134–171.
- <sup>188</sup> Billy Graham, *Approaching Hoofbeats: The Four Horsemen of the Apocalypse*, (Minneapolis, MN: Grason, 1983), pp. 222–224.
- <sup>189</sup> Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More*, pp. 148–149, 327; referencing John F. Walvoord, *Armageddon, Oil And The Middle East Crisis. What The Bible Says About The Future Of The Middle East And The End Of Western Civilization*. (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan Publishing House, 1990 {1974}).
- <sup>190</sup> Johnson, *Architects of Fear*, pp. 28–29; F. H. Knelman, *Reagan, God and the Bomb*, (Buffalo, NY: Prometheus Books, 1985); pp. 175–190; Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More*, p. 162.
- <sup>191</sup> Grace Halsell, *Prophecy and Politics: Militant Evangelists on the Road to Nuclear War*, (Wesport, CT: Lawrence Hill, 1986). For a Christian manual on how to survive the nuclear Armageddon through bomb shelters, see: Arthur Robinson & Gary North, *Fighting Chance: Ten Feet to Survival*, (Cave

- Junction, OR: Oregon Institute of Science and Medicine, 1986).
- <sup>192</sup> Ruth W. Mouly, *The Religious Right and Israel: The Politics of Armageddon*, (Chicago: Midwest Research [now Political Research Associates], 1987).
- <sup>193</sup> Lamy, *Millennium Rage*, p. 155. See also: Boyer, *When Time Shall Be No More*, pp. 327–331.
- <sup>194</sup> Sara Diamond, “Political Millennialism within the Evangelical Subculture,” in Charles B. Strozier and Michael Flynn, *The Year 2000: Essays on the End*, (New York: NYU Press, 1997), p. 210.
- <sup>195</sup> Paul Boyer, lecture and seminar, Boston University, 11/12/98–11/13/98.
- <sup>196</sup> Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, p. 5. There are still some Protestant apocalyptics that see the Vatican as controlled by the Devil, see: “Conclusive Proof From The Bible That The Pope Is The Antichrist,” <<http://www.pacinst.com/antichri.htm>>.
- <sup>197</sup> “700 Club,” 7/23/98 and 12/27/94, author’s notes made while watching programs.
- <sup>198</sup> Cover story and series of articles on Y2K from a Christian perspective by Joel Belz, Roy Manard, Chris Stamper, and Lynn Vincent, in *World* (God’s World Publications), 8/22/98. See also: “Y2K: Playing the Millennium Card,” *Culture Watch*, The DataCenter, Sept. 1998, for a very useful roundup of the topic.
- <sup>199</sup> Author attended the workshop; speakers were Michael Hyatt, author of *The Millennium Bug: How to Survive the Coming Chaos* and the *Day the World Shut Down*, and prominent Louisiana Republican Dr. Billy McCormack of the University Baptist Church. Jerry Falwell, Pat Robertson, Larry Burkett, Jack Van Impe, and many other Christian evangelical leaders have added apocalyptic fuel to the Y2K furnace; see: Falwell’s video, “Y2K: A Christian’s Guide to the Millennium Bug.” online, <[http://www.otgh.org/otgh\\_site/offers/y2k.html](http://www.otgh.org/otgh_site/offers/y2k.html)>. See also: the site maintained by the Inspiration Network, <<http://www.insp.org/y2k/>>.
- <sup>200</sup> See Gary North’s web page, URL: <<http://www.garynorth.com/y2k/index.htm>> (9/16/98). North’s apocalyptic predictions about Y2K and the need for survivalist-style preparations echoes his previous stance on surviving nuclear war during the Reagan years: Robinson & North, *Fighting Chance*.
- <sup>201</sup> Dennis Behreandt, “Millennium Mayhem,” *The New American*, 9/14/98, p. 14; for coverage of hard right fears about Y2K see “Y2Kaos,” *Intelligence Report.*, Southern Poverty Law Center, Fall 1998 (#92); and Berlet, Y2K and Millennial Pinball: How Y2K Shapes Survivalism in the US Christian Right, Patriot and Armed Militia Movements, and Far Right,” paper, Center for Millennial Studies at Boston University, 1998.
- <sup>202</sup> Dave Hunt, *Global Peace and the Rise of Antichrist*; (Eugene, OR: Harvest House, 1990); Peter LaLonde, *One World Under Antichrist: Globalism, Seducing Spirits and Secrets of the New World Order*; (Eugene, OR: Harvest House, 1991); William T. James, ed., *Foreshocks of Antichrist*; (Eugene, OR: Harvest House, 1997); Arno Froese, *How Democracy Will Elect the Antichrist: The Ultimate Denial of Freedom, Liberty and Justice According to the Bible*, (West Columbia, SC: Olive Press, 1997).
- <sup>203</sup> *Catholic Study Bible*, commentary on Revelation, p. 399.
- <sup>204</sup> Vicki Frierson and Ruthanne Garlock, *Christian Be Watchful: Hidden Dangers in the New Coalition of Feminism, Humanism, Socialism, Lesbianism*, pamphlet, (Dallas: Texas Eagle Forum, 1978); on file at PRA.
- <sup>205</sup> Quinby, symposium presentation, “The Millennial Cusp: Western Cultures at 1000, 1500, 2000 and Beyond,” sponsored by the Center for Millennial Studies, Boston, October 12, 1996. In the classic sci-fi film *Five Million Years to Earth* an ancient Martian space ship is unearthed at the aptly-named Hobbes End Underground station in London. When its passenger comes to life it appears as the Devil, complete with little horns. A women falls under its spell, and using superhuman powers supplied by the Devil, attempts to stop the male heroes planning to block the fiery apocalypse using logic and science.
- <sup>206</sup> “Vision 2000: Frequent Questions,” Official PK Web Site, URL: <[promisekeepers.org/2000faq.htm](http://promisekeepers.org/2000faq.htm)>, 7/17/98.
- <sup>207</sup> Ferrini Productions, “10.4.97 Promise Keepers,” video, (Boston: Center for Millennial Studies, 1997); interviews by author at Promise Keepers Mall rally.
- <sup>208</sup> Steven L. Gardiner, “Promises to Keep: the Christian Right Men’s Movement,” *Dignity Report*, 3:4, Fall, 1996; Linda Kintz, *Between Jesus and the Market: The Emotions that Matter in Right-Wing America*, (Durham, NC: Duke University Press, 1997), pp. 111–139; Connie Anderson, *Visions of Involved Fatherhood: Pro-Feminists and “Promise Keepers,”* paper, ASA, Toronto, 1977, Family & Kinship Session (#113); ASA 1998 roundtable on Promise Keepers, with papers presented by Mary Stricker; Amy Schindler and Jennifer Carrol Lena; R. Lorraine Bernotsky and Joan M. Bernotsky, with discussion leader Jennifer Reich
- <sup>209</sup> Interview with Promise Keepers leader Randy Phillips on “Late Edition,” CNN, 10/5/97; 10 am ET, from transcript, p. 9.
- <sup>210</sup> Lee Quinby, “Coercive Purity: The Dangerous Promise of Apocalyptic Masculinity,” in Charles B. Strozier and Michael Flynn, *The Year 2000: Essays on the End*, (New York: NYU Press, 1997), pp. 154–156; note, however, that conservative evangelical women can find spheres of influence and agency within the constraints of submission, see Brenda E. Brasher, *Fundamentalism and Female Power*, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1998).
- Christian Right demonization of gays and lesbians in the same style as anti-communism and anti-Semitism is described in Didi Herman, *The Antigay Agenda*. See also: Jean Hardisty “Constructing Homophobia,” in Berlet, *Eyes Right!*, pp. 86–104; Arlene Stein, “When the Culture War Comes to Town: An Ethnography of Contested Sexuality in Rural Oregon,” paper, ASA 98; and “Whose Memories? Whose Victimhood? Contests for the Holocaust Frame in Recent Social Movement Discourse,” *Sociological Perspectives*, Vol. 41, No. 3, 1998, pp. 519–540; Surina Khan, *Calculated Compassion: How the Ex-Gay Movement Serves the Right’s Attack on Democracy*, (Somerville, MA: Political Research Associates, 1998).

- 211 Diamond, "Political Millennialism," in Strozier and Flynn, *The Year 2000*, pp., 206–210.
- 212 Richard K. Fenn, *The End of Time: Religion, Ritual, and the Forging of the Soul*, (Cleveland, Pilgrim Press, 1997), pp. 127–149.
- 213 Find charges and response at URL: <<http://www.saintsalive.com/mormonism/nccj.htm>>.
- 214 Church on the Web, Video List, URL: <http://www.churchontheweb.com/bookshop/paganinvasion/8.html>.
- 215 Patrick Matrisciana, ed., *The Clinton Chronicles*, fourth edition, (Hemet, CA: Jeremiah Books, 1994). See also: the related *Clinton Chronicles* video.
- 216 Texe Marrs, *Big Sister Is Watching You: Hillary Clinton And The White House Feminists Who Now Control America—And Tell The President What To Do*, (Austin, TX: Living Truth Publishers, 1993.)
- 217 An exceptional and detailed survey of Catholic apocalypticism can be found in Michael W. Cuneo, *The Smoke of Satan, Conservative and Traditionalist Dissent in Contemporary American Catholicism*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997). See also: Thompson, *The End Of Time*, pp.175–190. Useful overviews of key right–wing Catholic groups are in Steve Askin, *A New Rite: Conservative Catholic Organizations and Their Allies*, (Washington, DC: Catholics for Free Choice, 1994).
- 218 *The Fatima Crusader*, Summer 1992, p. 2.
- 219 Charles Martel, "Why Sr. Lucia Went Public," *Fatima Family Messenger*, April–June 1992, pp. 2–4, 44–48.
- 220 Cuneo, *The Smoke of Satan*, pp. 44–46, 172.
- 221 *Ibid.*, pp. 154–177.
- 222 Victor Balaban, "The Virgin and the Millennium: Marian Sightings in the United States," lecture, Center for Millennial Studies and Boston University School of Theology, 1/20/98.
- 223 Charles Martel, "The Antichrist," *The Fatima Crusader*, Summer 1994, pp. 6–9.
- 224 *Ibid.* p. 9.
- 225 "Father Coughlin, a great apostle of social justice who courageously denounced the bankers' debt–money system," *The Michael Journal*, May–June 1995, p. 10; and various undated *Michael Journal* reprints handed out in the Boston area from 1995–1998, on file at PRA; see Denis Fahey's pamphlet, *The Rulers of Russia*, reprinted in 1940 by Coughlin's Social Justice Publishing, in which Fahey claims a "Judaeo–Bolshevist" influence over both capitalism and communism.
- 226 William T. Still, *New World Order*, (Lafayette, LA: Huntington House, 1990).
- 227 *Ibid.*, Introduction.
- 228 *Ibid.*, back cover.
- 229 *Ibid.*, pp. 140–141, 148–149.
- 230 *Ibid.*, back cover.
- 231 Cheri Seymour, *Committee of the States: Inside the Radical Right*, (Mariposa, CA: Camden Place Communications, 1991).
- 232 James Corcoran, *Bitter Harvest: The Birth of Paramilitary Terrorism in the Heartland*, (New York: Viking Penguin, 1995 [1990]).
- 233 Mark Rupert, Globalization and the Reconstruction of Common Sense in the US, in S. Gill and J. Mittelman, eds., *Innovation and Transformation in International Studies*, (Cambridge, Cambridge University Press, 1997). See also Rupert's marvelous Web page, "A Virtual Guided Tour of Far Right Anti–Globalist Ideology," URL: <<http://www.maxwell.syr.edu/maxpages/faculty/merupert/far-right>> An important study of socio–economic factors is Deborah Kaplan, "Republic of Rage: A Look Inside the Patriot Movement," paper, ASA 98.
- 234 Kenneth S. Stern, *A Force Upon the Plain: The American Militia Movement and the Politics of Hate*, (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1996); Lamy, *Millennium Rage*.
- 235 Chip Berlet & Matthew N. Lyons, "Militia Nation," *The Progressive*, June 1995, pp. 22–25; Scott McLemee, "Public Enemy," *In These Times*, May 15, 1995, pp. 14–19; Chip Berlet, "The Violence of Right–Wing Populism," *Peace Review*, 7:3/4 (1995: Journals Oxford, Ltd.), 283–288.
- 236 Jason Vest, "The Spooky World of Linda Thompson," *Washington Post*, May 11, 1995, pp. D1, D8–D9.
- 237 Not all survivalists are part of white supremacist or anti–Semitic movements, but many are.
- 238 Jess Walter, *Every Knee Shall Bow: The Truth and Tragedy of Ruby Ridge and the Randy Weaver Family*, (New York: Regan Books, 1995), pp. 64–87.
- 239 Robert K. Spear, *Surviving Global Slavery: Living Under the New World Order*, (Leavenworth, KS: Universal Force Dynamics, 1992); Spear, *Creating Covenant Communities*, (Leavenworth, KS: Universal Force Dynamics, 1993).
- 240 James D. Tabor and Eugene V. Gallagher, *Why Waco? Cults and the Battle for Religious Freedom in America*, (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995); Dick J. Reavis, *The Ashes of Waco: An Investigation*, (New York: Simon & Schuster, 1995); Kenneth Samples, Erwin de Castro, Richard Abanes, & Robert Lyle, *Prophets of the Apocalypse: David Koresh & Other American Messiahs*, (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 1994).
- 241 Quinby, *Anti–Apocalypse*, pp. 155–162; ); Thompson, *The End Of Time*, pp. 278–321; Mark S. Hamm, *Apocalypse in Oklahoma: Waco and Ruby Ridge Revenged*, (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1997);
- 242 Devin Burghart and Robert Crawford, *Guns and Gavels: Common Law Courts, Militias & White Supremacy*, (Portland, OR: Coalition for Human Dignity, 1996).
- 243 Ted Daniels, "Another Standoff: The Montana Freeman," *Millennial Prophecy Report*, April 1996, p. 1–4; Mark Pitcavage, "Every Man a King: The Rise and Fall of the Montana Freeman, The Militia Watchdog website, May 1996.
- 244 Letter from JBS American Opinion Book Services, in promotional catalog of anti–UN materials, August 1998, on file at PRA.
- 245 Robert Unruh, Authorities Speculate Fugitives May Have Slipped Away–Again," *Associated Press*, 6/5/98; "Authorities Tracking Two People They Believe Could Be Fugitives," *Associated Press*, 7/10/98; David Foster, "Vast Manhunt Comes up Empty," *Associated Press*, 8/8/98; Greg Burton, "Cop Killing: A Meeting of Radicalism, Religion," *Salt Lake*

- City Tribune*, June 21, 1998, online, <<http://www.sltrib.com/1998/jun/06211998/utah/39732.htm>>.
- <sup>246</sup> Mary Rupert, “The Patriot Movement and the Roots of Fascism,” in Susan Allen Nan, et. al. eds., *Windows to Conflict Analysis and Resolution: Framing our Field*, (Fairfax, VA: Institute for Conflict Analysis and Resolution, 1997), p. 96.
- <sup>247</sup> James A. Aho, *The Politics of Righteousness: Idaho Christian Patriotism*, (Seattle: Univ. of Washington Press, 1990). Stern, in footnote 4 of “Militias and the Religious Right,” puts it this way:
- Some commentators do not distinguish between Christian Identity and Christian Patriotism because, on the American far right, most who are Identity adherents are also Christian Patriots.*
- But it is important to distinguish the two. Identity comes from a 19th century belief called “British Israelism.” One can be an Identity adherent in Australia, Canada, et cetera. Christian Patriots, on the other hand, only exist in America, and one can be a Christian Patriot without subscribing to Identity religion. For example, James Nichols, brother of accused Oklahoma City–bomber Terry Nichols, is a Christian Patriot who flirted with, but was talked out of, Identity theology by a Methodist friend.*
- <sup>248</sup> Patrick Minges, “Apocalypse Now! The Realized Eschatology of the ‘Christian Identity’ Movement, paper, American Academy of Religion Conference, 1994; Susan DeCamp, “Locking the Doors to the Kingdom: An Examination of Religion in Extremist Organizing and Public Policy,” in Eric Ward, ed., *American Armageddon: Religion, Revolution and the Right*, (Seattle, Northwest Coalition Against Malicious Harassment [Peanut Butter Publishing], 1998).
- <sup>249</sup> Barkun, *Religion and the Racist Right*, pp. 47–49, 60–70, 106–107, 116–118, 205.
- <sup>250</sup> Christian Identity is inherently a racialized religious philosophy, but the degree of white supremacy and anti-Semitism can vary depending on the views of each autonomous local group. Here we use Identity to refer to the highly bigoted neonazi form of Christian Identity. See Leonard Zeskind, *The “Christian Identity” Movement*, (Atlanta, GA: Center for Democratic Renewal/Division of Church and Society, National Council of Churches, 1987). For early examples of how British Israelism came to America, see: J. H. Allen, *Judah’s Sceptre and Joseph’s Birthright*, fifteenth edition, (Haverhill, MA: Destiny Publishers, 1917 {1902}); and W. G. Mackendrick (The Roadbuilder), *The Destiny of Britain and America*, new revised edition, (Toronto: McClelland & Stewart, 1922).
- <sup>251</sup> Minges, “Apocalypse Now!”
- <sup>252</sup> All major Christian religious institutions denounce Christian Identity.
- <sup>253</sup> Nord Davis, Jr., *Desert Shield and the New World Order*, Northpoint Tactical Teams, 1990, appearing as the September–October 1990 issue of *On Target*, the Northpoint Team Report.
- <sup>254</sup> *The Militia News*, (Afton, TN), Christian Civil Liberties Association, 1994, p.1.
- <sup>255</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 2.
- <sup>256</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 3.
- <sup>257</sup> Thomas Halpern and Brian Levin, *The Limits of Dissent: The Constitutional Status of Armed Civilian Militias*, (Amherst, MA: Aletheia Press, 1996), pp. 2–4, 42–52; Stern, *A Force Upon the Plain*, pp. 107–118, 135–138; Richard Abanes, *American Militias: Rebellion, Racism & Religion*, (Downers Grove, IL: InterVarsity Press, 1996), pp. 22, 43–71.
- <sup>258</sup> Author’s review of documents admitted into evidence in the Timothy McVeigh and Terry Nichols trials. The author was subpoenaed and questioned as an expert by the defense in the Nichols’ trial but never called to testify. McVeigh adopted neonazi beliefs while Terry Nichols, on the other hand, appears more of a generic constitutionalist. See also Hamm, *Apocalypse in Oklahoma*, and Joel Dyer, *Harvest of Rage: Why Oklahoma City is Only the Beginning*, revised, (New York: Westview, 1998 [1997]).
- <sup>259</sup> Andrew Macdonald, [pseudonym of William Pierce] *The Turner Diaries*, (Washington, DC: National Alliance Books, 1978).
- <sup>260</sup> O’Leary, *Arguing the Apocalypse*; pp. 4–14, 178–179, 218–224; Richard Landes, working papers for the Center for Millennial Studies, on file at PRA.
- <sup>261</sup> Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, pp. 9–10, 191–200.
- <sup>262</sup> Lamy, *Millennium Rage*, p. 265; Thompson, in *The End Of Time*, also ties End Times belief to periods of societal stress, pp. 71–72, 178.
- <sup>263</sup> Peter Worsley, *The Trumpet Shall Sound: A Study of “Cargo” Cults in Melanesia*, second, augmented, edition, (New York: Schocken Books, 1968, pp. xxxix–xliii, 225–243.
- <sup>264</sup> Kaplan, *Radical Religion in America*, p. 171.
- <sup>265</sup> Fuller, *Naming the Antichrist*, p.168.
- <sup>266</sup> Antony C. Sutton & Patrick M. Wood, *Trilaterals Over Washington*, (Scottsdale, AZ: The August Corporation, 1979), find graphic in back coupon section.
- <sup>267</sup> C. Wright Mills, *The Power Elite*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1956. G. William Domhoff, *The Powers That Be: Processes of Ruling Class Domination in America*, (New York: Vintage Books, 1979, [1978]); Domhoff, *Who Rules America Now: A View for the ‘80’s*, (New York: Touchstone/Simon & Schuster, 1986, [1983]); Holly Sklar, ed., *Trilateralism: The Trilateral Commission and Elite Planning for World Management*, (Boston: South End Press, 1980); Sklar, *Reagan, Trilateralism and the Neoliberals: Containment and Intervention in the 1980s*, (Pamphlet No. 4), (Boston: South End Press, 1986); Sklar, *Chaos or Community?*
- <sup>268</sup> Antony C. Sutton, *Wall Street and the Rise of Hitler*, (Seal Beach, CA: ‘76 Press, 1976), pp. 170–171.
- <sup>269</sup> Author’s conversations with Domhoff and Sklar at academic conference panels on power structure research. One presumes Mills would have objected as well.
- <sup>270</sup> Interview with Landes, 1998.
- <sup>271</sup> O’Leary, *Arguing the Apocalypse*; pp. 221–222.
- <sup>272</sup> Leslie Jorgenson, a freelance reporter in Colorado first reported Duran’s tie to militia-oriented talk radio. See her article “AM Armies” in the March/April 1995 issue of *Extra!* where she discusses the Chuck Baker program in detail.

- William E. Clayton, Jr., "Colorado Man Charged with Trying to Kill Clinton," *Houston Chronicle*, 11/18/94, p. 1.
- 273 Chip Berlet, "Armed and Dangerous," *The Boston Globe*, 1/6/95, Op-Ed, p. 23. Chip Berlet, "Clinic Violence, The Religious Right, Scapegoating, Armed Militias, & the Freemason Conspiracy," *The Body Politic*, in two parts, 5:2 February 1995, and 5:3, March 1995.
- 274 Sarah Tippit, "Chilling New Link Suspected Among Anti-Abortion Activists," Reuter News Agency, Transmitted 01/14/95.
- 275 *The New American* is published by the John Birch Society based in Appleton, WI. *The Fatima Crusader* is published by the National Committee for the National Pilgrim Virgin of Canada, and distributed in the US by the Servants of Jesus and Mary Fatima Center in Constable, New York.
- 276 Charles E. Rice, "The Death Penalty Dilemma," *New American*, April 4, 1994, p. 24. Rice, in another publication, suggests considering a Biblical passage interpreted by some as sanctioning death for homosexuality.
- 277 The author was subpoenaed and questioned as an expert by the defense in the Salvi trial but never called to testify. The discussion is based on conversations with professionals with a direct knowledge of Salvi's mental health status.
- 278 Jacob Weisberg, "Playing with Fire," *New York* magazine, May 8, 1995, pp. 30-35.
- 279 Fenn, *The End of Time*, p. 224.
- 280 *Ibid.*, pp. 196-227; for a discussion of how this dynamic can enforce oppressive race and gender hierarchies, see Abby L. Ferber, *White Man Falling: Race, Gender, and White Supremacy*, (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 1998).
- 281 Discussions with Lauren Langman and Carl Boggs regarding various papers they presented at the American Sociological Association and International Sociological Association meetings in 1997 and 1998.